

STAFF REPORT

CONCERNING APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

Date: June 5, 2018

Application Number: 2018-0530A

Property Location: 605 Rex Street

Architectural Style/Date/Architect or Builder: Gabled-front / 1899 or 1905

Property Owner: Joan M. Downs

Landmark or District Designation: Chapin Park Local (Ordinance #9574-05) and National Historic District

Rating: Contributing

DESCRIPTION OF STRUCTURE/SITE: The house located at 605 Rex is a gable-front one and a half-story structure with original shingles in the gable and clapboard siding and corner boards. There is a full width screen enclosed porch with wood supports set on brick piers and rail with stone caps. There is wood and chain link fence along the side yard on the west and a stockade fence along the east side.

ALTERATIONS: Original second floor street-facing window (described in the survey card as “very long paired windows in gable”) was replaced sometime after it was photographed in 1987. COA 2008-0903 allowed for the installation of the wooden and chainlink fence around the rear of the property. COA 2011-0607 allowed for roof, soffit, and gutter repair following ice melt damage.

APPLICATION ITEMS: “There is one modern, and inappropriate, window in the gable on the front of the house and we are requesting permission to replace it with a new all wood double-hung window manufactured by Marvin Windows of Wisconsin. The inappropriate window has divided lights and is vinyl clad. The new window will match the size of the opening but will match the composition and formats of the original windows. It will be painted to match the existing paint scheme, something which is not possible with the current modern vinyl window due in part to its artificial divided lights which are buried in the glass.

“The new wood window will also receive a custom-made wooden storm window.”

“There are currently 3 modern coarse handrailings on the house.

- At the front door
- At the kitchen door
- At the back door

“We are requesting permission to switch out the 2 x 4 handrailing for a proper beveled edge railing. In addition, we would like to finish the post with a cap and a simple finial or ball. (see photos)”

DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSED PROJECT: Applicant seeks a Certificate of Appropriateness for improvements on the structure including:

1. Replacement of one vinyl clad window facing the street on the second floor. This window is to be replaced with custom wooden windows manufactured by Marvin replicating the original “very long paired windows” visible in the 1981 survey photos.
2. Removal and reconstruction of three wooden railings and posts.

The third component of the applicant’s original submission called for the construction and installation of custom wooden storm windows. This portion of the application was issued as Routine Maintenance Exclusion #2018-0530B per Resolution #18-01 on June 5th, 2018.

SITE VISIT REPORT: N/A

STANDARDS AND GUIDELINES: CHAPIN PARK

General Definitions

(B) PRESERVATION GUIDELINES

(b2) Rehabilitation (ADOPTED)

Maintaining the existing character of the district, and whenever possible returning it to its original condition. Any rehabilitation would not require the removal of all non-original materials but would encourage the removal of all such materials which are incompatible with the defined elements of preservation for the district. **The design of new construction or alteration would not require the duplication of the original design and construction, but should be compatible with existing structures and the district's defined elements of preservation. The use of original materials or construction techniques would be encouraged, but contemporary methods and materials would be acceptable when compatible.**

II. EXISTING STRUCTURES

C. WINDOWS AND DOORS

Window and door frames are in most cases wood and vary depending upon the style of the home. Many are double-hung windows with wood trim and sills. Brick structures have stone sills and brick lintels. In some cases where aluminum siding has been applied, the window and door trim has been covered. About half of the structures in the district have aluminum storm windows; the other half have wood storm windows.

Required

Original windows and doors shall be retained including sashes, lintels, sills, shutters, decorative glass, pediments, hoods and hardware. When deteriorated beyond repair, they shall be replaced with units and trim resembling the original.

Recommended

Wood storm windows and doors painted or finished to match the original should be used but should not damage existing frames. If new sashes or doors are installed, the existing or original materials, design and hardware should be used. When metal storm doors are used, they should be painted, anodized or coated to match the existing. When awnings are used, they should be of canvas material.

D. ENTRANCES, PORCHES AND STEPS

Most houses in the district have either an open or enclosed porch across the front. Most porches have either hip or gabled roofs or are covered by the main roof of the house.

Required

When deteriorated beyond repair, existing or original porches, stoops, patios and steps, including handrails, balusters, columns, brackets, tiles and roof decorations, shall be retained or replaced by replicas of the same design or by a design more in keeping with the historic period of the structure.

Porches and additions reflecting later architectural styles and which are important to the building's historical integrity shall be retained.

Recommended

When enclosing porches for heat conservation or for other reasons, it should be done in a manner that does not alter the architectural or historical character of the building.

Not Recommended

Original porch details should not be replaced with materials representing a different period or style from the original.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: Staff recommends approval of the project, as it is 1) in keeping with the Standards & Guidelines of the Chapin Park Local and National Historic District, and 2) actively reverting the structure to a condition more in keeping with its original character.

Written by
Adam Toering
Historic Preservation Specialist
Approved by
Elicia Feasel
Historic Preservation Administrator

Site Visit – Photos



Figure 1 – 605 Rex, from the street.

Mount Contact Prints Here

9. Common Name		10. Visible <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No

Figure 2 - Excerpt of the Survey Card showing the original “very long paired” windows.



Figure 3 - South east face. Entrance screened-in porch at left. Railing to be replaced at center.



Figure 4 – East side entrance.



Figure 5 – rear entrance.



Figure 6 – Rear entrance, looking south.



Figure 7 - Proposed railing style as seen at 853 Forest.



HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
OF SOUTH BEND AND ST. JOSEPH COUNTY

County—City Building, South Bend, IN 46601
http://www.southbendin.gov/government/department/community-investment
Phone: 574/235.9371 Fax: 574/235.9021
Email: hpcsbsjc@southbendin.gov

Timothy S. Kluszczinski, President

A Certified Local Government of the National Park Service

Elicia Feasel, Historic Preservation Administrator

APPLICATION FOR A — CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

OFFICE USE ONLY>>>>>DO NOT COMPLETE ANY ENTRIES CONTAINED IN THIS BOX<<<<<*OFFICE USE ONLY*

Date Received: 22 May 18 Application Number: 2018 - 0530A

Past Reviews: YES (Date of Last Review) _____ NO

Staff Approval authorized by: _____ Title: _____

Historic Preservation Commission Review Date: _____

Local Landmark Local Historic District (Name) Chepin Park

National Landmark National Register District (Name) Chepin Park

Certificate Of Appropriateness: Denied Tabled Sent To Committee Approved and issued: _____

Address of Property for proposed work: 605 Rex Street South Bend IN 46616
(Street Number—Street Name—City—Zip)

Name of Property Owner(s): Joan Downs Phone #: 574-383-6346

Address of Property Owner(s): 849 Forest Ave South Bend IN 46616
(Street Number—Street Name—City—Zip)

Name of Contractor(s): Peacock and Company Phone #: 574-289-4992

Contractor Company Name: _____

Address of Contractor Company: 1147 East Mishawaka Ave South Bend IN 46615
(Street Number—Street Name—City—Zip)

Current Use of Building: _____
(Single Family—Multi-Family—Commercial—Government—Industrial—Vacant—etc.)

Type of Building Construction: _____
(Wood Frame—Brick—Stone—Steel—Concrete—Other)

Proposed Work: In-Kind Landscape New Replacement (not in-kind) Demolition
(more than one box may be checked)

Description of Proposed Work: see attached

Owner e-mail: joan.downs29@gmail.com and/or Contractor e-mail: _____

X Joan Downs and/or X _____
Signature of Owner Signature of Contractor

Certificate of Appropriateness

for 605 Rex Street, South Bend

Owner: Joan M. Downs
849 Forest Ave. South Bend, IN 46616

May 17, 2018

Description of Work:

This paperwork is for 605 Rex Street, in South Bend.

Wooden Storm Windows:

We are requesting permission to fabricate all custom-made wooden storm windows for the entire house, except for two of the existing modern windows.

All of the windows are original except for three of them;

- the rear window next to the back door is a modern casement window,
- and the kitchen window is a modern double-hung window.

These two windows will stay as is, and are not visible from the street.

There is one modern, and inappropriate, window in the gable on the front of the house and we are requesting permission to replace it with a new all wood double-hung window manufactured by Marvin Windows of Wisconsin. The inappropriate window has divided lights and is vinyl clad. The new window will match the size of the opening but will match the composition and formats of the original windows. It will be painted to match the existing paint scheme, something which is not possible with the current modern vinyl window due in part to its artificial divided lights which are buried in the glass.

The new wood window will also receive a custom-made wooden storm window.

Handrailings:

There are currently 3 modern coarse handrailings on the house.

- at the front door
- at the kitchen door
- at the back door

We are requesting permission to switch out the 2 x 4 handrailing for a proper beveled edge railing. In addition, we would like to finish the post with a cap and a simple finial or ball.
(see photos)