

2016 Civil City Budget – proposed

Items of Inquiry needing more information:

South Bend Fire Department

- Requests/questions from the September 8, 2015 Personnel and Finance Committee meeting and inquires received thereafter:

1. Slide # 3: “Absorbed cost of Retiree Health Insurance - \$300,000”. In past years, the Fire Pension Secretary made a presentation to the Personnel and Finance Committee. Fire Pension Fund # 701 pp 57-62: In light of the retiree health insurance concern listed on Slide # 3, why was there not a detailed presentation on the Fire pensioners, widows and dependents with similar detailed information as was provided for police addressing the financial concerns which are anticipated?

The detailed Fire Pension information was included in the budget packet and the Fire Pension Secretary was in attendance at the Personnel and Finance Committee meeting on the 8th of September. Captain Ellis also can be available for future budget presentations if requested by the Common Council.

2. Slide # 5: Under 2015 Accomplishments is listed “PSAP Consolidation Efforts”. Set forth a summary of these items, focusing on level and quality of services.

As an agency that relies on the PSAP for call-taking, dispatch, tactical radio operations, and records management, we are one of the primary stakeholders in the development and build out of the PSAP. Numerous members of the SBFDD have been directly involved in the project during all phases to ensure departmental needs have been addressed. Attached is the schedule for this project which includes completed phases of the project and expected completion dates for others (page 6). Each of these phases have included thousands of hours of work by joint committees that have operated within the very tight window of time allotted to meet deadlines to reduce the probability of losing state funding for PSAP operations, design and begin construction of the new building, begin identification of the appropriate software and hardware for the PSAP’s technology needs, and purchase of all of the appropriate equipment.

Additionally, both law enforcement and fire service working groups were established early this year to work on development of policies and protocols for the new center to ensure that it works as a truly consolidated agency providing service to all public safety entities with any and all needs addressed. All agencies in St. Joseph County, to include members of the South Bend Police Department and the South Bend Fire Department, have been involved in these working groups from the beginning and have had input on how these policies and protocols have been developed. The importance

of this work is that the needs and priorities of the individual agencies charged to ensure public safety are addressed by the Consortium as the protocols are being built. These working groups have also put in thousands of hours of work on this project and continue to build the platform with which our public safety entities are provided service. This work will continue through the “go-live” date for the new consolidated center to allow our agencies the ability to provide input on solutions to issues as they become known. As it stands, the Consortium is still providing operations from the future back-up center until the new building is completely done. As Council has been advised, this is a temporary solution to the State mandate to consolidate centers by December 31st, 2014. As the new center is completed and brought on-line, it is expected that operations should be improved as the new systems and protocols are implemented as well as all PSAP personnel being in the same center.

3. Slide # 5 & Slide # 6: Provide details on the “Recruitment Committee” and how it would interact with the two (2) new proposed “ Sr. HR Generalist position with a Public Safety focus for 2016”and the proposed “Diversity Inclusion Officer”? How does the Recruitment Committee interact with the HR Director & staff currently on this?

The SBFDD Recruitment Committee consists of 10 members of the South Bend Fire Department and are representative of multiple ethnic backgrounds, races, sexes, and representatives range in age from early twenties through the fifties. These individuals also carry and represent different ranks within the Department. The committee attends recruitment events throughout the community such as job fairs, events at local colleges, and cultural events and has been actively conducting these activities since the beginning of 2015. They have created the recruitment webpage on the City website and manage a list of potential applicants which have provided contact information through those events and a link on the webpage. As November 1st will be the beginning of our next application process, the committee’s activities will pick up and continue through the application period. It is anticipated that the new positions with the City will help supplement the efforts of our internal committee and take on some of the administrative responsibilities associated with the HR functions of recruitment. Currently, the Recruitment Committee interacts with the HR Director and staff primarily through development of an electronic application and management of the applicant pool. It is important to keep in mind that potential applicants need to have face to face interaction with firefighters that represent their particular demographic in order for the recruitment program to be effective. Positive interaction between the new HR positions and the SBFDD Recruitment Committee is a must if the expectation truly exists to improve diversity and inclusion on the department. Two reports on recruitment in the Fire Service are attached to this inquiry. The first details general diversity recruitment and was commissioned by the International Association of Firefighters (pages 22-90) and the other describes challenges associated with

recruiting female applicants and was completed by the International Association of Women in the Fire and Emergency Services (pages 7-21). Both reports give recommendations from research conducted on recruitment in the Fire Service.

4. Slide # 5: Annexation: What are the projected costs in 2016 and beyond to “ensure coverage areas can be met within response time goals”? List both capital and non-capital cost projections.

No Fire Department costs related to annexation are included in the proposed budget currently before the council. The bullet point was intended to draw general attention to the need to be cognizant of our response times and ability to service all areas of the city effectively. Projected growth and current geographical conditions would encourage planning for increased coverage needs on both the North and South ends of the city long term. This may involve additional fire stations, additional staffing, or redistribution of current resources – likely some combination of all three. We estimate a new station on existing city property to cost between \$1,750,000 and \$2,000,000. If additional personnel were used to staff this facility the estimated annual cost for salaries and benefits would be \$675,000. Short term needs could be met with apparatus currently in reserve capacity, but in the event a new station was staffed with additional personnel, a new pumper truck servicing that district would be estimated at \$525,000 to \$550,000.

5. Budget page 8: What is the current status of the “Accreditation Process”?

The SBFDD is continuing with the accreditation process. We are currently in the process of completing a city-wide risk analysis and Standards of Cover document which are necessary for the process to be completed. This is a long-term project which will require additional time to complete.

6. Budget page 29: Why are the HazMat “charges for services” income projected to be \$10,000 in 2016 through 2020, when \$24,055 was received in 2014 and the fees were adjusted at the request of the SBFDD thereafter?

Hazmat fees are only collected when there is an actual Hazmat response. The Department uses \$10,000 as a place holder to show that it is reasonable to assume that some fees will be collected in a calendar year for these type of responses. However, it is impossible to determine in advance how many of these responses the Department may make. Additionally it is impossible to determine how much reimbursement a specific response may generate and whether the entity responsible for the spill will pay. There are, on average, perhaps 2 or 3 reimbursable responses in any given year.

7. Budget page 32 and page 33: Why are the Indiana River Rescue “charges for services” income projected to be \$45,000 in 2016 through 2018, when \$65,700 was received in 2013; especially since the school plans to “enhance curriculum and add additional modules...”

Additional classes were added in 2013 due to the amount of river water flow available later in the year. This accounts for the additional revenue in 2013. Typically, the River Rescue School budgets for 2 schools when they can count on having adequate water flow to hold the school, usually late spring or early summer. Some years, such as 2012, there is inadequate water flow to perform the instruction necessary to complete the course late in the summer or early fall. In order to not overstate potential revenue, the IRRS is budgeted for definite income, but in some years, classes are added late in the year dependent on water flow, which will show additional revenue. Incidentally, 2015 is projected to show additional revenue based on an additional class being scheduled early this fall.

8. Budget page 38: Why are EMS Capital “charges for services” proposed to be lower in 2016, and reduced by one-half (1/2) the 2016 amount in 2017-2020? Are all “Medicaid Reimbursement” dollars placed in Fund # 287?

Medicaid reimbursement received in 2015 included a large sum from billed services provided in 2011 and 2012. Between now and 2016, the SBFDD anticipates that we will receive an additional lump sum payment from Medicaid for services provided in 2013 and 2014. Moving forward, assuming the State and Federal agencies which provide these payments are caught up, we anticipate that we will receive these payments annually for the previous year billed, not for multiple years as we’ve received them recently. As a reminder, this reimbursement program was only made available from 2011 onward. Previously, ambulance providers were reimbursed at pennies on the dollar for which we billed Medicaid. As it stands currently, the Indiana Medicaid Governmental Ambulance Payment Adjustment has been placed in Fund 287. All other Medicaid reimbursements are placed in Fund 288.

9. Budget Page 42: Why are the EMS “charges for services” [Fund # 288] proposed in 2016 at \$5,063,012 less than the amended 2015 amended budget of \$5,146,565, and projected to be \$5,000 in 2017 through 2020, when the ambulance fee and related medical fee rates were recently increased in order to keep pace with Medicare rate reimbursement amounts?

EMS Charges for Services are conservatively estimated at \$5,000,000 per year and can fluctuate for a variety of reasons. Beginning in 2012, the SBFDD began aggressively clearing out a backlog of unbilled calls and worked to shorten our billing cycle. These efforts created increased returns through 2013 and into 2014 and we anticipated a leveling off of collections moving forward. As noted in a previous question, calls for service vary and our budget projections are intended to represent realistic estimates based on historical trends. Projections will continue to be refined and the SBFDD appreciates council’s efforts to keep billing rates fair and consistent with reasonable and customary charges levied by similar agencies and jurisdictions.

- How many “auxiliary firefighters” or “special firefighters” authorized under IC 36-8-3-7 does the department have, and what are their duties/responsibilities?

The South Bend Fire Department has no sworn members assigned as “auxiliary” or “special” firefighters as authorized under IC 36-8-3-7.

Requests/questions from the September 8, 2015 Personnel and Finance Committee meeting and inquires received thereafter:

- In light of the EEO reports filed by the City and the City of South Bend having a diverse population of: 26% African-American, 13 % Hispanic & Latino, and 51% Women - what are the 2016 goals as well as the long-term goals in having the SBFD reflect comparable percentages of firefighter sworn personnel?

The 2016 goals are to continue to increase the numbers of minority and female firefighters on the SBFD. Since 2012, 7 of the 23 new firefighters hired have been female or minority. Ultimately, the long-term goal is to have a workforce that is representative of the community it serves.

- It was noted that the SBFD is recruiting individuals 18 years of age and older. Why is the information posted on the website not reflective of that? [See attached SBFD Firefighter “Basic Eligibility Requirements” and SBFD brochure both listing 21 years of age].

The brochure on the City webpage has been updated to reflect the requirement that will go into effect on November 1, 2015. The paper included with this inquiry which lists “Basic Eligibility Requirements” is from the application that was used for the 2012 and earlier application processes. It was modified in 2014 for that process and will be further modified prior to November to reflect our most current requirements. Please keep in mind that the next process has not begun and will not start until November 1st. The eligibility requirements will not be in effect until the process begins on that date.

Item No	Description	Date Due	Done	Comments
NOTICE TO PROCEED		09/03/13	✓	Agreement dated 09/24/13
PHASE 2 SERVICES				
Administrative				
	Approve Interlocal Agreement, Councils	08/12/14	✓	
	Standard Operating Procedures (SOP) Draft	12/31/14	✓	
	Bond for Capital Improvements	12/30/14	✓	

BP-3: Communications Technology RFQ/P (Design Build)				
	Vendor Quals/Proposals Due	09/23/14	✓	Quals/Proposal opening, scoring
	Vendor Pricing Proposals opened	11/03/14	✓	Pricing Opened
	Systems Selection - CAD/RMS, 911, Radio, Furniture	11/18/14	✓	Determination of Best Value
	CAD Agreement Award, NWS	02/03/15	✓	
	Computer Hardware / Network Infrastructure	02/24/15	✓	
	Recorder Agreement Award, DSS	02/24/15	✓	
	911 Agreement Award, AT&T	06/08/15	✓	
	Radio Agreement Award, Motorola - Phase 1	07/13/15	✓	
	Radio Agreement Award, Motorola - Phase 2	04/24/15		ANTICIPATED 10/06/15
	Dispatch Workstations, Primary	09/25/15		
	Communications install - Primary PSAP	11/01/15		
	Communications Training	12/08/15		Tentative 'Go-Live'
	Communications install - Backup PSAP	12/31/15		
	Communications - Final Completion	01/29/16		

BP-1: Backup Communications Center, SBPD				
	Construction Contract Award	09/02/14	✓	
	Substantial Completion, Backup Facility	11/21/14	✓	
	Equipment / Move-in, SBPD	11/14/14	✓	
	Equipment / Move-in, SJCPD	12/02/14	✓	
	Equipment / Move-in, SJCFD	12/16/14	✓	
	Issue letter to 911 Board stating compliance	12/17/14	✓	
	Training and Operation	12/31/14	✓	

Primary PSAP Center, Construction				
Bid Package 2: Rough Grading, Footings, Steel				
	Construction Contract Award - Ftgs to Grade	09/09/14	✓	
	Substantial Completion, Grade, Ftgs, Steel	01/23/15	✓	
Bid Package 4: Final Site Development and Building				
	Construction Contract Award - Building	12/02/14	✓	
	Substantial Completion, Building	09/25/15		
	Furniture Fixtures and Equip (FFE, Admin.)	11/30/15		
	Ribbon Cutting Ceremony	11/17/15		Preliminary, T.B.D.
	Training and Operations	12/08/15		Preliminary 'Go-Live'
	Project Close-out	01/29/16		

A National Report Card on Women in Firefighting



Denise M. Hulett

Legal Aid Society Employment Law Center
San Francisco, CA

Marc Bendick, Jr.

Bendick and Egan Economic Consultant, Inc.
Washington, DC

Sheila Y. Thomas

Law Offices of Sheila Y. Thomas
Oakland, CA

Francine Moccio

Institute for Women and Work
School of Industrial and Labor Relations (ILR)
Cornell University
New York, NY

April 2008

A National Report Card on Women in Firefighting

Denise M. Hulett

Legal Aid Society Employment Law Center
San Francisco, CA

Marc Bendick, Jr. *

Bendick and Egan Economic Consultant, Inc.
Washington, DC

Sheila Y. Thomas

Law Offices of Sheila Y. Thomas
Oakland, CA

Francine Moccio

Institute for Women and Work
School of Industrial and Labor Relations (ILR)
Cornell University
New York, NY

April 2008

*Research presented in this document was supported by the Ford Foundation.
However, the authors alone are responsible for all findings and conclusions.*

* Contact the authors via: Marc Bendick, Jr., Bendick and Egan Economic Consultants, Inc., 4411 Westover Place NW, Washington, DC 20016, (202) 686-0245, bendickegan@mindspring.com, www.bendickegan.com.



April, 2008

Dear IAWFES members, colleagues in the Fire and Emergency Services, supporters, commissioners and department administrators, legislators, union members and advocates:

We are pleased to introduce “A National Report Card on Women in Firefighting.” This long-awaited study, conducted by two civil rights lawyers and two social scientists, is attached.

The study validates decades of anecdotal wisdom about the inclusion, acceptance, training, testing and promotion of women in fire and emergency services. It also points to a future where, barring continued cultural and traditional resistance, women should comprise 17% (up from the current 3.7% national average) of the first responders work force.

This significant report represents the results of confidential written questionnaires returned by 675 male and female firefighters in 48 states, surveys of 114 departments nationwide, in-depth interviews with 175 female firefighters and case studies in Kansas City, Los Angeles, Seattle, Minneapolis and Prince William County, Va.

We believe the study and its recommendations are critical to the future of the fire service and the basis for continuing collaboration between the International Association of Women in the Fire and Emergency Services and other leading fire service organizations.

“Guided by this study, gender inclusion is the new standard to which departments are likely to be held by the courts, the elected officials to whom they report, and the citizens they serve,” says economist Marc Bendick Jr., Ph.D., who co-authored the study.

We salute the study’s authors for their efforts developing such an important study. Its conclusions will strongly support our legal efforts, including court cases throughout the United States, as well as positively influence public opinion.

We urge you to read and circulate the study to help stimulate discussion and formulate solutions on bridging the gap from where women in the fire services are now to where they should be in the future.

Copies of the study and more information can be found at www.i-women.org.

Respectfully,
Co-Presidents
Cheryl Horvath
Laurie Mooney

The voice of women in fire and emergency services

P.O. Box 5446 • Madison, WI 53705 • www.i-women.org • 608/233-4768 • 608/233-4879 fax

As participants in the fire industry, you are no doubt aware that women firefighters are few and far between nationwide, and that litigation has periodically sought to increase their hiring and promotions and stop harassment.¹ This report presents a new research study to assist fire management resolve these inequities in their departments before litigation imposes the inevitably expensive, imperfect solutions.

With support from the Ford Foundation, the two of us who are civil rights lawyers teamed up with two who are social scientists to look comprehensively at women in firefighting today. Our study does not focus on individual departments but instead looks across departments to see what each can learn from the others. It looks not only at single issues, such as hiring or promotions, but also at what these issues have in common.

We sought answers to these questions through multiple kinds of research. We collected confidential questionnaires from 675 male and female firefighters in 48 states. Women respondents were recruited through professional organizations, personal contacts, and word of mouth, and we asked each woman to recruit a male colleague to complete the same questionnaire. We also collected confidential data from 114 departments in 39 states, ranging in size from 103 paid firefighters to more than 3,000, together employing 51,281 paid firefighters. Then we interviewed 175 women firefighters individually or in focus groups. Finally, we conducted week-long case studies, observing operations and interviewing employees and officials in the Kansas City, Los Angeles City, Minneapolis, Prince William County (VA), and Seattle departments.

This paper presents the major lessons we learned.²

New Data Challenges Low Female Numbers

Among the 350,000 paid firefighters in the nation today, the 2000 Census reports that women number

slightly more than 11,000, or 3.7%. This figure places firefighting in the lowest 11 percent of all occupations in terms of women employees. Even more striking is the large number of departments where the number of women is zero or nearly so. Not one paid women firefighter has ever worked in more than half the nation's departments. Among the 291 metropolitan areas in the 2000 Census, 51.2% had no paid women firefighters in the entire metropolitan area, typically including multiple departments. In 2005, departments in jurisdictions as large as Garden Grove, CA, population 165,000, remained entirely male. New York City counts less than one-quarter of one percent women among its uniformed force, and Los Angeles employs 2.5%.

When fire department leaders are challenged about these numbers, they traditionally respond that women do not want and cannot handle the job, so that low numbers are to be expected. Are they right?

To answer this question, we developed a benchmark for expected female representation using the 2000 Census. We computed the percent of women in the nation's labor force of typical firefighter age (20 – 49) and educational background (high school graduate but no college degree), working full-time in one of 184 occupations resembling firefighting in requiring strength, stamina, and dexterity, or involving outdoor, dirty or dangerous work. These comparison occupations include bus mechanics, drywall installers, enlisted military personnel, highway maintenance workers, loggers, professional athletes, refuse collectors, roofers, septic tank servicers, tire builders, and welders. The proportion of women among the employees in these 184 occupations is 17%.

Women account for about 47% of the whole Civilian Labor Force, about three times the 17% rate. So it is clear that a smaller percent of women than men are likely to seek a firefighting career. But this consid-

¹ *Berkman v. City and County of New York* challenged hiring practices in New York City's department in 1985. Other court challenges have been filed against hiring practices in San Francisco, availability of equipment in Kansas City, MO, promotion practices and hostile work environment in Stamford, CT, and promotion practices in Kansas City, MO.

² For more details, our longer report, "Enhancing Women's Inclusion in Firefighting," is available at www.bendickegan.com/publications. Readers may also want to contact the International Association of Women in Fire and Emergency Services (www.i-women.org) and Black Women in the Fire Service (www.iabpff.org/bwfs/bwfs.htm).

eration does not explain the gap between the 17% of women potentially attracted to this career despite its being dirty, dangerous, and demanding, and the 3.7% women employed there today. In 2000, if women nationwide had been employed at the 17% rate, there would have been 39,742 additional women firefighters, or 50,577 total women, quadrupling their actual number of 11,135.

In that year, if women of color had been employed at their expected rate, then 13,552 (34%) of those additional women firefighters would have been women of color (See sidebar: The Double Disadvantage Facing Women of Color).

The current employment of women in selected fire departments confirms the reasonableness of this 17% benchmark. Women now approach, equal, or even exceed 17% of uniformed officers in a number of jurisdictions. According to the International Association of Women in Fire and Emergency Services, large departments with the highest proportion of women include: Minneapolis, MN (17%); Madison, WI (15%); San Francisco, CA (15%); Boulder, CO (14%); and Miami-Dade, FL (13%). Among the 114 departments examined in our own survey, 16% reported having 10% or more women among their uniformed officers, including two departments with more than 17%.

To examine a broader set of jurisdictions, we calculated the average representation of women among firefighters in all 291 large metropolitan areas in the 2000 Census. Among the 29 (10%) with the highest proportion of women firefighters, the average is 14.5%, including such diverse locations as Allentown-Bethlehem-Easton, PA (12.2%); Anchorage, AK (14.1%); Jacksonville, FL (11.2%); Kalamazoo, MI (23.7%); Racine, WI (18.6%); Redding, CA (17.1%); Sarasota, FL (12.3%); Springfield, IL (19.0%); and Tuscaloosa, AL (24.0%).

So, the first finding from our study is the huge underrepresentation of women among firefighters today. Tens of thousands of women likely to be interested in the career and capable of performing it are available, but they are either not getting hired or are leaving. If courts accept this 17% benchmark for expected representation, the vast majority of departments nation-

The Double Disadvantage Facing Women of Color

Encountering opposition based on their race/ethnicity as well as their gender, women of color face are doubly challenged in pursuing firefighting careers. The women themselves often do not distinguish these two problems, describing their race and gender as inextricably intertwined facets of their lives and identities. But our study observed some important ways in which the two problems interact.

Race and ethnicity problems remain unresolved in many departments today. In our firefighter survey, we asked about employee treatment, opportunities for career advancement, and departments' responsiveness to complaints. An average of 29% of survey respondents of color reported encountering problems in these areas. Our analysis of the 2000 Census showed that persons of color (including both genders) are currently employed in firefighting at only 55.5% of their expected rate.

The 2000 Census reports that women of color totaled 2,444 persons in firefighting, 0.8% of all persons in the field, compared to an expected representation of 5.9% -- that is, current representation only 13.6% of expected representation. The comparable figure for white women is 26.0%. Thus, underrepresentation is about double among women of color compared to white women.

In interviews, women of color described the belief that women "are not cut out for firefighting" as the one issue on which white men and men of color find common ground. At the same time, they reported that some of their white women colleagues distance themselves from efforts by men of color to combat racism and improve departmental practices in areas such as promotions. These circumstances leave women of color feeling particularly isolated and inadequately supported by either women's or minority employee organizations.

wide are potentially vulnerable to litigation for falling far short of the benchmark.

Discrimination and Harassment

Too few women among departments' paid uniformed officers is only the start of potential legal issues our

Table 1: Discrimination or Harassment Experienced by Firefighters

Survey Question	% of Women	% of Men
I have experienced different treatment because of my gender	84.7	12.4
I have encountered problems with ill-fitting equipment	79.7	20.9
My dept. has no procedure of which I am aware for addressing discrimination complaints	65.0	42.7
I have seen supervisors' authority challenged because of the supervisor's gender	49.9	21.0
My gender has created barriers to my career advancement	36.5	7.4
Males and females are not treated the same during fire college and/or probation	33.9	17.8
Promotions are not decided upon fairly	33.9	30.6
Staff in my department are treated differently because of their sexual orientation	30.6	14.4
The hiring process in my department does not fairly select and hire applicants	30.3	22.6
I have not received coaching/mentoring from senior people in my department	25.4	20.4
My supervisor does not address complaints concerning gender-related incidents	23.4	5.6
Males and females are not treated the same during applicants' physical ability screening	13.3	10.5
I have experienced incidents because of my gender involving:		
Shunning/isolation	50.8	2.3
Privacy in showers, dormitory, or when changing clothes	46.2	2.8
Verbal harassment	42.9	2.8
Pornography	31.9	1.4
Sexual advances	30.2	0.5
Dormitory accommodations	28.4	2.3
Training denial or differences	24.3	4.1
Other	21.2	5.5
Station assignments	20.4	0.9
Hazing	18.6	1.4
Hostile notes, cartoons, or other written material	18.2	0.9
Mealtime-related difficulties	13.1	0.9
Assault	6.3	0.0
These Incidents continue in the present	30.6	6.0
Average	34.2	18.8

study identified, however. Our surveys and interviews clearly documented that, when women get hired, their experiences almost universally fall well outside legal boundaries for equal opportunity and non-harassment.

Table 1 presents rates of gender-related discrimination or exclusion reported by respondents to our firefighter survey. Women reported problems at rates ranging

from 79.7% (for ill-fitting equipment) to 6.3% (for assaults) and averaging 34.2% for the 25 problems we asked about. These women's experiences contrasted sharply to their male colleagues, who reported much lower rates of problems on every question. In response to the broadest question — "I have experienced different treatment because of my gender" — a pandemic 84.7% of women agreed, compared to 12.4% of men.

Are women's experiences in firefighting improving over time? We compared the responses of women firefighters 40 and over to their younger counterparts, assuming that the second group's responses reflect more recent years than the first group's. On the topics covered in Table 1, the average rate of reported problems is 6.1 percentage points lower among younger women than their older colleagues — 31.7% versus 37.8%.

On the other hand, responding to the 26th question in Table 1, 34.0% of all women reported that gender-based problems continue into the present. This figure is strikingly similar to the 34.2% average response to the previous 25 questions, asked without specifying a time period.

These data offer little support for calling gender discrimination and harassment problems of the past or rapidly disappearing. Consistent with this slow rate of change, in moving from approximately 0% in 1980 to 3.7% in 2000, the female percent of firefighters has increased less than 0.2 percentage points per year. At that rate, females will not reach 17% of firefighters for another 72 years.

Our study was not intended simply to document problems, however. We were also seeking practical solutions, and we discovered many “best practices” already implemented in selected departments. Here are some of these solutions for six aspects of department operations, starting with recruiting.

Recruiting

How can departments recruit more women among the 17% who are potentially interested in and capable of handling this challenging career?

The first section of Table 2 compares women and men survey respondents in terms of their circumstances prior to their firefighting careers. Four points concerning effective recruitment are suggested by their responses.

First, recruiting initiatives targeting women are perceived as more widespread than they actually are. According to the first line of the table, 69.3% of men believed that their departments made such efforts, but women themselves reported only half that rate. Only

8.8% of women reported being actively recruited, and only 14.2% had encountered recruitment advertising. Low rates of being actively recruited were also reported by our male respondents, suggesting that, without regard to the gender, many departments are not making extensive recruiting efforts, or are doing so ineffectively. Departments seeking to increase female firefighters might start by investing in more, and more effective, recruitment. They should not be deterred by already having more applicants than they can hire, because of the small number of women among current applicants.

Second, personal relationships are very important in recruiting. According to Table 2, 47.5% of female firefighters grew up with a family member or friend who was a firefighter, and 60.5% were introduced to the occupation by such a person. Tellingly, these rates are about the same as for males. Thus, the same person-to-person approaches which are traditional and successful in recruiting men — proverbially, fathers passing down the occupation to their sons — can also work with daughters. In interviews, many women firefighters reported hearing about firefighting opportunities through family members and friends, and some reported being inadvertently recruited when their husbands or brothers were approached. Particularly until a “critical mass” of women become firefighters and start to generate their own referrals, departments seeking to recruit more women should mobilize personal networks of current employees, retirees, and others toward that goal.

Third, men and women typically come to firefighting with different prior experience. According to Table 2, construction and the military are not as likely recruiting arenas for women as for men, while medical employment, active sports, and high schools and community colleges provide more likely recruiting for women than for men. In interviews, women firefighters particularly recalled being recruited at gyms and sports events. To increase female applications, departments can target outreach where recruitment-relevant women are likely to be found.

Fourth, Table 2 reports that women were somewhat less likely than men to have pictured themselves as future firefighters when they were very young. That pattern can be changed by making women firefighter

Table 2: Firefighter Recruitment and Hiring

Operation	Survey Question	% of Women	% of Men
Recruitment	My department recruits and hires women above and beyond its general recruiting efforts	35.6	69.3
	I was actively recruited to become a firefighter	8.8	4.6
	In deciding to become a firefighter, I read about job opening in newspaper or flyer	14.2	12.8
	When growing up, I wanted to be a firefighter	20.9	40.1
	When growing up, I had family members or friends who were firefighters	47.5	48.6
	In deciding to become a firefighter, I was introduced by a family member or friend	60.6	67.4
	At the time I applied, I knew the requirements for the job	68.9	73.4
	Prior to my first paid fire job,		
	I was an EMT, medical technician, nurse, or other medical occupation	46.6	34.4
	I was active in gym/athletic/sports	35.0	15.6
	I had fire fighting experience	11.4	15.6
	I had construction background	5.9	23.8
	I had a fire degree	5.0	8.2
	I had military experience	4.2	18.4
	I am a college graduate	65.2	47.0
Hiring	My department's selection process included a written exam	85.8	87.2
	The written exam accurately measured my ability to perform the job	29.5	33.1
	My department's selection process included an oral board	81.6	85.3
	My department's selection process included a physical abilities test	91.0	89.3
	Of those taking a physical ability test, % who specifically trained to prepare	78.4	55.2
	Of those taking the test, % passed the first time	85.8	97.9
	My department's physical abilities test accurately measured my ability to perform the job	42.8	52.9

increasingly visible as role models, as well as actively suggesting the career to girls and young women. Vocational aspirations of both men and women are strongly influenced by such actions, which expand young persons' sense of what occupations are open to them. However, these processes must start years before individuals apply for jobs. Among survey respondents who reported wanting to be firefighters since they were a child, both males and females first formed that ambition at about age 11.

As they move closer to recruiting age, young women are less likely than young men to acquire firefighting experience prior to seeking career employment, leaving them less aware of this career and less prepared for job-based selection processes. In Table 2, this pattern is reflected in women's lower rates of firefighting

experience and fire science degrees. To increase the representation of women, departments can encourage young women's participation in pre-career activities such as volunteer firefighting, cadet programs for students and scouts, and summer jobs as seasonal forest firefighters. Adult and high school cadet programs are particularly useful in urban areas which lack the volunteer opportunities found in many rural locations.

Testing for Physical Abilities

To perform fire suppression and rescue duties safely and effectively, it is beyond question that firefighters need strength, stamina, and agility. So it was not surprise that, according to Table 2, about 90% of respondents to our firefighter survey reported that their department requires a physical abilities test during

hiring, as did 92.9% of the departments responding to our departmental survey.

Among departments in our survey, the average pass rate for women was 47.3%, about half the 83.9% rate for men. Reducing this “adverse impact” on women could therefore substantially increase female firefighter hiring.

A widely-held stereotype is that women are simply not strong enough to meet the job’s physical requirements, and, consequently, that departments employing women must be endangering public safety by lowering physical standards. This assumption misapplies generalizations about the general population of women to the unusually fit group of women who are typical firefighting applicants. Among recruits to the Milwaukee Fire Department, for example, prior to participating in the department’s training, the average female recruit was in the 85th percentile among women of the same age in physical fitness. Table 2 reports that 35.0% of our women survey respondents were active in gyms or sports before they became firefighters, about double the male rate.

Furthermore, pass rates for both men and women on physical abilities tests are strongly influenced by whether job candidates train prior to being tested. In Milwaukee, where recruits receive 14 weeks’ training prior to the exam, females’ strength increased an average of 21% and fitness by 29%, and by the end of training, the females’ combined size, strength and fitness averaged 96% of their male counterparts’. Among departments responding to our survey, 45.9% provide physical training prior to the test, lasting an average of 5.1 weeks. Departments with pre-training reported a 52.6% pass rate for women, substantially higher than the 34.6% reported by departments not providing training. Accordingly, departments seeking to increase the representation of women typically make physical training an important part of their recruitment and screening process.

One model for doing this involves integrating physical training into the fire academy and placing physical abilities screening late enough in the academy program for the training to have been effective. For example, the Kansas City, MO, department does not administer its test, the CPAT, until job applicants have been in

the academy for 8 weeks. Trainees are first given the test for practice on their second day at the academy, after which a personal trainer develops individualized exercise programs. Then trainees spend one hour a day on physical development and can check their progress by re-taking the CPAT every Saturday.

Other departments’ training takes place prior to the fire academy itself, typically administering a fitness evaluation during the hiring process and requiring candidates to pass before entering the academy. Candidates then participate in several weeks of training, the most effective of which uses the same equipment used in the test itself. During the 1990s, some departments discontinued these classes, despite their success. The reasons given included statewide initiatives banning affirmative action, budget cuts, pressure from the local firefighters’ union, and perceptions of unfairness (i.e. recruits participating in “the women’s program” were alleged to have an unfair advantage due to familiarity with test equipment). To replace these programs, some women started training programs outside their departments, in gyms and backyards, often attended by recruits of both genders.

Another factor influencing pass rates for men and women is the tests themselves, which vary widely in their validity, reliability, job-relatedness, and power to predict on-the-job performance. Among departments in our survey which require a physical abilities test, 21.5% use the CPAT. Another 24.3% rely on tests developed by testing professionals or their state’s civil service commission. The remaining 54.2% implement “home grown” tests, many of them developed with little attention to professional techniques for test development and validation. Some tests reject trainees for slowness in sprinting when many departments forbid sprinting as fatiguing and worsening smoke inhalation. Others impose extreme requirements for strength in isolated muscle groups, rather than testing the whole-body strength which firefighting involves. Still others test upper body strength, where men typically out-perform women, without measuring stamina and agility, which are also necessary for firefighting and where women often outscore men.

Among respondents to our departmental survey, the average pass rate for women on the CPAT was 68.0%,

substantially higher than the 49.0% rate in departments using other tests. The CPAT's ratio of pass rates for women compared to men — 77.4% — was also higher than the 61.7% ratio for all other tests. These outcomes contradict the assumption that the only way to increase the proportion of women passing physical abilities test is to lower standards, because the CPAT requires high levels of physical performance.

In fact, the level of performance required by the CPAT is at the center of widespread criticism of that test. The job relatedness of the test has never been validated using the standard statistical method — “criterion-based validation,” which analyzes whether the test predicts on-the-job performance. Even the weak analyses to which the CPAT has been subjected — “content-based validation,” which focuses on whether test tasks parallel actual job duties — documented that women pass at substantially lower rates than men. Key aspects of the test which appear directly related to this adverse impact on female job candidates and for which there is no proof that they accurately predict on-the-job performance include: the level of the test's strength requirements; its emphasis strength over aerobic capacity; its requirement that all 8 test tasks be completed in a continuous, timed sequence; its applicability in climates and altitudes different from where the test was developed; and its tendency to test coaching on “tricks of the trade” rather than actual physical abilities.

A final factor influencing pass rates is the circumstances under which tests are administered. Our interviews produced numerous stories about tests conducted in ways that assist men to succeed and set women up to fail. Examples include timed trials in which women were required to drag wet hoses over wet pavement while men dragged dry hoses over dry pavement; pre-test training in which men were given performance tips and women were not provided the same information; men tested with properly-fitting clothing and equipment while women struggled with ill-fitting gear; and men tested in front of peers who cheer them on while women were tested in silence. According to our interviews, the CPAT, despite its detailed instructions concerning how each test task is to be administered and training and certification of test monitors, is not immune to similar inconsistencies.

Clearly, departments have many opportunities to increase women's pass rates on physical abilities screening without sacrificing their workforce's ability to perform their jobs safely and efficiently. Departments would be well advised to review their physical abilities tests, their validity and job-relatedness, placement in the hiring sequence, availability of pre-test training, and testing procedures. Departments should seek alternatives to any test — including the CPAT — which has substantial adverse impact on women without validation that the test predicts on-the-job performance.

Uniforms and Equipment

Anthropometricians have determined that, among adults, the average woman has a body size 93% of the average man's, and a 50th percentile woman corresponds in size to a 5th percentile man. Therefore, to equip women, at a minimum a department must order a higher proportion of smaller uniforms and personal equipment than for an all-male staff. However, women are simply smaller versions of men only in terms of overall height and weight. For other dimensions, such as neck circumference, hip breadth, or finger length, women and men are shaped sufficiently differently that gear needs to be designed differently.

According to Table 1, 79.7% of women survey respondents reported problems with ill-fitting equipment, nearly four times the 20.9% reported by men. These problems involved gloves (for 57.8% of female respondents), boots (46.8%), turnout/bunker coats (38.9%), helmets (28.4%), and breathing masks (25.6%). In interviews, one particular complaint from all but the tallest women involved breathing apparatus hitting helmets, tipping them forward to impair vision.

Among departments with women employees responding to our survey, 39.8% reported not having purchased size-adapted clothing and personal equipment. This rate does not appear to reflect short-term constraints, such as the current year's budget or schedules for gradual equipment replacement, because the proportion reporting no such purchases is similar — 37.9% — in departments employing at least 10 women for at least 10 years. And it does not reflect unavailability of suitably-sized gear, which manufacturers have been offering since at least 1995.

Instead, the issue is simple lack of departments' responsiveness. This pattern is illustrated in comments by women firefighters surveyed by the International Association of Women in Fire and Emergency Services in 1995. There, 51% of respondents reported current problems with gear fit. But more tellingly, among the 42% reporting no current problems, many added comments such as: "But only after ten years of problems, memos, and letters," "only because we made such an issue," or "because I bought it myself."

Firehouse Living

Over decades operating with an all-male staff, many fire stations developed a "fraternity house" atmosphere in which sexually-oriented conversation, pornography, and homophobia were common and accepted. While in some departments, that atmosphere has been replaced by a more professional one, it persists in many others. In Table 1, 46.2% of female survey respondents reported incidents involving privacy in showers, dormitory, or when changing clothes, compared to 2.8% of men; 28.4% of women reported incidents related to dormitory accommodations, compared to 2.3% of men; and 13.1% reported problems related to meal times, compared to 0.9% of men.

In our department survey, 55.0% of departments reported major construction or renovation in firehouses or other facilities to accommodate women, such as installing separate bathrooms or dormitories.³ An additional 32.4% reported minor changes, such as signs on bathroom doors or privacy curtains; and 12.6% reported having done nothing. As with clothing and equipment, lack of action here does not reflect short-term considerations such as waiting for scheduled construction and maintenance; among departments employing at least 10 women for at least 10 years, 41.5% reported no major renovations responding to this issue.

In any case, the issue typically involves women having not only physical space in the firehouse but also psychological space — acknowledging that they are full, permanent members of the work team by accommodating their needs and preferences. This interpre-

tation makes particular sense of women's reports, in Table 1, of "mealtime difficulties." According to Table 3 later in this report, mealtime issues by themselves reduces women's satisfaction with firefighting more than 12%, the largest reduction for any gender-related issue. Mealtime difficulties refer to choice of food as well as table conversation and social interaction. Our interviews produced many stories of mealtime harassment, including refusal to cook for or serve an unwelcome firefighter, refusal to take into account dietary restrictions or preferences, and, in extreme cases, food contamination or threats of contamination.

Sexual Harassment

The close living arrangements in firehouses, as well as the importance of teamwork when firefighters' lives literally depend on each other, give particular importance to mutual support among firefighters. What promotes that support, and what destroys it?

One flash point on this subject is pranks, practical jokes, and hazing in the firehouse. Some observers describe these activities as traditional, harmless fun which builds teamwork, relieves boredom, and attracts volunteers. Others emphasize instances in which pranks and hazing turns nasty, especially with sexist, racist, and homophobic content, and represents harassment and intimidation intended to test and drive out unwelcome individuals.

Women we interviewed reported "pranks" involving human feces in boots and on bathroom walls, hardcore pornography, and derogatory messages left in lockers, food contamination, shunning, and dangerous conduct at fires, such as cutting off water supply. They complained about sexual harassment including vulgar statements, unwanted attention, and "locker-room" pranks involving gross and juvenile sexually-related "humor." Some reported a male expectation that women would date their fellow firefighters and stations where the only women previously present serviced on-duty male firefighters ("getting laid and getting paid"). Many women reported that even now, "hardly a day goes by" without some sort of harassment, although most agreed that it is generally less

³ In interviews, women firefighter often opposed separate male and female dormitories as destructive of team spirit and information sharing. They suggested instead that the situation be addressed by appropriate respect and common sense in shared sleeping areas.

blatant and crude than in the past. A small but significant number of women enumerated physical assaults, mostly unreported for fear of retaliation.

Our interviews produced an almost universal consensus that departmental internal procedures for addressing complaints of harassment or discrimination are weak and risk ostracism and retaliation. Unless they face particularly unacceptable behavior, women typically attempt to handle situations themselves or with the support of mentors. When facing a severe problem, they trust outside agencies, such as the EEOC, more than their own department.

Departments seeking to increase the representation of women among firefighters must exercise constant vigilance and control on these issues. Departments can convey distinctions between appropriate and inappropriate behavior through explicit anti-harassment policies, mandatory training communicating these policies to all staff, and enforcement of the policies through proactive monitoring, prompt responses to complaints, and serious punishment — including termination, if necessary — for violators. Our interviews confirmed a direct relationship between harassment in a department and tolerance for it by the department's senior managers. In the few departments that have instituted and seriously enforced a "zero tolerance" policy, incidents decreased.

Despite the relatively straightforward nature of these remedies, women's survey responses make clear that vigilance and control is often not maintained. Table 1 reports that 50.8% of women have experienced shunning or isolation; 42.9%, verbal harassment; 31.9%, pornography; 30.2%, sexual advances; 18.6%, hazing; 18.2%, hostile cartoons or written material; and 6.3%, assaults. Similar incidents were reported by 2.8% or fewer male respondents. Furthermore, 65.0% of women reported that their department has no procedures of which they were aware for addressing such complaints, and 23.4% reported that their supervisors fail to address problems reported to them.

Promotions

Women's representation at advanced ranks has lagged behind even their limited representation in entry-level firefighting. Although only 3 to 5 years' experience is

typically required before firefighters can begin to apply for promotions, among the departments responding to our survey, an average of 10 years elapsed between the first women at the entry-level and at any higher rank. The nationwide number of women in senior positions is so limited that the primary source of information on them is lists of names maintained by professional associations. The contact network of the International Association of Women in Fire and Emergency Services includes about 150 women battalion chiefs or deputy chiefs and 31 department chiefs.

Thus, firefighting exhibits a "glass ceiling," with the representation of women shrinking at each stage up the managerial hierarchy. Among departments in our survey, employment which averages 5.7% at entry level fell to 4.5% among intermediate supervisors (company officer or battalion, assistant, or deputy chief) and 2.6% among department chiefs. In the 2000 Census, women were 3.7% of first-level firefighters and 2.9% of their first line supervisors.

Firefighting also exhibits "glass walls," or gender differences in roles and assignments at the same rank. Among the departments responding to our survey, females average 4.8% among employees in fire suppression, in contrast to 16.6% in such roles as fire inspection and investigation. In our firefighter survey, 36.0% of women were firefighter paramedics rather than firefighters, compared to 30.5% of men. In some cases, these differences reflect individuals' preferences, while in other cases they are involuntary. Either way, they are likely to limit perceptions of women as full members of the working team, as well as prospects for promotions.

In interviews, women firefighters reported disparities in training and assignments which limit their promotional opportunities. Denial of access to classes and equipment to train for certification and promotional exams was a common theme. Women also reported inequitable drilling, having to prove themselves beyond what was expected of their male counterparts. For example, one woman reported that an officer repeatedly required her to perform single-person ladder raises, when the department had long before stopped using that maneuver. Others described frequent station changes, so that they reported to a different officer every shift throughout their probationary period.

Women of color reported retaliatory transfers to all-white, all-male stations in neighborhoods where they were particularly unwelcome. Only occasionally did women report making it through the early stages of their careers because a man “took them under his wing” to buffer the firehouse atmosphere and aid in acquiring skills.

How can departments become even-handed in terms of assigning and advancing women? One key is suggested by the fact that women and men survey respondents described their department’s promotion processes as unfair at almost the same rate — 33.9% and 30.6%, respectively. This consensus suggests that considerable progress for women can be achieved by ensuring that promotion processes are professionally designed and conducted to control personal favoritism and stereotype-prone subjective decision-making. The well-known means for doing so involve replacing informal, “tap on the shoulder” selections with open posting of job vacancies, explicit selection criteria which have been validated as job-related and predictive of on-the-job performance, and training of selecting officials about how to control unconscious bias and stereotypes. Such “cleaning up your act” in promotion decisions need not be gender-specific and would improve opportunities not only for females but also for males not in the “buddy network” which tends to be favored in many departments.

Which Problems are Most Important?

Clearly, women face problems in many different aspects of firefighting. Which of these issues are the most important in determining their satisfaction with a firefighting career? Table 3 identifies two clusters of issues which bother the women responding to our survey the most. The first, labeled “incidents in the workplace,” refers to encounters with discrimination, harassment, or exclusion in their daily work life, combined with lack of response to these incidents by supervisors. The second, labeled “Fairness in Employment Practices,” refers to perceptions that they are not treated equally to males in hiring, assignments, and promotions. Departments seeking to make current

women firefighters more satisfied with their careers and encourage other women to become firefighters should devote their highest priority to these two concerns.⁴

It is noteworthy that neither cluster of issues involves special treatment for women or lower standards for physical performance. They do not call for “affirmative action” but instead simply require departments to ensure equal employment opportunity. In most departments, the first step toward that goal would be to recognize that the “playing field” is not level between the genders today. Departments then need to enforce standards of non-harassment and equal treatment which have been required by law, as well as widely-held social norms, for at least four decades.

The Workplace Culture Underlying these Operational Issues

The patterns just discussed are simple to summarize: The number of women firefighters remains far below its expected level, and even obvious steps to increase it have not been undertaken by most departments. Such findings are typical of workplaces whose culture resents the presence of women and, consciously or unconsciously, intends to exclude them.

Formally defined, a workplace’s “organizational culture” is the system of beliefs, values, and ways of behaving common to that workplace. Less formally, it is simply “the way things are done around here.” These cultures tend to evolve slowly and resist change both actively and passively. Resistance tends to be particularly strong where employees remain for long careers, personal relationships are strong, traditions are maintained with pride, and employment is well rewarded — all circumstances describing firefighting.

Firefighting’s traditional culture is proud and noble, with shared perceptions that the occupation is dangerous and difficult; the key performance requirements are strength and courage; only an elite subset of individuals are capable of performing its duties; and generous pay and prestige reflect these circumstances.

⁴The only high-impact issue not falling within these two clusters is paid child care. In our survey, 39.3% of women and 68.4% of men reported having had young children at some time during their firefighting careers. About 84% of both groups reported that these children were cared for by a family member. For women, the combination of having young children and relying on paid care providers reduced the respondents’ favorable assessment of firefighting as a career by 6.3%

Table 3: Circumstances Which Most Reduce Women Firefighters' Rating of their Careers

Category	Response	Impact on Rating ^a
Incidents in the Workplace	I have experienced gender-based mealtime-related incidents in the workplace	-12.2%
	I have experienced race-based incidents in the workplace	- 8.2%
	I have experienced other incidents in the workplace	- 7.6%
	My supervisor does not address gender complaints	- 7.4%
	I have experienced verbal harassment in the workplace	- 6.3%
	Gender-based incidents in the workplace continue into the present	- 6.1%
Fairness in Employment Practices	The hiring process in my department is not fair	- 5.8%
	My gender is a barrier to my career advancement	- 5.5%
	I have experienced gender-based discrimination in work assignments	- 5.3%
	The promotion process in my department is not fair	- 5.0%
Other	For child care, I have used a paid provider, not family	- 6.3%

^aWomen firefighters in our survey were asked to rate firefighting as if they were advising a young woman considering the career, on a scale of 1= worst career, 5= best career. This column reports the change in this rating associated with each response, divided by women respondent's average rating of 3.8.

Ironically, these perceptions continue to be used to justify absence of women firefighters as the evolving occupation itself erodes their relevance. Obviously, suppression of large fires remains a dangerous, difficult task. However, the shifting balance between fire calls and medical calls brings to prominence skills and abilities which the traditional occupational self-image ignores. Medical calls invoke treatment skills and knowledge more than strength or courage, as well as care-giving skills and aptitudes often associated with nurses or social workers.

Whatever its actual relevance today, as FEMA's manual on women firefighters puts it, "It is the mystique of interior structural firefighting that lures most recruits to city fire departments, and it remains the psychological focus of the urban firefighter's job." This mystique equally remains the focus of resistance to women. To their male peers, women firefighters represent more than competitors for positions they want and constraints on the free-wheeling aspects of firehouse life. They also silently challenge the self-esteem male firefighters derive from perceiving themselves as doing a job for which only a select few have the "right stuff." In these circumstances, opposition such as is documented in Table 1 and throughout this report is perhaps not surprising.

These organizational dynamics are not unique to women in firefighting. Whenever the demographic diversity of a workforce increases, inter-group relations tend initially to worsen rather than improve. Accordingly, departments cannot simply hire women firefighters and allow them to "sink or swim" but instead need proactive strategies to ensure their inclusion. These strategies must address specific issues — from physical abilities tests to dormitory privacy — such as discussed in this report. But they must also address the underlying exclusionary workplace culture of which these issues are symptoms (See sidebar: Five Elements of a Strategy for Culture Change). Doing the first of these without the second will result in no employment increases, only token increases, or increases which are only temporary as newly-hired women are driven out.

Looking Forward

As recently as four decades ago, it was considered "obvious" that women are not capable of, or interested in, firefighting. That explanation will no longer suffice. In estimating an expected representation for women of 17%, our study has factored in the extent to which a smaller proportion of women than men are interested in, and capable of performing, an occupation as dirty, dangerous, and demanding as firefighting.

The main role of such “obvious” but incorrect assumptions today is, consciously or unconsciously, to justify administrative, organizational, interpersonal and technological barriers to women’s employment which are not actually necessary for safe, efficient departmental operations. These barriers to women’s inclusion, and the workplace culture underlying them, remain in place, in varying degrees, in the majority of the nation’s departments. But, as pioneering departments with substantial numbers of women employees demonstrate, these barriers are not inevitable.

To reduce these barriers and bring women’s employment to its potential will require more universal application of best practices adopted by these pioneering departments. It will also require changing the underlying workplace culture from one of exclusion to one

of gender inclusiveness. Inclusion means more than hiring in numbers to match women’s availability. It also mean that, throughout their careers, women are treated equally to males in how they are welcomed, trained, assigned, retained, promoted, and otherwise given the opportunity to thrive. Inclusion is a substantially more ambitious goal than simply increasing the number of women in uniform. However, it is essential if increases in those numbers are to be meaningful and self-sustaining.

Guided by findings from study, gender inclusion is the new standard to which departments are likely to be held. Senior fire managers need to lead their departments in resolving deficiencies proactively, before being forced to by expensive and disruptive litigation.

Five Elements of a Strategy for Culture Change

There is no simple formula for achieving fundamental, permanent changes in a department’s underlying culture. However, research and experience suggest five key elements of such strategies.

First, commitment by top leadership -- mayors, chiefs and other senior appointed or elected officials. These leaders must be visible in announcing the goal of expanded female employment, the reasons for it, and their expectation that those reporting to them will join the effort. They must send this message persistently and insistently, in actions as well as words.

Second, monitoring and accountability translating the broad goal into immediate personal consequences for mid-level managers, first-level supervisors, and others. Contributions toward the goal need to be rewarded in performance appraisals, raises, and promotions. Behavior inconsistent with the goal needs to be sanctioned promptly, visibly, and consistently.

Third, human resource management procedures embodying transparency, objectivity, and performance-relatedness. These procedures need

to replace more traditional procedures which often allow gender stereotypes, individual favoritism, and in-group bias to affect hiring, promotions, assignments, and other decisions.

Fourth, activities changing individuals’ behavior to control hostile acts. Several approaches are often required. One is establishment of a zero tolerance policy for symbolic words or actions which open the door to more serious biased or aggressive behavior. Another is training to increase employees’ aware of pervasive tendencies toward conscious and unconscious bias, and the cumulative significance of even small slights. The most effective training uses real-life examples drawn from the specific workplace and provides tools for dealing with practical situations, such as “scripts” for alternative behavior.

This training needs to be provided to staff at all levels in the department, since culture is a “360 degree” process which all employees help to shape. In addition, special training is usually needed for first-level supervisors, who are the daily face of the department for individual employees.

Fifth, sustained effort. Significant culture change in a complex, long-established workplace may require deliberate effort over 3 to 5 years or longer.



International Association of Fire Fighters Diversity Initiative



Achieving and Retaining a Diverse Fire Service Workforce

January 2006

**Kathryn A. Fox, M.A., CWH
Chris W. Hornick, Ph.D., CWH
Erin Hardin, M.A., CWH**



IAFF Diversity Initiative Achieving and Retaining a Diverse Fire Service Workforce

Acknowledgments

We have been thrilled and honored to conduct this study on behalf of the International Association of Fire Fighters and the Fire Service. After working with the Fire Service for the past 25 years, in the area of Selection and Testing, we realized that this research was long overdue. The issues of recruiting in general, and recruiting for diversity in particular, are among the most critical issues facing the Fire Service. However, while many individuals and organizations have expressed a recognition of the need, the IAFF provided the funding and direction for this first of its kind study into Best Practices in Recruiting Methods that can help unite us in our common goals.

We would like to especially thank our contact and liaison, David Neun, IAFF Education Director, for his support and feedback throughout the project. He also helped us to understand better the complex organization that is the IAFF, as well as the desire and motivation on the part of the IAFF to truly make a difference in this area. We also want to thank Harold Schaitberger, the General President of the IAFF, for his sponsorship of this project and leadership of the organization.

This project could not have been conducted without the cooperation and assistance from Fire Service and Human Resources professionals around the country. We offer a Big Thank You to the Local Presidents and members, Chief Officers, Training Officers, Recruiters, Human Resources managers and analysts, and others who gave their time, thought, honesty, and energy in interviews and completing the surveys that provide the major part of the research in this report.

We also want to express our deep gratitude to the paid and volunteer, US and Canadian, multi-cultural, brave and dedicated men and women of the Fire Service for their significant contributions to our communities.



IAFF Diversity Initiative
Achieving and Retaining a Diverse Fire Service Workforce



Table of Contents

Acknowledgments i

1. PROJECT SUMMARY AND KEY FINDINGS ON RECRUITMENT METHODS..... 1

Definition of Terms related to Recruiting 3

What is Effective and Successful Recruiting for Diversity? 4

PHASE 1 - LITERATURE REVIEW FINDINGS 7

10 KEY FINDINGS FROM LITERATURE REVIEW SUPPORTED BY SURVEY 8

 Potential concerns regarding targeted recruitment (Proposition 209) 8

 Summary of Literature Review 12

PHASE 2 - INTERVIEW AND SURVEY ADMINISTRATION..... 13

Process 13

Limitations with Sampling Method 13

Limitations with Survey Method 14

PHASE 3 - RESULTS AND KEY FINDINGS 15

Types of recruiting methods..... 15

DISCUSSION OF TOP 8 EFFECTIVE METHODS USED BY MOST SUCCESSFUL DEPARTMENTS 17

CASE STUDIES OF SUCCESSFUL DEPARTMENTS 23

2. DEMOGRAPHICS OF THE PARTICIPATING DEPARTMENTS 29

Group Ratio 30

Women 31

3. CORRELATIONS WITH METHODS OF RECRUITMENT AND GROUP RATIOS..... 33



**IAFF Diversity Initiative
Achieving and Retaining a Diverse Fire Service Workforce**

How to read the data..... 33

How to use this data 33

1. Correlations with Recruiting Methods - Sorted by Black Ratio..... 35

2. Correlations with Recruiting Methods - Sorted by Hispanic Ratio..... 37

3. Correlations with Recruiting Methods - Sorted by Asian Ratio..... 39

4. Correlations with Recruiting Methods - Sorted by Total Minority Ratio 41

5. Correlations with Recruiting Methods - Sorted by Female Ratio 43

4. DEPARTMENT CHARACTERISTICS AND POLICIES THAT IMPACT DIVERSITY45

Selection Policies..... 45

Diversity Commitment, Message, and Values 46

Other Recruitment Issues & Policies..... 46

Conclusions 47

5. COMPARISON OF “TOP 10” DEPARTMENTS TO OTHERS49

6. OBSTACLES TO DIVERSITY.....56

7. DATA COLLECTION PROCESS AND SAMPLE SELECTION62

Selecting our sample..... 62

Administering the Short Screening Survey and Interview..... 62

Comprehensive Survey Sample and Responses..... 64

Appendices in separate volumes:

- Appendix 1 – Short Interview/Survey Questions
- Appendix 2 – Comprehensive Survey Questions
- Appendix 3 – Summary of Survey Responses
- Appendix 4 – Literature Review
- Appendix 5 – Bibliography




IAFF Diversity Initiative Achieving and Retaining a Diverse Fire Service Workforce

1. Project Summary and Key Findings on Recruitment Methods

Recruiting and Diversity have become “hot topics” in the Fire Service in recent years. A review of the demographics in the Fire Service (presented in the next chapter of this report) shows a large gap between our population and its representation in the Fire Service. There has also been a growing awareness of the effect on diversity of the huge wave of retirements that is happening now and will continue happening for the next few years. What diversity we have achieved is very likely to disappear, and as a profession and as a nation, we are uninformed and unprepared to solve the problem. Many well intentioned people have begun generating discussion, ideas, and have even proposed various solutions. However, this project is the first serious and scientific research that has been conducted to begin to understand potential solutions, and why some methods and approaches work and others do not. This study is a first step in the right direction. It will provide a good foundation for additional research to follow.



This summary highlights the key findings of this research, marked with this symbol. Examples of Best Practices methods or strategies from our surveyed departments are flagged  throughout this summary and the entire report. When we obtained specific permission to name the department, we do. In other cases, we simply describe the practices that are good examples without naming the department. Other departments who participated in interviews are not named.

The overall objective established by the IAFF for this project was ***to identify effective recruitment, selection, and retention practices to achieve a fire service workforce that reflects the community served.*** The IAFF specifically wanted to address the underrepresentation of people of color, women, and gays and lesbians in the Fire Service. Many arguments can be made for why we should place emphasis on increasing diversity. In the literature review of this report, various researchers explore the business, financial, and legal reasons for supporting diversity. In the Fire Service, in addition to all the practical issues related to diversity, there are also strong social and emotional reasons. The Fire Service serves each and every community member, regardless of ethnicity, gender, race, background, economy, or any other factor, and also depends on the entire community and country for its funding and support. As public safety and public service organizations, most Fire Departments want to better understand, communicate with, and enlist cooperation in our multi-cultural communities.



IAFF Diversity Initiative Achieving and Retaining a Diverse Fire Service Workforce

“We received a mandate to make our department demographics representative of our community. That way the community sees itself in those who are serving them.”

Survey Respondent, Montgomery County, MD

The IAFF originally envisioned this project as research that would lead to the development of some type of program, such as a national web based orientation and training program. CWH proposed beginning the project with a much less defined end result, but with a broader focus. Throughout the project, we have questioned our assumptions and “common knowledge” about recruiting. The project evolved to be a comprehensive, qualitative, and quantitative study that documents what is and is not successful in helping to diversify the Fire Service. This report does not propose a rigid plan or structure. Instead, we provide examples of success, and documentation of many, many methods of implementing successful recruitment efforts. Even small departments or departments with severe budget restrictions can find tips and ideas that can be implemented to improve their results. Local presidents and members can review these results and suggestions and determine which ones will be most effective in your own departments with your own constituencies.

When presenting Best Practices, it is critical for us to realize that few departments would have the capability to implement all Best Practices. In addition, even some of the departments that have made the most progress, may have problems in some areas related to employee and workforce issues. Best Practices examples should be used as a guide for improvement, not as a panacea for all problems. This report attempts to acknowledge and give credit to the departments that have action oriented programs and policies, are making positive efforts, and appear to have better than average positive results.

The findings of this research may at times seem contradictory or surprising; and at times seem to be just common sense. Although the research methods we used included extensive data collection and analysis, the study was primarily a qualitative study. The results require us to interpret the data much more than to simply report it. The findings can guide the IAFF as a national organization in developing a type of program if it chooses, perhaps a cadet program or a “How to Guide” for individual departments. The results presented in this report also can guide individual departments and local unions in creating their own initiatives or adjusting their current efforts.

This project had 3 major phases or steps performed over the course of a year and a half. These were:

1. Literature Review

This resulted in the identification of major issues to probe in the interviews and surveys.



IAFF Diversity Initiative Achieving and Retaining a Diverse Fire Service Workforce

2. Interviewing of over 80 departments and surveying over 40 departments as potential departments using Best Practices recruiting methods and conducting interviews with their local presidents, Chiefs, Training Officers, and others in each department.

The interview process resulted in the elimination of over half of the potential departments, based on their own assessment of their recruitment and diversity effectiveness.

Over 40 departments were invited to participate in the comprehensive survey. We received completed responses from 31 departments.

3. Analysis of the comprehensive survey of the departments that were identified as actually using proactive Best Practices methods.

This phase resulted in the examination of over 25 specific recruitment methods and a comparison of effectiveness. In addition, we examined related concepts such as entry level requirements, education levels, pay, and diversity values, in over 200 survey items to identify the most successful strategies and create profiles of the most successful departments.

Definition of Terms related to Recruiting

Recruiting method

This is the specific effort or process used, such as Doing Radio Ads. Our survey asked the surveyed departments to tell us which methods they used. A table presented in this summary lists the 27 methods and shows how frequently they are used.

Innovative approach vs. Traditional approach to recruiting

These terms do not describe specific methods, but refer to the approach toward recruiting. Innovative recruiting requires more effort, resources, and is usually more targeted to a specific group or defined in terms of results desired. Examples of innovative approaches include recruiting in different cities, using ads designed specifically for women on Lifetime TV, developing a cadet program, and other similar, less routine efforts.

Traditional approaches consist of methods used generally and frequently by most departments. Examples include: Direct mail interest cards, word of mouth, newsletters, general advertising. Traditional methods generally are effective for increasing your applicant pool, but are not usually effective at increasing diversity in your applicant pool, unless it is combined with a very innovative and targeted approach.

Targeted recruiting approach

Similar to innovative in that this targets a specific group or result desired. Traditional and informal recruiting methods may be used to target a specific group.

Formal vs. Informal methods



IAFF Diversity Initiative Achieving and Retaining a Diverse Fire Service Workforce

Formal recruiting methods involve planning and funding. Doing advertising is a formal method. Informal recruiting relies on social networking and referrals. Word of mouth, open houses, and similar approaches are examples of informal recruiting.

Effective method

Specifically for this report our measure of success is diversity. Many methods may be effective in other ways. For example, word of mouth is effective in getting numbers of candidates. However, it will usually bring in more of the same demographic group that is already the majority in the department. Word of mouth is not effective to attract Minorities and women, unless it is targeted and used as part of a more planned and innovative approach.

What is Effective and Successful Recruiting for Diversity?

Effective recruiting for Diversity involves multiple methods of recruiting. Targeted recruiting for the specific groups desired is much more effective than general recruiting. Both Innovative and Traditional approaches may be used as long as they are all targeted. Also, a combination of Formal and Informal methods should be used.

For the purpose of this analysis, we measured Success in our participating departments by the percent of Minorities and Women represented in the local population based on census data compared to the percent represented in the department.

We also used National Statistics to make the same comparisons. The table below shows National (U.S.) statistics comparing U.S. population to reported representation in the Fire Service. (Please note that 2 Canadian Fire departments were also included in the study but either did not complete demographic information or did not meet or exceed average Canadian representation.)

Demographic Representation

US Census Data Compared to Bureau of Labor Statistics representation in the Fire Service

	Black	Hispanic	Asian	Women
US Census 2000	12.3%	12.5%	3.6%	50.9%
Firefighting Profession US Bureau of Labor Statistics	8.4%	8.6%	1.3%	5.1%
Group Ratio comparing percent represented in profession to percent of each group in population	.68	.69	.36	.10

Group Ratio

Similar to an adverse impact ratio, the closer the ratio is to 1.00, the closer the representation of the target group is to the actual population. Using these ratios, a successful department would be one whose ratio exceeds the national ratio. That would mean that for Blacks, a



IAFF Diversity Initiative Achieving and Retaining a Diverse Fire Service Workforce

ratio between .68 and 1.00 exceeds the national percentage and comes closer to actual population representation. Likewise, for women, ratios above .10 would demonstrate better than average progress towards Diversity.

More information about demographics is presented later in this report.



IAFF Diversity Initiative
Achieving and Retaining a Diverse Fire Service Workforce





IAFF Diversity Initiative Achieving and Retaining a Diverse Fire Service Workforce

Phase 1 - Literature Review Findings

We obtained many benefits in doing a thorough review of past research. In presenting the case for budget and resource allocations for diversity recruiting, the literature review provides strong justification for the effort, even in difficult times of budget cuts and limited financial resources. The literature review also provides a common terminology for our discussion, and a general understanding of basic concepts that work in recruiting, and especially in recruiting for diversity. In interpreting data from this study, the literature review provides a context for evaluating the ideas and methods used and proposed by various departments. In other words, the literature review can provide something of a “reality check,” to help determine how feasible or desirable an idea, approach, or method is. We evaluated our interview, survey, and data conclusions against the hypotheses and theories in the literature to help us interpret and understand some of our findings.

Not surprisingly, most prior research about diversity recruiting has been conducted with a focus on the private sector, especially how to attract limited top talent to the top corporations in what is perceived to be a competitive environment for employers. In fact, even in the private sector, much of the research is about reaching management level candidates and competing for a limited number of qualified candidates. By contrast, the Fire Service generally operates under entirely different parameters. Candidates for the Fire Service are entry level, usually high school graduates, and there are hundreds of thousands of them! Traditionally there are many more applicants for any one job than are needed. In fact, the whole idea of recruiting is somewhat new for many Fire Departments. We regularly talk to agencies about how to narrow or decrease their applicant pools rather than to increase them. The idea of bringing even more people to the door, only to put them through a selection process that hires only a few, can at first seem nonsensical.

As our economy continues to put pressure on public safety departments to reduce their budgets, many Fire and Human Resources executives, as well as City Managers and Civil Service board members, ask why they should spend money to do any recruiting. The literature review helps us answer that question. Diversity in the workforce will not occur simply because your department is located in a diverse metropolitan area or because your department follows the law regarding non-discrimination. In order to achieve diversity, you must have a strong commitment that includes an active recruiting strategy and you must take effective actions.

Many of the surveyed departments we identified through our interviews and surveys use methods that have been recommended in previous research. The key findings and recommendations from the literature review are shown below, along with some Best Practices examples and survey results:



**IAFF Diversity Initiative
Achieving and Retaining a Diverse Fire Service Workforce**

10 Key Findings from Literature Review supported by Survey



1. **Specifically target the group** you want to reach and recruit (EEOC, 1997). Generic messages and blanket advertising do not work to reach Minorities and women effectively.

57% of surveyed departments have recruitment strategies aimed at women, 63% have strategies aimed at Minorities.

Best Practices Example:

✍ The Austin, TX Fire Department calls this the “Name it and Claim it” approach. They recommend putting all your efforts into targeted recruitment. They said that whether you create an ad for TV, radio, or print, if you want to hire more women, your ad should include a woman character, talking about the job, and showing women in the job.

Potential concerns regarding targeted recruitment (Proposition 209)

One of the survey respondents expressed a concern regarding targeted recruitment. The survey respondent said that in his state of California, the law precluded methods or initiatives that target protected groups. We have heard of this concern from several others. Different laws are often subject to interpretation, and we are not giving legal advice in this report. Proposition 209 in California (enacted in 1996) specifically prohibits programs, initiatives, or policies that give preferential treatment on the basis of race or gender. To read the actual language, go to www.acri.org/209.

The Federal Equal Employment Opportunity Commission taskforce appointed to study best practices in the private sector (published in 1997) advocates targeted recruiting as a method for overcoming traditional barriers and discrimination, and as a way to provide Equal Employment Opportunity. This report can be found at <http://www.eeoc.gov/abouteeoc/taskreports/practice.html>. The EEOC report clearly states that targeted recruitment must not result in discrimination toward white men or any group.

In reality, all active recruiting is targeted. Even advertising in the local city newspaper is targeted to that newspaper’s subscribers. Targeted recruiting to increase diversity is the decision to advertise and recruit in various and diverse venues and markets, and to focus the recruitment budget on expanding the non-traditional applicant pool. After all, no department can recruit everywhere. Doing targeted advertising, for example, an ad in a women’s magazine, does not disadvantage men in the process, who will still apply in greater numbers than women. It simply opens the door wider for everyone and invites a new non-traditional market to join the traditional one.



IAFF Diversity Initiative Achieving and Retaining a Diverse Fire Service Workforce

Targeted recruitment is not about quotas, preferences, or profiling. Targeted recruitment should not be confused with giving any kind of preference in the recruitment or selection system. Giving preference in the recruitment or selection system for non-job related characteristics is illegal. The recruitment message should emphasize that all selection will be based on a valid evaluation of individual qualifications required for the job. Your recruiting efforts should be tracked so that you can ensure that you have adequate representation from all relevant groups in your applicant pool. You can then demonstrate that no group is being disadvantaged by your recruiting methods.



2. When targeting particular groups and when doing recruiting in general, **use language to promote a message of inclusiveness**. Several studies found that even when targeting a particular group, a message of inclusiveness can be communicated effectively to all groups. A company in one study organized a recruitment event specifically for gays and lesbians and found that only half of the attendees were from the target group (Audit Commission, 2002).

The standard advised by the Equal Employment Opportunity commission (EEOC) in its 1997 task force report is to target diverse populations and associations and to sponsor programs offered by Minority and women’s organizations, such as a “Women in Hard Hats” workshop that introduces women to non traditional careers.



3. **Use some “formal” methods of recruiting such as advertising**. For best results, combine that with establishing formal associations with Minority and women based organizations, formal programs with schools, or other formal channels. In other words do not rely on word of mouth from current fire fighters and your website alone to spread the message. Research shows that women and Minorities use a greater number of formal recruiting sources than White men (Kirnan et al., 1989).

*In a separate applicant survey developed by CWH for its clients, 30% of Black applicants said they **first** heard that the Fire Department was hiring by hearing an ad on the radio, compared to only 1% of White applicants.*

R **Best Practices Example:**

Montgomery County, MD enlists the participation of its Minority firefighter groups in the recruitment effort. It also reaches out to local Minority associations, such as the NAACP, CASA, and Asian American associations. However, they do not rely on word of mouth alone. They also advertise extensively in both major and local newspapers, radio, and TV.



IAFF Diversity Initiative Achieving and Retaining a Diverse Fire Service Workforce



4. Give specific and detailed information about the job, entry level skills needed, work requirements, salary, and benefits. Let your potential candidates know what a great career opportunity it is, not just a job!

Almost all of the surveyed departments describe the duties, salary, and basic benefits in their recruitment information. About 40% also describe opportunities for development and promotion.

R **Best Practices Example:**

A large southwest area department provides detailed information in its recruitment materials. This includes job duties, steps in the selection process, preparation assistance offered, and salary and benefits, including providing benefits to domestic partners, not just spouses. Another department advised also providing information about some of the negatives of the job, such as the shifts, so that applicants are as fully informed as possible.



5. In developing recruiting information and in advertising, remember to **target the candidate’s family** as well.

One study found that Black applicants for Police jobs will self-select out of the process after passing the first step because of lack of support from friends and family. (Ryan, et al. 2000)

“There is a common misconception in some Minority communities, Black and Hispanic, that the jobs of firefighter and police officer are strictly blue-collar and sub-level employment, say as compared to parents wanting their children to be an accountant, physician, etc. Education of the potential candidate often means educating the parents as well, as to all of the advantages that your department can provide in its employment.”

Surveyed department



6. Use minority and women recruiters. Walk the talk! One study found that half of Black candidates will consider whether there are other Blacks in the organization in making a decision about the job (Leonard, 2001). Make sure you let potential candidates know that they will not be the only minority or woman in the department.

Almost all of the surveyed departments have at least 1 – 2 full time recruiters, and usually have additional recruiters on a part-time or overtime basis. The average number of recruiters is 1 FT and 4 PT or OT. The majority of full time recruiters are minority and/or female.



IAFF Diversity Initiative Achieving and Retaining a Diverse Fire Service Workforce

R **Best Practices Example:**

A medium sized southeast area department has 1 full time recruiter and 12 who recruit on overtime. They are all ethnic Minorities, and 5 are women.



7. Communicate the value of Diversity in all your messages (even those not specifically designed for recruiting). Show Diversity in all your advertisements, recruiting information, website, study guide, and other materials. Go beyond simply stating an Equal Opportunity message, and describe how and why the department values inclusion and diversity. Studies have found that showing diversity and talking about values increases positive perceptions that Minorities and women hold about the organization without creating negative perceptions in White men. Also, diversity values are more important to women and Minorities than they are to White men.

Almost all of the surveyed departments show pictures of ethnic Minorities and women in their recruitment materials. About a third of the departments also discuss their diversity values in more detail than a simple equal opportunity message.



8. Use a fair and valid selection process that measures what is really required for the job. Examine each stage in the selection process to look for adverse impact on protected groups. Keep your process flexible to adjust as needed. Be as inclusive as possible in the first stages of the process in order to learn more about more of your candidates.

43% of surveyed departments use a test specifically validated for them. 33% use a pass/fail score on the written test. 31% of those who use a score on the written test set the cutoff score after reviewing the results.



9. Only require the education needed to perform the job.

100% of the surveyed departments require no more than a High School diploma.



IAFF Diversity Initiative Achieving and Retaining a Diverse Fire Service Workforce



10. For retention and job satisfaction, **provide a mentoring program** for newly hired firefighters. Individuals with mentors rated themselves as having more career opportunities, recognition, satisfaction, and promotions than those without (Fagenson, 1989). Women perceive greater barriers to having mentors than men and have more difficulty establishing informal mentor relationships.

48% of surveyed departments report having some type of mentoring program.

R **Best Practices Example:**

“Members from within the workforce are recruited to participate in the cadet training program by serving as Team Leaders. These individuals usually come from Operations working a shift schedule and are moved to a 40 hour schedule during cadet training. Team leaders are assigned a group of 10 to 12 cadets who they mentor and assist throughout the training academy. Their role is to positively influence the training experience for cadets. They are expected to lead their assigned team by example, be a liaison with instructors to improve cadet performance, participate in Physical Fitness and drill field activities, monitor assigned team activities (e.g. attendance, performance, corrective actions), document the performance and progress of each cadet, become knowledgeable on curriculum and skill requirements, be accountable for the success of cadets, be fully responsible for results of their assigned team, and report directly to the training program coordinators.”

Austin, TX Fire Department

Summary of Literature Review

The positive news is that effective diversity recruiting does not require us to change all of our current recruiting strategies and methods; it does require us to change our focus and emphasis. Targeted messaging matters. We can implement one or two or more of these strategies in the course of our everyday business as we naturally have to revise our recruiting messages and internal policies. We have to communicate a clear, consistent, and committed message about diversity and inclusion in everything that we do.



IAFF Diversity Initiative Achieving and Retaining a Diverse Fire Service Workforce

Phase 2 - Interview and Survey Administration

Process

- Called and interviewed Union Local presidents, recruitment officers, human resources professionals, Chiefs, and others in over 80 departments to identify departments that use some Best Practices methods effectively.
- The interview process was used to ask a few basic questions about the recruitment methods, strategies and results. Over half of the departments initially nominated as potential participating departments, self-selected out of providing information because they did not believe that their department actually does effective recruiting.
- 44 + Departments remained in the pool of potential participating departments and were contacted for more detailed information.
- 29 Departments provided full data, 2 others provided almost complete data, others provided only partial data.
- The next steps included gathering extensive survey data regarding critical areas of:
 - Demographics
 - Recruitment
 - Selection
 - Retention
- 7 of the 31 departments were previously under consent decrees which recently ended.
- Both the statistical and qualitative analysis presented in the Key Findings section of the report includes all of the departments that provided data, including consent decree departments. This presents and interprets “average” data for the entire sample of participating departments.
- Additional analysis was conducted to compare the participant departments to each other. In this analysis, we identified the 10 top departments that appeared to have the most success, when compared with other departments in the study. In this particular analysis, we excluded consent decree departments in order to focus only on the results achieved specifically through active efforts that the departments initiated. This eliminated diversity benefits that were achieved through a forced legal process that is ordinarily not allowed by law (giving preferences, using quotas, using different lists, etc.)
- Over 200 survey questions were asked in order to fully describe and analyze departments.

Limitations with Sampling Method



IAFF Diversity Initiative Achieving and Retaining a Diverse Fire Service Workforce

- 1 This is not a random sample. Departments self selected based on their belief that they used effective recruiting methods. In addition, we used only 1 criterion to measure success objectively: that was the comparison of diversity in the department compared to the community. There are other objective and subjective criteria that could be used in future follow up studies.
- 2 Restriction of Range. All departments in the survey are using some innovative recruitment methods, so there is no easy way to compare innovative to traditional or to no recruiting.
- 3 There may be other successful departments that were not identified.

Limitations with Survey Method

- All data is self reported.
- Complete data is not available for any department. For example, we do not have data from individual departments that actually tracks recruitment success linked to each method. Therefore, our analysis was based on only 1 measure of success (Diversity in the department) that is also influenced by many other factors (such as, the length of time they have been using a particular recruitment method or strategy).
- There is no data regarding how long each method had been used in the department.

The list of all survey questions is available in the Appendix. Also, an Item Frequencies report is presented in the Appendix. This report shows how many departments selected each answer choice. This has average responses and range of responses on each question.



**IAFF Diversity Initiative
Achieving and Retaining a Diverse Fire Service Workforce**

Phase 3 - Results and Key Findings

Types of recruiting methods

One of the major purposes of the comprehensive survey was to identify and compare the effectiveness of the specific recruiting methods being used by the study departments. The following list of 27 recruitment methods are rank ordered according to how many study departments reported using this method. A mean of 2 would indicate that all departments reported using this method. A mean of 1 would indicate that no departments used this method.

For example, Word of Mouth is used by almost everyone. (In fact, 1 department stated it was not used, but it probably is used informally and not tracked.) Conducting testing in other cities is the least used method, only used by 1 department. (The number following the name of each type of effort is the original survey item number.)

Reported frequency of use of each recruiting method	Mean
1 Word of Mouth # 1	1.90
2 Dept/City Website # 16	1.87
3 Other Job Fairs # 20	1.87
4 Community Events # 18	1.84
5 Schools/Com Ctr/Churches # 19	1.81
6 Ads Local Newspapers # 6	1.74
7 Ads Major Metro Newspapers # 5	1.71
8 Open House # 21	1.65
9 Public Service Announcements # 13	1.58
10 Minority Publication Ads # 11	1.58
11 News Stories # 15	1.55
12 Cadet/Explorer Program # 24	1.55
13 Other Website # 17	1.52
14 Radio Ads # 7	1.48
15 Orientation/Info Session # 22	1.48
16 Mentoring Applicants # 25	1.48
17 Direct Mail Interest Cards # 2	1.42
18 Recruit in Other Cities # 26	1.42
19 Cable/Local Access TV Ads # 9	1.39
20 Network TV Ads # 8	1.39
21 Newsletter # 3	1.35
22 Minority Radio/TV Ads Recruitment Effort 13	1.35



IAFF Diversity Initiative
Achieving and Retaining a Diverse Fire Service Workforce

23	Female Publication Ads # 10	1.32
24	Preparation Assistance # 23	1.32
25	Female Radio/TV Ads # 12	1.23
26	Banners # 4	1.19
27	Test Other Cities # 27	1.03

The next section summarizes the key findings related to how the surveyed departments used the above recruiting methods, and which methods appear to be most effective.



**IAFF Diversity Initiative
Achieving and Retaining a Diverse Fire Service Workforce**

Discussion of Top 8 Effective Methods used by Most Successful Departments

This section highlights the most effective methods used by the surveyed departments.

Keep in mind that all of the departments use a combination of approaches. Many of these methods are effective because they are used in a targeted approach and in combination with other methods. These methods are not presented in order of effectiveness, but these are the primary methods used by all of the departments.



1. Word of Mouth

This is named as the most frequently used method by all departments. However, word of mouth without other recruiting methods and without strong diversity commitment will increase homogeneity in the department, not diversity.

This method should not be relied on by most departments without a good recruitment plan to accompany it.

Word of mouth works when:

- 1 Involve current employees in planned activities and events
- 2 Build on prior success and current diversity.
- 3 Use current employees to attract others within the same group.
- 4 Combine with strong relationships with community organizations and events with those organizations.
- 5 Combine with other methods of formal advertising.
- 6 Message is consistent from employees, website, recruiting materials, etc. about the values of diversity.
- 7 Minority and women employees refer family and friends to the department.

Note that many of our most successful departments count on word of mouth to continue their success. However, they also formalize the word of mouth process to some extent by involving current employees in planned events and communicating a consistent message.

Word of mouth is not effective for recruiting for diversity if there is very little diversity in the department, and the current employees only recruit informally to family members and friends, who tend to be in the same ethnic group.



IAFF Diversity Initiative Achieving and Retaining a Diverse Fire Service Workforce



2. Formal advertising, especially when targeted to desired group.

This includes ads in major newspapers, as well as local minority based papers. Also includes radio, TV, Cable ads during shows heard or watched by targeted group, such as Lifetime for women, BET for Blacks, Spanish speaking TV shows for Hispanics.

Effective recruiting almost always requires some formal advertising along with other methods.

1. Women rely on formal methods, such as advertising, much more than men for finding jobs.
2. Advertising in all different media works for women.
3. Radio and targeted advertising works better for Minorities.
4. Put ads on TV during popular shows, not during fill time on cable.
5. Almost all of surveyed departments use a combination of advertising in different media.
6. PSAs can also be effective.
7. Advertise to the families of the candidates as well as to the candidates.



3. Direct Mail

While this can be a very traditional method, if it is used to make personal contact with your target group, this is very effective.

Direct Mail contact is most effective when:

1. Maintain a database of all people who express interest and keep them informed.
2. Be aggressive in reminding people about upcoming dates for training, testing, etc.
3. Combine with phone calls if possible.
4. Have personal contact with candidates prior to test date.
5. Have current employees volunteer to answer phone calls, answer emails, etc. as questions come in from candidates.



IAFF Diversity Initiative Achieving and Retaining a Diverse Fire Service Workforce



4. Cadet / Explorer Program

Programs vary, but this exposes kids from 8th grade through high school to the career opportunity in the Fire Service. It provides a good career option, advanced preparation opportunities, and extends a personal welcome to disadvantaged kids or to kids from backgrounds that are not part of the traditional recruitment pool.

This is one of the most effective methods. This method is effective for all Minority Groups and for women. Some of the departments use a Cadet program as their primary recruiting method that minimizes the need to advertise and use other formal methods of identifying candidates.

Cadet / Explorer programs are almost universally considered very effective.

1. Create relationships with local schools in predominately Minority communities to offer programs.
2. Build alliances with organizations that offer special programs for girls to teach them non traditional skills and show non traditional career options.
3. Develop relationships with the schools and kids in the programs to communicate Fire Service culture and values.
4. Programs should focus on career preparation.
5. Provide internships and interactions with firefighters.
6. Partner with local Tech Center / School to offer Fire / EMT program.



IAFF Diversity Initiative Achieving and Retaining a Diverse Fire Service Workforce



5. News Stories

This is free advertising that can be good if focused on good deeds of the department and members, showing diversity, emphasizing community values. Can be negative if the issue is about adverse impact in the testing process and how the department has not hired Minorities or women.

News stories about the Fire Department get huge amounts of public and official attention.

1. Build relationships with reporters and publishers.
2. Use news stories to highlight department achievements.
3. Offer firefighters for human interest stories and to discuss the department's diversity goals and community values.
4. If negative stories appear, follow them up with what the department is doing to correct any problems.



6. Diversity message, inclusion message, showing diversity in recruitment messages and internal communications

The strongest and most statistically significant correlations in the data are with having a strong diversity and inclusive message and internal commitment.

Constant and consistent communication of your message is essential!

1. Continually train and reinforce positive values and message within the department.
2. Post diversity goals and statements in every station and reinforce in internal and external documents.
3. Market the department's diversity goals and values widely by including it in all external messages and materials.
4. Match newly hired firefighters to mentors who are preferably same gender and ethnicity, demonstrate value for all employees.
5. Provide diversity training for all employees.
6. Rigorously enforce harassment policies.



IAFF Diversity Initiative Achieving and Retaining a Diverse Fire Service Workforce



7. Job Fairs / Community Events / Churches / Schools

*“Having a number of females on the department has proven invaluable in recruiting other females, as their visible presence gives immediate hope to others. The same principle applies to ethnic Minorities. Be prepared to answer questions about real or perceived barriers in the testing process.”
Minneapolis Fire Department*

These methods can be very effective when:

1. Target the message and effort to groups at cultural events, not to general audiences.
2. The department, employee minority groups, and IAFF locals sponsor booths at Cultural events during Cinco de Mayo, Martin Luther King Day, and other events.
3. Current employees from each group create their own recruitment plans.
4. Ask employees to represent the department at these events.
5. Relationship building in the community gets you invited to these events as well as others that are less well known.
6. Surveyed departments named Kwanza, Chinese New Year, Fiesta Hispanio, Filipino Festival, Juneteenth, Hmong, and Somalian events and festivals as some they attend and sponsor.



8. Candidate preparation, candidate and employee assistance and mentoring

*This must be inclusive, but can also be targeted so that mentors are matched with others of same ethnicity and gender.
Departments that use CPAT discussed the importance of mentoring women candidates by women employees.*

1. Develop a program to build relationships and offer career preparation, not simply test preparation.
2. Continue mentoring through academy and training to offer support to newly hired firefighters.
3. Mentors can be informal.
4. Assign women and Minorities to work together.
5. Try to hire 2 – 3 women and Minorities at a time in each academy to provide mutual support, mentoring opportunities, etc.
6. Assign women and Minorities to a strong trainer/officer whom you know will not tolerate anti-women or anti-Minority statements.
7. Protect your newly hired firefighters from poor attitudes from others until they are trained and confident.



IAFF Diversity Initiative
Achieving and Retaining a Diverse Fire Service Workforce





IAFF Diversity Initiative Achieving and Retaining a Diverse Fire Service Workforce

Case Studies of Successful Departments

This section highlights the achievements of a few of the surveyed departments. This is not intended to suggest that other departments are not also successful or innovative. In addition, even departments listed below do not represent “perfect” recruiting or results. Recruiting continues to be a challenge for all departments. In addition, Best Practices relate to Recruiting, Selection, Internal Commitment and Policies, as well as other areas of performance. Some departments may be effective in recruiting, but have deficiencies elsewhere in their process. These case studies are presented to demonstrate the types of Best Practices methods and strategies that are successful.



1. Madison, WI

This department has never been under a consent decree. They have over-representation of Blacks, community representation of Hispanics, and very good representation of women. This department is ranked #1 in our sample for excellent diversity for all groups.

What type of recruiting is done?

- *News stories*
- *Advertising in major and local/community newspapers*
- *Ads in newspapers, radio, TV whose audience is Women and Minorities*
- *Ads on Cable TV*
- *Direct mail*
- *Word of Mouth through strong relationships with community groups*
- *Job Fairs*
- *Churches, schools, open houses, and orientation*
- *Department website*

Keys to Success: They make use of their current diversity to continue building on it. They involve current employees in recruiting and formalize word of mouth activities through community organizations. They also continue to use formal methods of advertising to reach all segments of their market. Their website and recruiting materials reinforce the message of valuing diversity.

*They have 25 PT recruiters, 14 are Minorities and/or women
Approximately 1% of budget goes to recruitment*



IAFF Diversity Initiative Achieving and Retaining a Diverse Fire Service Workforce



2. Lansing, MI

This department has never been under a consent decree. They have excellent representation of women, ranking #3 for representation of women with 20% in the department. Most of their ethnic diversity is fairly new - in the last 10 years 42% of their new hires have been protected group members. They acknowledge there is still a long way to go to be representative of the community.

“Hire quality and diversity...after a few years, other employees recognize the world didn’t end...”

What type of recruiting is done?

- *Advertising in major and local/community newspapers*
- *Ads in newspapers, radio, TV whose audience is Women and Minorities*
- *Cadet program*
- *Word of Mouth, small community, recruit in other communities*
- *Relationship with community college provides many applicants*
- *Recruit in other cities*
- *News Stories*
- *Job Fairs*
- *Churches, schools, open houses, and orientation*
- *Department website*

Keys to Success: They have a cooperative union/administration program. They assign mentors to new employees. Employees communicate with candidates, keep them informed. They have current employees act as informal recruiters and teach classes.



IAFF Diversity Initiative Achieving and Retaining a Diverse Fire Service Workforce



3. Minneapolis, MN

This department was under a consent decree to hire ethnic Minorities until 2000. However, their excellent representation of women is due solely to active recruiting. They have continued to build on the success they have, especially with women.

“Candidates are called individually and encouraged to show up for tutoring sessions for both the written and physical test. In addition, a recruiter is available to answer questions.”

What type of recruiting is done?

- *Advertising in major and local/community newspapers*
- *Ads in newspapers, radio, TV whose audience is women and Minorities*
- *Word of Mouth, community events, Women and Minority recruiters*
- *News Stories*
- *Job Fairs*
- *Sporting events, colleges, schools*
- *Department website*

Keys to Success: Participate in many cultural and community events and have current employees attend. Personally contact applicants and provide mentoring for applicants. Conduct aggressive recruiting prior to testing.

They have 1 FT recruiter and 4 others PT.



IAFF Diversity Initiative Achieving and Retaining a Diverse Fire Service Workforce



4. Charlottesville, VA

This department ranks 3rd in Black representation, with a ratio of .83.

“Offer high school students the opportunity to explore these career paths through courses taught at the Tech Center.”

What type of recruiting is done?

- *Advertising in major and local/community newspapers*
- *Test Preparation, Job Fairs, Open House*
- *Cadet program*

Keys to Success: Encourage, support, and provide training for newly hired Minority and Women firefighters. Rigorously enforce harassment policies. Go where Minorities are to recruit; don't expect them to come to you.

7 PT recruiters, includes 5 Women and Minorities.



IAFF Diversity Initiative Achieving and Retaining a Diverse Fire Service Workforce



5. Rochester, NY

They consider the Cadet program to be Very Successful relative to any other method. They sponsor a Firefighter Trainee program with the school district, and they bring graduates right into a recruit class in the department.

“Understand that for women, breaking into what has been traditionally a man’s domain, creates special problems and the need for out of the box solutions.”

What type of recruiting is done?

- *Ads on radio/tv targeting Minorities, PSAs*
- *News Stories*
- *Work with community agencies, community events, job fairs*
- *Cadet program – Trainee program, work with school district*

Keys to Success: Working in the community, ensuring inclusiveness in the organization, recognizing that the organization has to demonstrate its commitment to treating women and Minorities as equals. Getting women to talk to others so they have realistic expectations about the job.

2 FT recruiters who are Minorities.



IAFF Diversity Initiative Achieving and Retaining a Diverse Fire Service Workforce



6. Montgomery County, MD

This department has never been under a consent decree. This department has shown commitment to diversity in their recruitment, selection, and internal commitment efforts. They use a multi-prong approach and commit significant resources.

What type of recruiting is done?

- *Targeted advertising in major and local/community newspapers*
- *Ads in many targeted local newspapers and community papers*
- *Word of Mouth through strong relationships with community groups*
- *Department and other websites*
- *High school cadet program*
- *Individual feedback and contact with candidates throughout process*
- *They administer candidate surveys to track recruitment success*
- *Mentoring program, including CPAT prep for 12 weeks*
- *Use of a written test and oral board process professionally developed and customized for the department to minimize adverse impact*
- *Internal characteristics include mandatory harassment and diversity training, all stations and gear accommodate women, and other efforts*

Keys to Success: They use over 20 different methods of recruiting. They involve current employees in recruiting and formalize word of mouth activities through community organizations. They use extensive formal methods of advertising to reach all segments of their market. They add a personal touch with all candidates to make them feel welcome, including personal notification of their test score. If candidates do not pass the test, they are invited to try again next time.

*They have 1 FT recruiter, 20 PT recruiters, 10 are Minorities and 8 are women
Approximately 1% of budget goes to recruitment*

Finally, words of advice from surveyed departments include being persistent, continuing to work at it, and not giving up. Once your efforts begin to work, success builds on success.

It is critical to track results at **every** stage so that you can evaluate your success accurately. Without this, you will have no way of knowing how to best improve your process or what stages need improvement



IAFF Diversity Initiative
Achieving and Retaining a Diverse Fire Service Workforce

2. Demographics of the Participating Departments

The table presented below shows demographics for the major ethnic Minority groups and for Women that were used as the basis for comparison in this report. The terms Black, Hispanic, Asian, and White are used to match the terms used by the U. S. Census. The term Hispanic is inclusive of Latino, Mexican American, Puerto Rican, Cuban and other. The term Asian is inclusive of Filipino, Pacific Islander, and other Asian. We did collect data regarding other Minority groups, such as Native American and Arab/Middle Eastern, but the numbers are too small to report. Total Minority in this report when we refer to census and similar data usually refers to a combination of Black, Hispanic, and Asian.

Demographics in the US, Fire Service, and study participant departments

	Black	Hispanic	Asian	Women
1. US Census 2000	12.3%	12.5%	3.6%	50.9%
2. Firefighting Profession US Bureau of Labor Statistics	8.4%	8.6%	1.3%	5.1%
3. Average Percent of each group in study Departments	11.8%	8.5%	1.6%	7.8%
4. National Group Ratio - percent representation in the Fire Service compared to representation in the US	.68	.69	.36	.10

The goal of diversity in the Fire Service is for each group to be represented according to the representation in the general population. A comparison of Census data (row 1) with Fire Service data (row 2) shows that all groups are significantly underrepresented in the Fire Service. Using the same type of comparison with the departments in this study shows that *on average*, the representation almost meets or exceeds the national averages for representation in the Fire Service as a whole (row 3). However, the surveyed departments as a group are below the national census numbers. This would suggest that progress has been made in these departments, but there is more work to do. This is a useful comparison to give a general baseline and scope of the problem.

However, using the percent of each group within a department as a measure of success or comparison is not useful to determine the success of each department. It does not take into account the percent of representation in each department’s community. In other words, a department may have 20% Black, but if the community is 60% Black, this is not good



IAFF Diversity Initiative
Achieving and Retaining a Diverse Fire Service Workforce

representation. In order to create a better measure of success, we use a Group Ratio, of department representation divided by community representation.

Group Ratio

Similar to an adverse impact ratio, the closer the ratio is to 1.00, the closer the representation of the target group is to the actual population. Row 4 in the table shows the National Group ratios comparing representation in the Fire Service to representation in the population. Using these ratios, a department showing progress would be one whose group ratios exceed the national Fire Service ratios. For example, a department with a Black ratio between .69 and 1.00 exceeds the national ratio for Blacks in the Fire Service as a whole and comes closer to actual population representation. Likewise, for women, ratios above .10 would demonstrate better than average progress towards Diversity. (For women, either the ratio or percent representation in the department is a valid comparison because women make up about half the population in most communities.)

For the purpose of this analysis, we measured success in the study departments by the percent of Minorities and women represented in the local population based on census data compared to the percent represented in the department.

As the table below shows, the average ratios in the study departments are below the average ratios nationally for Minorities. This is because there are other departments in the US with equal or better representation of Minorities compared to their communities. This study did not identify all departments with good diversity, nor was that the goal of the project. The goal of the project was to identify departments with active and successful recruiting for diversity, whose numbers are expected to improve over time as they continue pursuing their diversity goals.

Study Departments
Average Ratios, and Minimum and Maximum

	Black	Hispanic	Asian	Female	Female %
Mean	.60	.47	.24	.15	7.8%
Minimum (department with the worst ratio)	.11	.00	.00	.01	0%
Maximum (department with the best ratio)	1.5	1.0	.97	.46	24%



IAFF Diversity Initiative Achieving and Retaining a Diverse Fire Service Workforce

The current representation of Minorities and Females in each department is one important measure of success. However, the current snap shot may not reveal how the department is changing or has changed since implementing effective recruiting. This is why even some of the surveyed departments may not have good representation of all groups. Also, the purpose of the study is to identify methods that are more or less effective. Therefore, we included departments with a somewhat limited range of success in order to compare methods between departments.

Women

The US Bureau of Labor statistics (2004) reports that 5.1% (13,668) of firefighters are female in the US. The Women in the Fire Service (WFS) reports a figure of less than half of that (www.wfsi.org, 2005). Depending upon which estimate is used, the department ratios will show more or less progress compared to national. For the purpose of this study, we used the BLS numbers, which sets a higher comparison for the study departments.

The average representation of women in our study departments is 7.8%. This shows that our study departments are exceeding the national average. Some of the study departments exceed the national average very significantly. In fact, many of the surveyed departments have had more success recruiting women than ethnic Minorities.



IAFF Diversity Initiative
Achieving and Retaining a Diverse Fire Service Workforce





IAFF Diversity Initiative Achieving and Retaining a Diverse Fire Service Workforce

3. Correlations with Methods of Recruitment and Group Ratios

How to read the data

CWH conducted several analyses on the survey data. One of the analyses was to simply run correlations between various methods of recruitment and group ratios, indicating diversity success. This and other analyses form the basis for the Key Findings presented earlier.

The attached tables show the correlations between the Group Ratios (that we are using as indicators of success) and each recruitment method. Due to the small sample size ($n = 31$ departments), most of the correlations are not statistically significant. However, this information can be helpful to see the relative effectiveness or usefulness of the 27 different recruitment methods used by surveyed departments. This also shows some other recruitment oriented actions and strategies used by the departments.

The larger the number in the correlation, the stronger the relationship is between the two variables. Positive correlations indicate that departments with better group representation use the particular method. Negative correlations indicate that departments with lower group representation use the method. Correlations greater than .10 or less than -.10 are highlighted as being of some interest. Correlations between .10 and -.10 should be generally ignored. A few correlations are statistically significant and those are shaded. The shaded correlations indicate very strong support for the use of the method.

This analysis used our full sample of 31 departments, and did not make distinctions between more or less successful departments or those with consent decrees.

How to use this data

Please note that we cannot draw cause and effect conclusions from this data. We can use this data to help guide our understanding of recruitment in the context of our literature review and the qualitative data provided by the departments. This information can help in the development of recruitment strategies. All recruitment efforts should be tracked in detail and analyzed by each department to determine their effectiveness over time.

Caution:

In interpreting this data, it is important not to place too much emphasis on any one method or correlation, but to use this as additional information. Keep in mind that most departments use a combination of methods. Also, the nature of and implementation of each method may be different from department to department.



IAFF Diversity Initiative Achieving and Retaining a Diverse Fire Service Workforce

The same table of correlations is presented several times, sorted by each group (Black, Hispanic, Asian, Total Minority, and Female) to make it easy to see results related to specific groups. The Total Minority results are presented for comparison purposes but are generally not as useful or meaningful. The results are washed out by combining across groups, and it is more meaningful to look at what has worked for individual groups.

The correlations are between the group ratio and the Method of recruitment. Each group ratio is the percent of representation in that department compared to the percent of representation in the city or area, similar to an adverse impact ratio. Thus, higher correlations indicate that greater representation is associated with the use of the particular method.

Correlations that are **shaded** are statistically significant and indicate strong support for use of the method. Correlations that are **bolded** are interesting and meaningful, and should be considered and interpreted in with other information.

Each of the following tables sorts the methods by what appears most effective for each group.



IAFF Diversity Initiative Achieving and Retaining a Diverse Fire Service Workforce

1. Correlations with Recruiting Methods - Sorted by Black Ratio

		Black	Hispani c	Asian	Total Minority	White	Female	N
2	Direct Mail Interest Cards Survey item # 2	0.43	0.28	0.23	0.35	-0.24	0.03	31
1	Word of Mouth Survey item # 1	0.34	-0.20	-0.04	0.09	-0.04	0.18	31
7	Radio Ads Survey item # 7	0.18	0.15	-0.18	0.24	-0.11	0.46	31
15	News Stories Survey item # 15	0.16	-0.06	-0.08	-0.09	0.13	0.12	31
16	Dept/City Website Survey item # 16	0.16	-0.29	-0.25	-0.03	0.34	-0.25	31
18	Community Events Survey item # 18	0.15	0.04	0.21	0.00	0.24	0.24	31
3	Newsletter Survey item # 3	0.12	0.14	0.06	0.00	0.01	0.05	31
10	Female Publication Ads Survey item # 10	0.12	0.20	0.18	0.10	-0.15	0.24	31
24	Cadet/Explorer Program Survey item # 24	0.11	-0.17	-0.01	-0.22	-0.01	0.02	31
23	Preparation Assistance Survey item # 23	0.10	-0.15	-0.05	-0.06	-0.08	-0.11	31
9	Cable/Local Access TV Ads Survey item # 9	0.08	-0.03	-0.08	0.01	0.02	0.27	31
6	Ads Local Newspapers Survey item # 6	0.07	-0.06	-0.01	0.08	-0.06	0.41	31
4	Banners Survey item # 4	0.04	0.09	0.18	0.16	0.26	-0.07	31
25	Mentoring Applicants Survey item # 25	0.02	0.02	0.35	-0.20	-0.18	-0.02	31
20	Other Job Fairs Survey item # 20	0.02	-0.26	-0.14	-0.35	-0.06	-0.04	31
5	Ads Major Metro Newspapers Survey item # 5	0.01	-0.04	-0.01	-0.09	-0.02	0.42	31
11	Minority Publication Ads Survey item # 11	0.00	-0.08	0.13	-0.07	-0.01	0.07	31
	Use Assistance/Mentoring Recruitment Strategy	0.00	-0.24	-0.11	-0.29	-0.14	-0.06	31
19	Schools/Com Ctr/Churches Survey item # 19	-0.01	-0.13	0.06	-0.30	0.27	0.15	31
17	Other Website Survey item # 17	-0.02	-0.03	-0.08	-0.24	0.23	0.06	31
13	Minority Radio/TV Ads Survey item # 13	-0.03	0.06	-0.03	-0.11	0.15	0.01	31
14	Public Service Announcements Survey item # 14	-0.03	-0.12	-0.13	-0.02	0.14	0.04	31
27	Test Other Cities Survey item # 27	-0.04	-0.01	-0.10	-0.09	0.19	-0.13	31
21	Open House Survey item # 21	-0.07	-0.17	-0.31	-0.29	0.00	-0.17	31
26	Recruit Other Cities Survey item # 26	-0.10	0.10	0.03	-0.23	-0.04	0.20	31
22	Orientation/Info Session Survey item # 22	-0.12	-0.07	-0.11	-0.14	0.12	-0.12	31
8	Network TV Ads Survey item # 8	-0.15	-0.10	0.02	-0.24	0.05	0.19	31
12	Female Radio/TV Ads Survey item # 12	-0.16	-0.12	0.08	-0.22	0.11	0.14	31



IAFF Diversity Initiative Achieving and Retaining a Diverse Fire Service Workforce



1. Correlations with Recruiting Methods - Sorted by Black Ratio (Continued)

Other Recruitment related activities that Impact Diversity		Black	Hispani c	Asian	Total Minority	White	Female	N
Q143	Is Test prep offered?	0.27	0.07	-0.15	0.17	0.16	0.07	31
Q149	Is test preparation geared for minorities?	0.21	0.15	0.15	0.00	-0.11	0.35	22
	Newspaper or Publication Recruitment Strategy	0.13	0.00	0.05	0.15	-0.11	0.45	31
Q147	Is test prep geared for women?	0.12	0.04	0.11	-0.09	-0.09	0.39	22
	TV or Radio Recruitment Strategy	0.06	0.06	-0.08	0.12	0.11	0.25	31
	Number of Newspaper & Publication Recruitment Efforts	0.06	0.01	0.09	0.00	-0.07	0.33	31
	Number of TV and Radio Recruitment Efforts	-0.02	-0.01	-0.06	-0.08	0.06	0.31	31
Q126	Recruitment targets women	-0.03	-0.01	0.03	-0.05	-0.03	0.11	31
Q127	Recruitment targets minorities	-0.04	-0.02	0.01	-0.13	0.08	0.06	31
Q194	Mentoring program?	-0.07	0.18	0.07	0.01	-0.17	-0.15	31



IAFF Diversity Initiative Achieving and Retaining a Diverse Fire Service Workforce

2. Correlations with Recruiting Methods - Sorted by Hispanic Ratio

		Black	Hispani c	Asian	Total Minority	White	Female	N
2	Direct Mail Interest Cards Survey item # 2	0.43	0.28	0.23	0.35	-0.24	0.03	31
10	Female Publication Ads Survey item # 10	0.12	0.20	0.18	0.10	-0.15	0.24	31
7	Radio Ads Survey item # 7	0.18	0.15	-0.18	0.24	-0.11	0.46	31
3	Newsletter Survey item # 3	0.12	0.14	0.06	0.00	0.01	0.05	31
26	Recruit Other Cities Survey item # 26	-0.10	0.10	0.03	-0.23	-0.04	0.20	31
4	Banners Survey item # 4	0.04	0.09	0.18	0.16	0.26	-0.07	31
13	Minority Radio/TV Ads Survey item # 13	-0.03	0.06	-0.03	-0.11	0.15	0.01	31
18	Community Events Survey item # 18	0.15	0.04	0.21	0.00	0.24	0.24	31
25	Mentoring Applicants Survey item # 25	0.02	0.02	0.35	-0.20	-0.18	-0.02	31
27	Test Other Cities Survey item # 27	-0.04	-0.01	-0.10	-0.09	0.19	-0.13	31
17	Other Website Survey item # 17	-0.02	-0.03	-0.08	-0.24	0.23	0.06	31
9	Cable/Local Access TV Ads Survey item # 9	0.08	-0.03	-0.08	0.01	0.02	0.27	31
5	Ads Major Metro Newspapers Survey item # 5	0.01	-0.04	-0.01	-0.09	-0.02	0.42	31
6	Ads Local Newspapers Survey item # 6	0.07	-0.06	-0.01	0.08	-0.06	0.41	31
15	News Stories Survey item # 15	0.16	-0.06	-0.08	-0.09	0.13	0.12	31
22	Orientation/Info Session Survey item # 22	-0.12	-0.07	-0.11	-0.14	0.12	-0.12	31
11	Minority Publication Ads Survey item # 11	0.00	-0.08	0.13	-0.07	-0.01	0.07	31
8	Network TV Ads Survey item # 8	-0.15	-0.10	0.02	-0.24	0.05	0.19	31
14	Public Service Announcements Survey item # 14	-0.03	-0.12	-0.13	-0.02	0.14	0.04	31
12	Female Radio/TV Ads Survey item # 12	-0.16	-0.12	0.08	-0.22	0.11	0.14	31
19	Schools/Com Ctr/Churches Survey item # 19	-0.01	-0.13	0.06	-0.30	0.27	0.15	31
23	Preparation Assistance Survey item # 23	0.10	-0.15	-0.05	-0.06	-0.08	-0.11	31
24	Cadet/Explorer Program Survey item # 24	0.11	-0.17	-0.01	-0.22	-0.01	0.02	31
21	Open House Survey item # 21	-0.07	-0.17	-0.31	-0.29	0.00	-0.17	31
1	Word of Mouth Survey item # 1	0.34	-0.20	-0.04	0.09	-0.04	0.18	31
	Use Assistance/Mentoring Recruitment Strategy	0.00	-0.24	-0.11	-0.29	-0.14	-0.06	31
20	Other Job Fairs Survey item # 20	0.02	-0.26	-0.14	-0.35	-0.06	-0.04	31
16	Dept/City Website Survey item # 16	0.16	-0.29	-0.25	-0.03	0.34	-0.25	31



IAFF Diversity Initiative Achieving and Retaining a Diverse Fire Service Workforce

2. Correlations with Recruiting Methods - Sorted by Hispanic Ratio (Continued)

Other Recruitment related activities that Impact Diversity		Black	Hispanic	Asian	Total Minority	White	Female	N
Q194	Q194 - Mentoring program?	-0.07	0.18	0.07	0.01	-0.17	-0.15	31
Q149	Q149 - Is test preparation geared for minorities?	0.21	0.15	0.15	0.00	-0.11	0.35	22
Q143	Q143 - Is Test prep offered?	0.27	0.07	-0.15	0.17	0.16	0.07	31
	Use TV or Radio Recruitment Strategy	0.06	0.06	-0.08	0.12	0.11	0.25	31
Q147	Q147 - Is test prep geared for women?	0.12	0.04	0.11	-0.09	-0.09	0.39	22
	Number of Newspaper & Publication Recruitment Efforts	0.06	0.01	0.09	0.00	-0.07	0.33	31
	Use Newspaper or Publication Recruitment Strategy	0.13	0.00	0.05	0.15	-0.11	0.45	31
	Number of TV and Radio Recruitment Efforts	-0.02	-0.01	-0.06	-0.08	0.06	0.31	31
Q126	Q126 - Recruitment targets women	-0.03	-0.01	0.03	-0.05	-0.03	0.11	31
Q127	Q127 - Recruitment targets minorities	-0.04	-0.02	0.01	-0.13	0.08	0.06	31



IAFF Diversity Initiative Achieving and Retaining a Diverse Fire Service Workforce

3. Correlations with Recruiting Methods - Sorted by Asian Ratio

	Use of Recruitment Methods that impact Diversity	Black	Hispani c	Asian	Total Minority	White	Female	N
25	Mentoring Applicants Survey item # 25	0.02	0.02	0.35	-0.20	-0.18	-0.02	31
2	Direct Mail Interest Cards Survey item # 2	0.43	0.28	0.23	0.35	-0.24	0.03	31
18	Community Events Survey item # 18	0.15	0.04	0.21	0.00	0.24	0.24	31
10	Female Publication Ads Survey item # 10	0.12	0.20	0.18	0.10	-0.15	0.24	31
4	Banners Survey item # 4	0.04	0.09	0.18	0.16	0.26	-0.07	31
11	Minority Publication Ads Survey item # 11	0.00	-0.08	0.13	-0.07	-0.01	0.07	31
12	Female Radio/TV Ads Survey item # 12	-0.16	-0.12	0.08	-0.22	0.11	0.14	31
3	Newsletter Survey item # 3	0.12	0.14	0.06	0.00	0.01	0.05	31
19	Schools/Com Ctr/Churches Survey item # 19	-0.01	-0.13	0.06	-0.30	0.27	0.15	31
26	Recruit Other Cities Survey item # 26	-0.10	0.10	0.03	-0.23	-0.04	0.20	31
8	Network TV Ads Survey item # 8	-0.15	-0.10	0.02	-0.24	0.05	0.19	31
24	Cadet/Explorer Program Survey item # 24	0.11	-0.17	-0.01	-0.22	-0.01	0.02	31
5	Ads Major Metro Newspapers Survey item # 5	0.01	-0.04	-0.01	-0.09	-0.02	0.42	31
6	Ads Local Newspapers Survey item # 6	0.07	-0.06	-0.01	0.08	-0.06	0.41	31
13	Minority Radio/TV Ads Survey item # 13	-0.03	0.06	-0.03	-0.11	0.15	0.01	31
1	Word of Mouth Survey item # 1	0.34	-0.20	-0.04	0.09	-0.04	0.18	31
23	Preparation Assistance Survey item # 23	0.10	-0.15	-0.05	-0.06	-0.08	-0.11	31
15	News Stories Survey item # 15	0.16	-0.06	-0.08	-0.09	0.13	0.12	31
17	Other Website Survey item # 17	-0.02	-0.03	-0.08	-0.24	0.23	0.06	31
9	Cable/Local Access TV Ads Survey item # 9	0.08	-0.03	-0.08	0.01	0.02	0.27	31
27	Test Other Cities Survey item # 27	-0.04	-0.01	-0.10	-0.09	0.19	-0.13	31
	Use Assistance/Mentoring Recruitment Strategy	0.00	-0.24	-0.11	-0.29	-0.14	-0.06	31
22	Orientation/Info Session Survey item # 22	-0.12	-0.07	-0.11	-0.14	0.12	-0.12	31
14	Public Service Announcements Survey item # 14	-0.03	-0.12	-0.13	-0.02	0.14	0.04	31
20	Other Job Fairs Survey item # 20	0.02	-0.26	-0.14	-0.35	-0.06	-0.04	31
7	Radio Ads Survey item # 7	0.18	0.15	-0.18	0.24	-0.11	0.46	31
16	Dept/City Website Survey item # 16	0.16	-0.29	-0.25	-0.03	0.34	-0.25	31
21	Open House Survey item # 21	-0.07	-0.17	-0.31	-0.29	0.00	-0.17	31



IAFF Diversity Initiative Achieving and Retaining a Diverse Fire Service Workforce

3. Correlations with Recruiting Methods - Sorted by Asian Ratio (Continued)

Other Recruitment related activities that Impact Diversity		Black	Hispani c	Asian	Total Minority	White	Female	N
Q149	Q149 - Is test preparation geared for minorities?	0.21	0.15	0.15	0.00	-0.11	0.35	22
Q147	Q147 - Is test prep geared for women?	0.12	0.04	0.11	-0.09	-0.09	0.39	22
	Number of Newspaper & Publication Recruitment Efforts	0.06	0.01	0.09	0.00	-0.07	0.33	31
Q194	Q194 - Mentoring program?	-0.07	0.18	0.07	0.01	-0.17	-0.15	31
	Use Newspaper or Publication Recruitment Strategy	0.13	0.00	0.05	0.15	-0.11	0.45	31
Q126	Q126 - Recruitment targets women	-0.03	-0.01	0.03	-0.05	-0.03	0.11	31
Q127	Q127 - Recruitment targets minorities	-0.04	-0.02	0.01	-0.13	0.08	0.06	31
	Number of TV and Radio Recruitment Efforts	-0.02	-0.01	-0.06	-0.08	0.06	0.31	31
	Use TV or Radio Recruitment Strategy	0.06	0.06	-0.08	0.12	0.11	0.25	31
Q143	Q143 - Is Test prep offered?	0.27	0.07	-0.15	0.17	0.16	0.07	31



IAFF Diversity Initiative Achieving and Retaining a Diverse Fire Service Workforce

4. Correlations with Recruiting Methods - Sorted by Total Minority Ratio

		Black	Hispani c	Asian	Total Minority	White	Female	N
2	Direct Mail Interest Cards Survey item # 2	0.43	0.28	0.23	0.35	-0.24	0.03	31
7	Radio Ads Survey item # 7	0.18	0.15	-0.18	0.24	-0.11	0.46	31
4	Banners Survey item # 4	0.04	0.09	0.18	0.16	0.26	-0.07	31
10	Female Publication Ads Survey item # 10	0.12	0.20	0.18	0.10	-0.15	0.24	31
1	Word of Mouth Survey item # 1	0.34	-0.20	-0.04	0.09	-0.04	0.18	31
6	Ads Local Newspapers Survey item # 6	0.07	-0.06	-0.01	0.08	-0.06	0.41	31
9	Cable/Local Access TV Ads Survey item # 9	0.08	-0.03	-0.08	0.01	0.02	0.27	31
18	Community Events Survey item # 18	0.15	0.04	0.21	0.00	0.24	0.24	31
3	Newsletter Survey item # 3	0.12	0.14	0.06	0.00	0.01	0.05	31
14	Public Service Announcements Survey item # 14	-0.03	-0.12	-0.13	-0.02	0.14	0.04	31
16	Dept/City Website Survey item # 16	0.16	-0.29	-0.25	-0.03	0.34	-0.25	31
23	Preparation Assistance Survey item # 23	0.10	-0.15	-0.05	-0.06	-0.08	-0.11	31
11	Minority Publication Ads Survey item # 11	0.00	-0.08	0.13	-0.07	-0.01	0.07	31
27	Test Other Cities Survey item # 27	-0.04	-0.01	-0.10	-0.09	0.19	-0.13	31
5	Ads Major Metro Newspapers Survey item # 5	0.01	-0.04	-0.01	-0.09	-0.02	0.42	31
15	News Stories Survey item # 15	0.16	-0.06	-0.08	-0.09	0.13	0.12	31
13	Minority Radio/TV Ads Survey item # 13	-0.03	0.06	-0.03	-0.11	0.15	0.01	31
22	Orientation/Info Session Survey item # 22	-0.12	-0.07	-0.11	-0.14	0.12	-0.12	31
25	Mentoring Applicants Survey item # 25	0.02	0.02	0.35	-0.20	-0.18	-0.02	31
24	Cadet/Explorer Program Survey item # 24	0.11	-0.17	-0.01	-0.22	-0.01	0.02	31
12	Female Radio/TV Ads Survey item # 12	-0.16	-0.12	0.08	-0.22	0.11	0.14	31
26	Recruit Other Cities Survey item # 26	-0.10	0.10	0.03	-0.23	-0.04	0.20	31
17	Other Website Survey item # 17	-0.02	-0.03	-0.08	-0.24	0.23	0.06	31
8	Network TV Ads Survey item # 8	-0.15	-0.10	0.02	-0.24	0.05	0.19	31
21	Open House Survey item # 21	-0.07	-0.17	-0.31	-0.29	0.00	-0.17	31
	Use Assistance/Mentoring Recruitment Strategy	0.00	-0.24	-0.11	-0.29	-0.14	-0.06	31
19	Schools/Com Ctr/Churches Survey item # 19	-0.01	-0.13	0.06	-0.30	0.27	0.15	31
20	Other Job Fairs Survey item # 20	0.02	-0.26	-0.14	-0.35	-0.06	-0.04	31



IAFF Diversity Initiative Achieving and Retaining a Diverse Fire Service Workforce



4. Correlations with Recruiting Methods - Sorted by Total Minority Ratio (Continued)

Other Recruitment related activities that Impact Diversity		Black	Hispani c	Asian	Total Minority	White	Female	N
Q143	Q143 - Is Test prep offered?	0.27	0.07	-0.15	0.17	0.16	0.07	31
	Use Newspaper or Publication Recruitment Strategy	0.13	0.00	0.05	0.15	-0.11	0.45	31
	Use TV or Radio Recruitment Strategy	0.06	0.06	-0.08	0.12	0.11	0.25	31
Q194	Q194 - Mentoring program?	-0.07	0.18	0.07	0.01	-0.17	-0.15	31
	Number of Newspaper & Publication Recruitment Efforts	0.06	0.01	0.09	0.00	-0.07	0.33	31
Q149	Q149 - Is test preparation geared for minorities?	0.21	0.15	0.15	0.00	-0.11	0.35	22
Q126	Q126 - Recruitment targets women	-0.03	-0.01	0.03	-0.05	-0.03	0.11	31
	Number of TV and Radio Recruitment Efforts	-0.02	-0.01	-0.06	-0.08	0.06	0.31	31
Q147	Q147 - Is test prep geared for women?	0.12	0.04	0.11	-0.09	-0.09	0.39	22
Q127	Q127 - Recruitment targets minorities	-0.04	-0.02	0.01	-0.13	0.08	0.06	31



IAFF Diversity Initiative Achieving and Retaining a Diverse Fire Service Workforce

5. Correlations with Recruiting Methods - Sorted by Female Ratio

	Use of Recruitment Methods that Impact Diversity	Black	Hispanic	Asian	Total Minority	White	Female	N
7	Radio Ads Survey item # 7	0.18	0.15	-0.18	0.24	-0.11	0.46	31
5	Ads Major Metro Newspapers Survey item # 5	0.01	-0.04	-0.01	-0.09	-0.02	0.42	31
6	Ads Local Newspapers Survey item # 6	0.07	-0.06	-0.01	0.08	-0.06	0.41	31
9	Cable/Local Access TV Ads Survey item # 9	0.08	-0.03	-0.08	0.01	0.02	0.27	31
18	Community Events Survey item # 18	0.15	0.04	0.21	0.00	0.24	0.24	31
10	Female Publication Ads Survey item # 10	0.12	0.20	0.18	0.10	-0.15	0.24	31
26	Recruit Other Cities Survey item # 26	-0.10	0.10	0.03	-0.23	-0.04	0.20	31
8	Network TV Ads Survey item # 8	-0.15	-0.10	0.02	-0.24	0.05	0.19	31
1	Word of Mouth Survey item # 1	0.34	-0.20	-0.04	0.09	-0.04	0.18	31
19	Schools/Com Ctr/Churches Survey item # 19	-0.01	-0.13	0.06	-0.30	0.27	0.15	31
12	Female Radio/TV Ads Survey item # 12	-0.16	-0.12	0.08	-0.22	0.11	0.14	31
15	News Stories Survey item # 15	0.16	-0.06	-0.08	-0.09	0.13	0.12	31
11	Minority Publication Ads Survey item # 11	0.00	-0.08	0.13	-0.07	-0.01	0.07	31
17	Other Website Survey item # 17	-0.02	-0.03	-0.08	-0.24	0.23	0.06	31
3	Newsletter Survey item # 3	0.12	0.14	0.06	0.00	0.01	0.05	31
14	Public Service Announcements Survey item # 14	-0.03	-0.12	-0.13	-0.02	0.14	0.04	31
2	Direct Mail Interest Cards Survey item # 2	0.43	0.28	0.23	0.35	-0.24	0.03	31
24	Cadet/Explorer Program Survey item # 24	0.11	-0.17	-0.01	-0.22	-0.01	0.02	31
13	Minority Radio/TV Ads Survey item # 13	-0.03	0.06	-0.03	-0.11	0.15	0.01	31
25	Mentoring Applicants Survey item # 25	0.02	0.02	0.35	-0.20	-0.18	-0.02	31
20	Other Job Fairs Survey item # 20	0.02	-0.26	-0.14	-0.35	-0.06	-0.04	31
	Use Assistance/Mentoring Recruitment Strategy	0.00	-0.24	-0.11	-0.29	-0.14	-0.06	31
4	Banners Survey item # 4	0.04	0.09	0.18	0.16	0.26	-0.07	31
23	Preparation Assistance Survey item # 23	0.10	-0.15	-0.05	-0.06	-0.08	-0.11	31
22	Orientation/Info Session Survey item # 22	-0.12	-0.07	-0.11	-0.14	0.12	-0.12	31
27	Test Other Cities Survey item # 27	-0.04	-0.01	-0.10	-0.09	0.19	-0.13	31
21	Open House Survey item # 21	-0.07	-0.17	-0.31	-0.29	0.00	-0.17	31
16	Dept/City Website Survey item # 16	0.16	-0.29	-0.25	-0.03	0.34	-0.25	31



IAFF Diversity Initiative Achieving and Retaining a Diverse Fire Service Workforce

5. Correlations with Recruiting Methods - Sorted by Female Ratio (Continued)

Other Recruitment related activities that affect Diversity		Black	Hisp	Asian	Total Minority	White	Female	N
	Use Newspaper or Publication Recruitment Strategy	0.13	0.00	0.05	0.15	-0.11	0.45	31
Q147	Q147 - Is test prep geared for women?	0.12	0.04	0.11	-0.09	-0.09	0.39	22
Q149	Q149 - Is test preparation geared for minorities?	0.21	0.15	0.15	0.00	-0.11	0.35	22
	Number of Newspaper & Publication Recruitment Efforts	0.06	0.01	0.09	0.00	-0.07	0.33	31
	Number of TV and Radio Recruitment Efforts	-0.02	-0.01	-0.06	-0.08	0.06	0.31	31
	Use TV or Radio Recruitment Strategy	0.06	0.06	-0.08	0.12	0.11	0.25	31
Q126	Q126 - Recruitment targets women	-0.03	-0.01	0.03	-0.05	-0.03	0.11	31
Q143	Q143 - Is Test prep offered?	0.27	0.07	-0.15	0.17	0.16	0.07	31
Q127	Q127 - Recruitment targets minorities	-0.04	-0.02	0.01	-0.13	0.08	0.06	31
Q194	Q194 - Mentoring program?	-0.07	0.18	0.07	0.01	-0.17	-0.15	31



IAFF Diversity Initiative

Achieving and Retaining a Diverse Fire Service Workforce



4. Department Characteristics and Policies that Impact Diversity

Research suggests that many factors influence recruiting and diversity success, other than recruiting method. The CWH comprehensive survey collected data on Selection, Retention, Training, and Diversity Commitment policies in addition to recruitment methods.

The table below shows correlations with the Group Ratios (that indicate greater diversity success) and other various policies. Statistically significant correlations are shaded. Stronger relationships have been **bolded**.

Selection Policies

			Blac k	Hispani c	Asia n	Total Minority	Whit e	Female	N
Q32	Dept provides patient transport		0.32	0.34	0.28	0.33	-0.31	0.43	31
Q35	Offer Incentive Pay for EMS certification (rather than requiring it at hire)		0.14	0.47	0.25	0.26	-0.35	0.50	31
Q60	Require more than a High School Diploma		-0.26	0.06	-0.22	-0.16	0.32	-0.13	32
Q62	Hire both Certified and Non Certified Firefighters (if need some to be certified at hire)		0.14	0.04	-0.09	0.12	0.04	-0.04	31
Q63	Hire from Separate lists for certified & non certified Firefighters (if need some certified at hire)		0.21	0.37	0.03	0.32	-0.23	0.19	26
Q64	Hire Both Paramedics and Non Paramedics (if need more Paramedics)		0.01	-0.21	-0.31	-0.09	0.05	-0.30	31
Q65	Hire Paramedics from Separate list (if need more Paramedics)		-0.06	0.14	0.27	0.00	-0.01	0.42	29
Q97	Preference Points Given for Veteran's, City Residence, Prior Experience, City employee, etc.		0.08	0.07	-0.07	-0.02	0.04	-0.21	34
Q98	Accept applications continuously, have open recruitment		-0.29	0.04	-0.07	-0.22	0.29	-0.13	31
Q99	Test frequently or have on-going testing		-0.18	-0.03	0.02	-0.14	0.23	0.05	31
Q147	Test preparation class or program targets women (especially PAT)		0.12	0.04	0.11	-0.09	-0.09	0.39	22
Q149	Test preparation class or program targets minorities		0.21	0.15	0.15	0.00	-0.11	0.35	22
Q141	Have personal contact with candidates other than at the test administration		0.08	0.13	-0.02	-0.12	-0.03	0.22	30



IAFF Diversity Initiative
Achieving and Retaining a Diverse Fire Service Workforce

Diversity Commitment, Message, and Values

			Blac k	Hispani c	Asia n	Total Minority	Whit e	Female	N
Q200	Encourage Official or Unofficial Organizations/Groups based on race, gender, etc.		0.65	0.31	0.30	0.49	-0.16	0.06	31
Q180	Diversity Message Communicated in Department Mission		0.41	0.24	0.14	0.34	-0.19	0.51	29
Q182	Develop a Specific & Formal Diversity Plan		0.23	0.01	-0.02	-0.02	0.13	0.20	29
Q183	Specifically Refer to Types of Diversity in Statements/Plans (such as race, gender, sexual orientation, etc.)		0.10	0.38	0.23	0.11	0.10	0.42	26
Q185	Develop and enforce Specific Harassment Policies Based on race, sexual harassment, sexual orientation, etc.		0.01	0.30	0.32	0.06	-0.15	0.30	28

Other Recruitment Issues & Policies

			Blac k	Hispani c	Asia n	Total Minority	Whit e	Female	N
Q139	Provide Detail about process in the Recruitment Message		0.28	0.08	0.11	0.03	-0.05	0.11	31
Q140	Provide Detail about department values in the Diversity Message		0.22	0.17	-0.01	0.02	-0.30	0.06	30



IAFF Diversity Initiative Achieving and Retaining a Diverse Fire Service Workforce

Conclusions

- 1 Requiring certifications for firefighter, EMS, or Paramedic **decreases** or limits diversity. Some surveyed departments have dealt with this issue by using two different lists, and hiring from the certified list to maintain minimum required numbers. Other non certified employees are allowed time after hire to obtain necessary certifications or are provided training.
- 2 Having continuous and open application periods and continuous testing **decreases** diversity. This may be because this decreases the recruitment effort that normally would occur right before testing when departments test on an annual or bi-annual cycle. Most departments would not be able to maintain the necessary level of recruiting effort continuously.
- 3 Having personal contact with candidates during the recruiting period, including offering preparation classes is very **helpful**. Preparation classes should be inclusive and open to all candidates if possible. Ensure that the classes are not filled up with candidates referred by current employees and do not include adequate numbers of your targeted groups.
- 4 The communication about the department's diversity and inclusion intent and commitment is **critical**. For retaining Minorities and Women, and for using the current employees to recruit others, the enforcement of harassment policies is also **critical**.
- 5 Providing detail about the job, the process, and the department's values is **important**.
- 6 Preference points may either **help or hurt** diversity. Generally, preference points for city residence or city employment will **help** Minorities when representation is high in the city. Giving Veteran's points will **hurt** women. Giving preference for prior experience **decreases** diversity.



IAFF Diversity Initiative
Achieving and Retaining a Diverse Fire Service Workforce





IAFF Diversity Initiative Achieving and Retaining a Diverse Fire Service Workforce

5. Comparison of “Top 10” departments to others

Even among the surveyed departments, all of which do some active and effective recruiting, there are differences in recruiting methods used and results achieved. We divided our departments into 3 groups for further statistical analysis for comparison purposes. Departments that had been under a consent decree in the recent past were *excluded* (n = 7). Although the participant departments that have been under a consent decree are doing very innovative and active recruiting; they began with a great advantage in their diversity that would skew this comparison.

The groups are:

- 1 Top 10 Most Successful Departments (Rated in terms of successful in recruiting total Minorities)
- 2 Middle 8 Moderately Successful Departments
- 3 Remaining 5 Less Successful Departments

Similarities and Differences in Recruitment Methods used by surveyed Departments:

- 1 All of the departments use many different methods. That is, they do not rely on just a few methods to recruit.
- 2 Almost all of the departments use a combination of Traditional and Innovative recruiting methods and approaches.
- 3 The Top 10 departments in our sample (Most Successful) use more Innovative (and targeted) approaches than the other departments.
- 4 The Middle 8 departments (Moderately Successful) use some Innovative methods, but rely more on Traditional methods.
- 5 The bottom 5 departments (Less Successful) rely more on Traditional methods and approaches.



IAFF Diversity Initiative Achieving and Retaining a Diverse Fire Service Workforce



Finding #1

Our Top 10 Most Successful departments use more methods in combination than our Moderately successful departments.

- 1 Top 10 departments use an average of 6 and up to 9 of the most Innovative methods.
- 2 Moderately Successful departments use an average of 3 and up to 6 of the Innovative methods.



Finding #2

What are the most effective recruiting methods?

- 1 Minority Radio/TV Ads
- 2 Direct Mail Interest Cards
- 3 Minority Publication Ads
- 4 News Stories
- 5 Female Radio/TV Ads
- 6 Cadet/Explorer Program
- 7 Mentoring Applicants
- 8 Word of Mouth is used very effectively when there is diversity in the department on which to build!

- All of these methods are used in combination with targeting the desired group.
- Each of these methods is used by over half of the top 10 departments.
- The Top 10 departments use these methods more than our other departments.
- These methods are more effective because they seem to target the desired group more directly.



IAFF Diversity Initiative Achieving and Retaining a Diverse Fire Service Workforce



Finding #3

What are other effective recruiting methods used by our Moderately Successful departments?

- 1 Community Events
- 2 Job Fairs
- 3 Ads Local Newspapers
- 4 Ads Major Metro Newspapers
- 5 Radio Ads
- 6 Network TV Ads
- 7 Cable/Local Access TV
- 8 Female Publication Ads
- 9 Public Service Announcements

- These are additional methods used somewhat successfully.
- All departments use some of these methods.
- Our Moderately Successful group uses these methods more than the most effective methods used by the Top 10 group.
- The major difference between these methods and the methods used by the Top 10 is that these methods are not as targeted. They reach a more general audience.



IAFF Diversity Initiative Achieving and Retaining a Diverse Fire Service Workforce



Finding #4

What are the Least Effective recruiting methods for increasing Diversity?

- 1 Word of Mouth – This is only effective if there is some diversity in the department to attract and refer other diversity, and if it is planned and formalized.
 - 2 Dept/City Website – This is a method to reinforce your diversity message and to provide recruiting information. It is not effective to recruit if the candidate does not know about you.
 - 3 Schools/Community Centers/Churches – Attending events or making isolated presentations is less effective. Working with community groups and building relationships is effective.
 - 4 Assistance/mentoring – Offering short term classes for test preparation immediately prior to testing is traditional, but not effective for recruiting larger numbers of Minorities and females. Many of these programs enroll more white men than other groups.
 - 5 Open House – Same comments as for word of mouth. This typically engages candidates who already know about your organization.
 - 6 Other Website – Same comments as for Department Website.
 - 7 Orientation/Info Session – Same comments as for Assistance/Mentoring.
- These are very common methods used by most departments.
 - Without planning and effort they likely reach Non Minorities more than Minorities unless they are targeted and structured.
 - They reach men & women equally, but may not appeal to women unless a targeted approach is used.
 - They are “minimum” efforts that are more traditional. Effectiveness varies.



IAFF Diversity Initiative Achieving and Retaining a Diverse Fire Service Workforce



Finding #5

There are differences in which methods are more effective for different groups.

Some of the Most Successful Recruitment Efforts for Blacks

- Cadet/Explorer Program
- Direct Mail
- Radio Ads
- Ads in Minority Publications
- Cable/Local Access TV Ads
- Community Events
- Mentoring
- Orientation/Information Sessions

Some of the Most Successful Recruitment Efforts for Hispanics

- Cadet/Explorer Program
- Radio Ads
- Ads in Minority Publications
- Cable/Local Access TV Ads
- Community Events
- Mentoring
- Job Fairs
- Minority Radio Ads
- Orientation/Information Sessions

Some of the Most Successful Recruitment Efforts for women

- Cadet/Explorer Program
- Radio / TV Ads on stations targeting women
- Ads in Major and Minority Publications
- Radio Ads
- Job Fairs
- Orientation/Information Sessions
- Formal advertising in different media is very effective for women!



IAFF Diversity Initiative
Achieving and Retaining a Diverse Fire Service Workforce





IAFF Diversity Initiative
Achieving and Retaining a Diverse Fire Service Workforce





IAFF Diversity Initiative Achieving and Retaining a Diverse Fire Service Workforce



6. Obstacles to Diversity

Diversity recruitment requires a recognition of the need to diversify, an awareness of effective methods, a commitment to a program and strategies, and the assignment of resources. As we conducted the second phase of our study: interviews with IAFF Local Presidents, Recruiters, Chief Officers, Human Resources personnel, and others in various departments around the country, we learned why many departments do not have any recruitment programs in place, and especially not for diversity recruitment. Over half of the departments initially nominated to participate in the study of Best Practices used, self-selected out of providing information because they did not believe that their department actually does effective recruiting.

Most of the people we interviewed in the departments that self selected out of the survey believe that diversity is decreasing in the Fire Service, not increasing. At least that is true in their own departments, and it is predicted for the country, especially with upcoming retirements and the end of many consent decrees and Affirmative Action initiatives put in place in the 70's and 80's.

The comments received during these brief interviews inform us about some of the problems with Recruitment, Selection, and Retention in the Fire Service. This section highlights some of the major obstacles in achieving diversity.



IAFF Diversity Initiative Achieving and Retaining a Diverse Fire Service Workforce



Obstacle 1. Being passive or defeatist about the problem. CWH has worked with departments who believe that being challenged legally and forced into a consent decree is a more realistic option or achievable goal than actually solving the problem. Unfortunately, consent decrees end, and they can have strong and lasting negative impacts. If the recruiting and selection process has not been corrected, the problem repeats itself as firefighters retire.

Our literature review also shows that people hired under an affirmative action plan may have a stigma attached to them for their entire careers (Heilman, Block, & Lucas, 1992). Another study reported that some Blacks withdraw from the selection process if there is a perception of favoritism towards Blacks, rather than deal with the stigma for the duration of their careers (Schmit & Ryan, 1997).

Seven (over 20%) of the surveyed departments had been under consent decrees at some time in the past.

This situation can be a catalyst for change, as is the case with our surveyed departments, or it can be a temporary relief that eventually reverts back to the conditions that caused the legal action.

Three other departments in the original 80+ are currently or were also under consent decrees, but they have not appeared to have implemented corrective policies.

“We are currently representative of the community because of a consent decree, but it ended 9 years ago. In the past 8 years, we have hired 2 Blacks and 1 Hispanic.”

Interview respondent, medium sized department in the Midwest

“We are under a consent decree until 2007. There is no incentive to recruit, so we don’t. If 30% of Minorities pass the test, the recruit class must be 30% minority. The union President has pushed for year-round recruitment and training/preparation for candidates, but this has fallen on deaf ears.”

Interview respondent, medium-large department in the Midwest



IAFF Diversity Initiative
Achieving and Retaining a Diverse Fire Service Workforce



Obstacle 2. The selection process does not measure the most important skills and abilities. Tests that do not measure a wide range of appropriate and important skills and characteristics will screen out quality and diversity.

43% of the surveyed departments use a written test validated for their department, and another 25% have done a transportability study.

“Diversity is lessening every day. We used to be on a 2 list system, and it may go back to that soon. Recruitment efforts have not been successful in getting Minorities to apply – and those who do have a hard time passing the test. Our union and management have a good relationship and we all realize we have a problem.”

Interview respondent – medium department in the Midwest

“We are not representative of the community and never will be with the current test. The current PAT focuses on upper body strength, not aerobic capacity. We are getting bulky men in worse shape than our incumbents.”

Interview respondent – medium - large department in the South



IAFF Diversity Initiative Achieving and Retaining a Diverse Fire Service Workforce



Obstacle 3. The selection process requires education, certification, or prior experience that limits diversity. This is often used to reduce the applicant pool or to address a specific need in the department. However, this decreases diversity significantly and has effects that last for up to 30 years.

In separate CWH recruitment surveys administered to candidates in 4 large NE departments, 56% of Whites had previous experience (volunteer or paid), compared to 21% of Blacks. 49% of Whites had FF1 certification, compared to only 17% of Blacks. The same trend is true of men compared to women.

*None of the surveyed departments require prior experience.
83% do not require FF1 certification until after hire.
74% do not require EMT-B until after hire.*

“Our representation does not match our community. We now require fire academy graduation and college courses. Our department pays lip service to diversity, but we do not do anything to achieve it.”

Interview respondent, medium department in the West

“Our department is mostly White males. Our community is 70% – 80% Black and Hispanic. Candidates must be paramedics to apply, but our community is very impoverished, and it is unlikely that we will be able to recruit from our community.”

Interview respondent – small department in the Midwest

“We are lacking in diversity. The last minority we hired was 15 years ago. We used to be known for hiring women, but that is going down too. We look for people with volunteer experience. We do not do any real recruiting.”

Interview respondent- small department in the West



IAFF Diversity Initiative
Achieving and Retaining a Diverse Fire Service Workforce



Obstacle 4. Not knowing how to reach the desired groups effectively.

The literature review and our surveyed departments show that recruiting should be focused on the desired group with a message of inclusiveness. It should put forth a strong message about why the career of firefighting is beneficial for them. Also, having women and Minority recruiters may help, as well as showing diversity in the recruitment materials.

“We have traveled around the country to recruit women, but efforts have not been successful.”

Interview respondent - medium department in the Northwest

“We are lacking in diversity. The last few recruit classes haven’t had any women. The last class of 32 had 1 Minority. Our recruitment efforts, including ads in Minority publications and having a booth at the library in Minority communities, have not been successful.”

Interview respondent- large department in the Southwest

“We are not representative. We have 12 Blacks and 15 women out of 280 sworn. Our recruitment efforts – going to neighborhoods, churches, and cultural events, putting ads in newspapers, radio, and TV – have not been successful. ”

Interview respondent- medium department in the Northeast



IAFF Diversity Initiative Achieving and Retaining a Diverse Fire Service Workforce



Obstacle 5. Not communicating a clear message of the value of diversity within the organization, not fostering an inclusive environment within the organization, and not developing or enforcing policies regarding harassment.

Our literature review says that informal methods of recruitment are the most frequently used and effective methods of recruitment for all jobs. That includes word of mouth and referrals, which are used extensively in the Fire Service. However, this method of recruitment promotes homogeneity in the workforce (Jackson et al., 1991). Where internal values and policies do not support diversity, informal recruiting such as word of mouth can even work in the reverse.

“Our representation has gotten better for Hispanics and Blacks, but worse for women. The department does not make any conscious effort to recruit – it is mostly word of mouth. Women are warning other women not to apply.”

Interview respondent - large department in the West



IAFF Diversity Initiative Achieving and Retaining a Diverse Fire Service Workforce

7. Data Collection Process and Sample Selection

Selecting our sample

The departments in our sample were selected from both the United States and Canada to be representative of the membership departments of the International Association of Fire Fighters (IAFF). The one absolute criterion for inclusion in the study was that the department had to have some paid firefighting personnel. Because of this, paid and combination departments were included in the study, while strictly volunteer departments were not. So that the results would generalize to a wide variety of fire departments, we made a conscious effort to include departments of various sizes, types, and locations. We also tried to include at least one department from each of the 16 IAFF Districts.

Department selection occurred through the following steps:

- Putting out a request for departments to self-identify as a best practice in recruitment. This request was put out separately by both the IAFF and the International Association of Fire Chiefs (IAFC).
- Reviewing demographic data on IAFF Locals collected through an IAFF Internal Organizing Survey to determine departments with good minority and female representation.
- Conducting a search of department web sites to gather information on their recruitment practices.

From this process, we identified 81 departments to complete a short screening survey and interview. A list of these departments is included in the Appendix.

Administering the Short Screening Survey and Interview

The screening survey was a telephone interview that solicited opinions on department diversity and recruitment. Specifically, we asked whether diversity in the department represented the diversity in the community served; what the department's recruitment efforts consisted of; and whether those recruitment efforts were successful in attracting women and minorities. (For a complete list of questions, see the Appendix) For the majority of the 81 departments surveyed, the person interviewed was the President of the IAFF Local Union. In certain cases, union representatives referred us to department members involved in the recruitment process.

The purpose of the screening survey was to identify potentially successful departments to complete a comprehensive survey on recruitment, selection, and retention practices. The comprehensive survey was lengthy and time-consuming. We did not want to unnecessarily



IAFF Diversity Initiative Achieving and Retaining a Diverse Fire Service Workforce

burden departments by asking them to complete the survey if they did not have a successful recruitment program. Based on the responses we received to the screening survey, we were able to narrow down our sample for the comprehensive survey. For a department to move on to the comprehensive survey, they had to express both of the following characteristics of their department:

1. Were making an active recruitment effort; and
2. Had some success in their representation of women and/or minorities in the department.



IAFF Diversity Initiative Achieving and Retaining a Diverse Fire Service Workforce

Comprehensive Survey Sample and Responses

Based on responses to the screening survey, we invited 44 departments to complete the comprehensive survey. Of the 44 invited departments, 29 departments fully completed the survey, 4 departments partially completed the survey, and 11 departments either declined to participate or did not complete the survey. Most of the results presented in this report are based on survey responses from the departments who fully completed the survey. In some cases, as indicated, results include departments who provided partial responses.

Attached to this report is Appendix 3 - Summary of Survey Responses to the long survey.

This report can be used to see the following types of information about the surveyed departments.

1. Department description
2. Demographics
3. Description/Size
4. Incentive Pay
5. Consent Decree
6. Education / Experience requirements
7. Written Test
8. PAT
9. Other selection processes
10. Preference points
11. Testing schedule
12. Average number hired
13. Drop out rates
14. Recruitment methods
15. Recruitment messages
16. Preparation assistance
17. Recruiters
18. Diversity message/training
19. Accommodation of women
20. Recognized employee groups
21. Other requirements
22. Background check
23. Why candidates drop out
24. Time for recruiting before test
25. Candidate contact
26. Community groups & events
27. Most successful efforts
28. Advice
29. Mentors
30. Accommodating women



IAFF Diversity Initiative Achieving and Retaining a Diverse Fire Service Workforce



If you would like to see the initial screening interview, see Appendix 1. If you would like to review a list of the Survey Questions, please see Appendix 2.