

STAFF REPORT

CONCERNING APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

Date: July 8, 2018

Application Number: 2018-0703A

Property Location: 801 Park Avenue

Architectural Style/Date/Architect or Builder: Gabled-ell / 1885, remodeled 1919

Property Owner: Kirsten Cornelson

Landmark or District Designation: Chapin Park Local (Ordinance #9574-05) and National Historic District

Rating: Notable

DESCRIPTION OF STRUCTURE/SITE: Two storey irregular plan, documented as a Gabled-ell in the 2005 survey, a Stick Style on 1977 survey card and as a Late Gothic Revival on the 1987 survey card. There are many intersecting gables of the roofline and although each survey card, including the 1932/49 Assessor's card notes asphalt shingles, the gabled roof material is actually asbestos tile. The roofline employs a rake decorated fanciful non-structural barge board with pendills, the wide plain frieze, and brackets. A low hip roof entry porch on the east side has a dentilled frieze board and square fluted supports. Two chimneys punctuate the roofline: a small ancillary chimney at the northeast corner, and a large, centrally-mounted chimney to the rear. There are 1/1 wood double hung windows with wood sill. A gable garage with vertical plank siding is accessible from Manitou.

ALTERATIONS: Although existing roof is asbestos tile, previous documentation (both the 1977 and 1987 sites and structures survey cards, as well as the 1932/49 Assessor's card) indicate that the roof is asphalt. The 1932 Assessor's Card indicates that the house was extensively remodeled in 1919. RME 2014-0520 allowed for the re-roof and re-shingle as well as the repair of the front porch. RME 2018-0703 (a companion to this application) allowed for the removal of the existing roof and its replacement with Landmark Pro Architectural shingles.

APPLICATION ITEMS: "Remove abandoned external chimney."

DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSED PROJECT: Applicant seeks a Certificate of Appropriateness for improvements on the structure:

1. The removal of a degraded external chimney at the north-east corner of the structure. The chimney is visible from the street when looking at the front (Park Avenue) side of the home. Stucco and paint that had encapsulated the chimney has fallen off and exposed the brick beneath. The chimney is non-functional, and was not venting water heater exhaust properly, leading to a build-up of gases in the basement. The water heater is now vented out of the house from a different location.
 - a. The chimney will be removed in its entirety (to the foundation).
 - b. The wood siding, molding, and other external details will be replicated, in-kind to 'cover' the exposed area where the chimney once stood.

SITE VISIT REPORT: N/A

STANDARDS AND GUIDELINES: CHAPIN PARK

General Definitions

(B) PRESERVATION GUIDELINES

(b2) Rehabilitation (ADOPTED)

Maintaining the existing character of the district, and whenever possible returning it to its original condition. Any rehabilitation would not require the removal of all non-original materials but would encourage the removal of all such materials which are incompatible with the defined elements of preservation for the district. **The design of new construction or alteration would not require the duplication of the original design and construction, but should be compatible with existing structures and the district's defined elements of preservation. The use of original materials or construction techniques would be encouraged, but contemporary methods and materials would be acceptable when compatible.**

II. EXISTING STRUCTURES

A. BUILDING MATERIALS

Original exterior building materials in the district include brick, stucco, clapboard, wood shingles, and brick or stone masonry. In some instances, vinyl, composite and aluminum siding have been applied over the original material.

Required

Original exterior building materials shall be retained when possible. Deterioration of wood materials shall be prevented through repair, cleaning and painting. The existing architectural detail around windows, porches, doors and eaves shall be retained or replaced by replicas of the same design when deteriorated beyond repair.

Masonry, including brick and stucco structures, shall be maintained, and properly cleaned only when necessary to halt deterioration or to remove stains and shall be done in a method acceptable for the preservation of the surface: i.e. low-pressure water and soft natural bristle brushes. Brick or masonry mortar joints should be repointed only when there is evidence of moisture problems, or when sufficient mortar is missing to allow water to stand in the mortar joint. Existing mortar shall be duplicated in composition, color, texture, joint size, method of application and joint profile.

When repairing stucco, stucco mixture shall be used. A professional shall make a study of the old stucco, to determine the exact mixture and underlayment used in the original work. Some repair methods are not compatible with the original techniques and may cause early disintegration of the repair work and the original work.

Ample ventilation must be afforded the structure when siding is installed, in order to prevent increased deterioration of the structure from moisture and insects.

Recommended

Whenever possible, the original building materials should be restored. When maintaining or repairing original siding is not feasible, aluminum, vinyl or composite siding may be used. When used over wood surfaces, this siding should be the same size and style as the original wood. Every effort should be made to retain the original trim around windows, doors, cornices gables, eaves and other architectural features.

Property owners should contact the Historic Preservation Commission of South Bend and St. Joseph County prior to initiating any restoration or rehabilitation effort. [Address and contact information is listed in the front of the Guidebook.] The Commission is an invaluable source of information about all facets of rehabilitation and restoration – materials, methods, contractors and the like.

Prohibited

Wood siding shall not be resurfaced with new materials that is inappropriate or was unavailable when the building was constructed, such as artificial stone, brick veneer, asbestos or asphalt shingles.

Sandblasting or the use of harsh detergents shall not be used on masonry including brick, stucco, limestone, flagstone and sandstone. This method of cleaning erodes the surface material and accelerates deterioration.

Repointing shall not be done with a mortar of high Portland cement content which can often create a bond that is stronger than the building material. Usage of Portland cement can cause deterioration as a result of the differing coefficient of expansion and porosity of the historic masonry unit and the mortar. This most often results in serious damage to adjacent brick.

Unpainted masonry surfaces shall not be painted unless they had been painted originally. Paint shall not be removed from masonry surfaces by any means that damage the surface.

Not Recommended

Waterproof or water repellent coatings or surface consolidation treatments should not be used on masonry surfaces unless required to solve a specific problem that has been studied and identified. Coatings are frequently unnecessary and expensive, and can accelerate deterioration of the masonry. Mortar joints, which do not need repointing, should not be repointed. Wood siding should not be power-washed.

B. ROOFS AND ROOFING

Roof shapes in the district encompass all the various designs found in residential structures: hipped, gabled, gambrel, flat and combinations of these. Roofs are covered with a variety of materials such as asphalt, asbestos, wood and slate shingles as well as clay tiles. Residences in most cases have wood fascias with gutters and downspouts. The fascias of some vinyl- and aluminum-sided houses are covered with the same materials.

Required

The existing shape and type of materials of the roof shall be retained. All architectural features, which give the roof its essential character, shall be retained, including dormer windows, cupolas, cornices, brackets, chimneys, cresting and weather vanes.

Recommended

The original shape and materials of the roof should be restored. Particular effort should be made to retain materials such as slate, tile and other unique materials not commonly found in new construction. Roof covering which is deteriorated beyond repair should be replaced with new material that matches as closely as possible the original in composition, size, shape, color and texture. Gutters and downspouts are often a necessary adjunct in order to prevent deterioration of the structure; they should be maintained whenever possible or replaced with a style comparable and suitable to the architectural period.

Prohibited

Nothing shall be done to change the essential character of the roof as viewed from a street by adding architectural features or large unsightly fixtures, or by using materials inappropriate to the style of the house. The roof shall not be stripped of architectural features important to its character.

Not Recommended

Overhanging eaves, soffit, brackets and gables should not be covered or enclosed when adding siding to a building.

In making its determination, the Historic Preservation Commission shall consider three factors: first, the appropriateness of the proposed work to the preservation of the building and district; second, the detriment to the public welfare if the proposed work is permitted even though it is not deemed appropriate; third, the potential hardship that the denial of the Certificate of Appropriateness would cause the applicant.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: While it is unknown if the chimney in question is original to the 1885 construction of the structure, existing documentation indicates that the chimney is, at its youngest, nearly 100 years old, and is therefore arguably one of the character defining features of the roofline.

Staff recommends denial of the project, as the Standards & Guidelines of the Chapin Park Local and National Historic District are explicit that “*all architectural features, which give the roof its essential character, shall be retained, including [...] chimneys [...].*” In lieu of deconstruction and demolition of this feature, staff would recommend that it be rehabilitated.

Staff is, however, aware that the Commission must weigh the “*potential hardship that the denial of the Certificate of Appropriateness would cause the applicant,*” and is understanding that approval may be appropriate under certain circumstances.

Written by
Adam Toering
Historic Preservation Specialist
Approved by
Elicia Feasel
Historic Preservation Administrator

Site Visit – Photos



Figure 1 -- 801 Park from the street, looking west. The subject chimney is visible along at right.



Figure 2 -- Close-up of the chimney at the northeast corner of the structure.



Figure 3 -- 801 Park, looking north from Manitou Place. Main chimney visible at left, while the subject chimney is obscured by the roof line.



HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION OF SOUTH BEND AND ST. JOSEPH COUNTY

County—City Building, South Bend, IN 46601
http://www.southbendin.gov/government/department/community-investment
Phone: 574/235.9371 Fax: 574/235.9021
Email: hpcbsjc@southbendin.gov

Timothy S. Kluscinski, President

A Certified Local Government of the National Park Service

Elicia Feasel, Historic Preservation
Administrator

APPLICATION FOR A — CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

OFFICE USE ONLY >>>>>>> DO NOT COMPLETE ANY ENTRIES CONTAINED IN THIS BOX <<<<<<< OFFICE USE ONLY

Date Received: 7/3/2018 Application Number: 2018 — 0703A

Past Reviews: YES (Date of Last Review) _____ NO

Staff Approval authorized by: Adam Toering Title: H. Preservation Specialist

Historic Preservation Commission Review Date: _____

Local Landmark Local Historic District (Name) Chopin Park

National Landmark National Register District (Name) Chopin Park

Certificate Of Appropriateness: Denied Tabled Sent To Committee Approved and issued: _____

Address of Property for proposed work: 801 Park Ave. South Bend, Ind. 46616
(Street Number—Street Name—City—Zip)

Name of Property Owner(s): Kirsten Cornelson Phone #: 250-3584

Address of Property Owner(s): 801 Park Ave. South Bend, Ind. 46616
(Street Number—Street Name—City—Zip)

Name of Contractor(s): JEFFREY DIERBECK Phone #: (574) 274-9222

Contractor Company Name: DIERBECK AND ASSOCIATES

Address of Contractor Company: 61396 Miami Road South Bend, Ind. 46614
(Street Number—Street Name—City—Zip)

Current Use of Building: SINGLE FAMILY
(Single Family—Multi-Family—Commercial—Government—Industrial—Vacant—etc.)

Type of Building Construction: WOOD FRAME
(Wood Frame—Brick—Stone—Steel—Concrete—Other)

Proposed Work: (more than one box may be checked) Landscape New Replacement (not in-kind) Demolition

Description of Proposed Work: REMOVE EXISTING ROOF AND INSTALL Loomark Pro Architectural REMOVE abandoned External chimney.

Owner e-mail: _____ and/or Contractor e-mail: _____

X _____ and/or X [Signature]
Signature of Owner Signature of Contractor

By signing this application I agree to abide by all local regulations related to project and to obtain a Building Department Permit, if applicable.