

STAFF REPORT

CONCERNING APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

Date: August 9, 2018

Application Number: 2018-0727

Property Location: 417 W Navarre Avenue

Architectural Style/Date/Architect or Builder: Queen Anne / 1919

Property Owner: BAC Home Loans Servicing LP

Landmark or District Designation: Chapin Park Local (Ordinance #9574-05) and National Historic District

Rating: *Outstanding*

DESCRIPTION OF STRUCTURE/SITE: Three story Queen Anne (irregular plan) on a brick foundation. Two chimneys punctuate the roof line and have decorative vertical brick string course, polygonal appearance due to central pinching. The wood shingles decorate the exterior as well as the peaks on the second story, with clapboard elsewhere. Considerable decoration is on the west face of the second story. The roof is hipped with gables, barge board on the gables, and has a molded cornice. The south face has an enclosed brick porch with wall and pillars, stone sills, and double-hung sashes. The front entrance was formerly composed of wood double-leaf multi-paned doors with glass in upper quarter. Original screened French doors exist.

ALTERATIONS: Certificate of Appropriateness #2013-1202A allowed for the in-kind replacement of a 32” x 85” wood frame window. COA #2016-0218 allowed for the in-kind repair of rear exterior window stairs and repair wood siding, as well as the trimming of vegetation 18” from the structure. RME #2018-0517A allowed for the replacement of the roof. RME #2018-0725A allowed for the trimming of vegetation away from the fence, deck, and structure. The front door was discarded without COA and replaced with new steel French double doors with 15-lites each.

APPLICATION ITEMS: “All ready performed, installed front door.”

DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSED PROJECT: Applicant seeks a *retroactive* Certificate of Appropriateness for changes on the structure:

1. The replacement of the wood double-leaf multi-paned front doors with a Jeld-Wen Steel Door, “DG Full-Lite w/ Ext Grid WF”, model number JEL-M-2-03808-00001.

SITE VISIT REPORT: N/A

STANDARDS AND GUIDELINES: CHAPIN PARK

C. WINDOWS AND DOORS

Window and door frames are in most cases wood and vary depending upon the style of the home. Many are double-hung windows with wood trim and sills. Brick structures have stone sills and brick lintels. In some cases where aluminum siding has been applied, the window and door trim has been covered. About half of the structures in the district have aluminum storm windows; the other half have wood storm windows.

Required

Original windows and doors shall be retained including sashes, lintels, sills, shutters, decorative glass, pediments, hoods and hardware. When deteriorated beyond repair, they shall be replaced with units and trim resembling the original.

Recommended

Wood storm windows and doors painted or finished to match the original should be used but should not damage existing frames. If new sashes or doors are installed, the existing or original materials, design and hardware should be used. When metal storm doors are used, they should be painted, anodized or coated to match the existing. When awnings are used, they should be of canvas material.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: Staff recommends denial of new steel door and recommends replacement with new wood door to resemble original. If retroactive approval is given, Staff recommends painting door to coincide with existing color scheme of house.

Prepared by
Adam Toering
Historic Preservation Specialist

Recommendation by
Elicia Feasel
Historic Preservation Administrator

Site Visit – Photos



Figure 1 – 417 W Navarre from the street, looking north. The subject door is behind the storm doors.



Figure 2 -- Close-up of the replacement doors on the front porch of the structure.



Figure 3 – Close-up of the manufacturer's label.



Figure 4 - View of the front door on September 26, 2017.

| | |
|-------|-------|
| wood | wood |
| glass | glass |
| wood | wood |
| wood | wood |
| wood | wood |
| wood | wood |
| wood | wood |
| wood | wood |
| wood | wood |
| wood | wood |
| wood | wood |
| wood | wood |

Figure 5 – Staff interpretation of original door (as depicted from above photograph)



HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION OF SOUTH BEND AND ST. JOSEPH COUNTY

County—City Building, South Bend, IN 46601
http://www.southbendin.gov/government/department/community-investment
Phone: 574/235.9371 Fax: 574/235.9021
Email: hpesbsjc@southbendin.gov

A Certified Local Government of the National Park Service

Elicia Feasel, Historic Preservation
Administrator

APPLICATION FOR A — CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

OFFICE USE ONLY>>>>>>>DO NOT COMPLETE ANY ENTRIES CONTAINED IN THIS BOX<<<<<<<OFFICE USE ONLY

Date Received: 7/27/2018 Application Number: 2618 — 0727

Past Reviews: YES (Date of Last Review) 2018-0725A NO

Staff Approval authorized by: _____ Title: _____

Historic Preservation Commission Review Date: 8.20.18

Local Landmark Local Historic District (Name) Chapin Park

National Landmark National Register District (Name) Chapin Park

Certificate Of Appropriateness: Denied Tabled Sent To Committee Approved and issued: _____

Address of Property for proposed work: 417 Navarre South Bend, IN
(Street Number—Street Name—City—Zip)

Name of Property Owner(s): _____ Phone #: _____

Address of Property Owner(s): _____
(Street Number—Street Name—City—Zip)

Name of Contractor(s): Initial Secure (Brandon) Phone #: 1-313-915-5785

Contractor Company Name: Initial Secure

Address of Contractor Company: 33079 Garfield Rd Ste 73 Fraser MI 48026
(Street Number—Street Name—City—Zip)

Current Use of Building: Vacant
(Single Family—Multi-Family—Commercial—Government—Industrial—Vacant—etc.)

Type of Building Construction: _____
(Wood Frame—Brick—Stone—Steel—Concrete—Other)

Proposed Work: (more than one box may be checked) Landscape New Replacement (not in-kind) Demolition

Description of Proposed Work: All ready performed, installed front door

Owner e-mail: _____ and/or Contractor e-mail: _____

X _____ and/or X [Signature]
Signature of Owner Signature of Contractor

By signing this application I agree to abide by all local regulations related to project and to obtain a Building Department Permit, if applicable.

205 18 114

Adam,
Here's the info. of the
applicant that filled
out the COA.

Tim Griffith
1607 Regent St.
Niles, MI 49120
269-479-5155
Fiberglass

not signed
not signed