



CITY OF SOUTH BEND AND ST. JOSEPH COUNTY

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION



MINUTES

HYBRID MEETING

December 18, 2023
6:00pm

Council Chambers, 4th Floor
County-City Building, South Bend, IN

MEMBERS PRESENT:

Sarah Andrews - President
David Wyncott - Vice President
Andrew Jones - Treasurer
Joan Downs-Krostenko –
Arch. Historian and Secretary
Elizabeth Hertel
Don Dietz
Peter DeKever
Michael Skaggs

MEMBERS ABSENT:

ALSO PRESENT:

Ross Van Overberghe
Kate Bolze
Kathryn Hough

- I. CALL TO ORDER – 6:00 pm
- II. ROLL CALL
- III. PUBLIC HEARING

- a. AMEND AGENDA

(Audio Position: 01:31)

Upon a motion by Michael Skaggs, being seconded by Andrew Jones and unanimously carried by vote, the Agenda is amended such that Certificate of Appropriateness Item number i, 2023-1106A – 907 Riverside Drive “Leeper Park” - Navarre Cabin, will be heard after Certificate of Appropriateness Item number iii, 2023-1206 – 635 South Michigan Avenue.

- b. CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

- ii. 2023-1205A 1401 East Wayne Street

East Wayne Street LHD, Ordinance #7796-87

(Audio Position: 01:58)

The staff report was presented by: Ross Van Overberghe

Staff Recommendation:

Staff Recommends dividing the project into multiple components:

COA 2023-1205A-1 *Gabled Roof Entrance Porch* – Staff makes a favorable recommendation.

COA 2023-1205A-2 *Paint/stain Brick* – Staff makes an unfavorable recommendation.

SARAH ANDREWS
PRESIDENT

A CERTIFIED LOCAL GOVERNMENT
OF THE NATIONAL PARK SERVICE

TIM CORCORAN
INTERIM HISTORIC PRESERVATION ADMINISTRATOR

EXCELLENCE | ACCOUNTABILITY | INNOVATION | INCLUSION | EMPOWERMENT

1400S County-City Building | 227 W. Jefferson Blvd. | South Bend, Indiana 46601 | p 574.235.9371 | f 574.235.9201 | southbendin.gov

COA 2023-1205A-3 *Garage Door Replacement* – Staff makes no recommendation due to lack of information.

COA 2023-1205A-4 *Sliding Door Replacement with French Door* – Staff makes no recommendation due to lack of information.

The applicant was represented by:

Paul Barbour, Barbour Construction, 51225 Bittersweet Rd, Granger, IN, and Anita Thompson, 1401 E Wayne St, South Bend, IN served as the applicant.

After due consideration the following action was taken:

Upon a motion by Elizabeth Hertel, seconded by Don Dietz, and UNANIMOUSLY carried by vote, the Historic Preservation Commission approves splitting the Certificate of Appropriateness Application #2023-1205A into 4 parts, 1 thru 4.

Vote: 8-0. Eight in favor, none opposed.

COA#2023-1205A is split.

The public was represented by:

There was no one from the public to speak in regard to this project.

After due consideration the following action was taken:

Upon a motion by David Wyncott, seconded by Elizabeth Hertel, and UNANIMOUSLY carried by vote, the Historic Preservation Commission APPROVES Certificate of Appropriateness Application #2023-1205A-1.

Vote: 8-0. Eight in favor, none opposed.

COA#2023-1205A-1 is APPROVED.

Upon a motion by Elizabeth Hertel, seconded by Andrew Jones, and UNANIMOUSLY carried by vote, the Historic Preservation Commission DENIES Certificate of Appropriateness Application #2023-1205A-2. If the applicant comes back with a more appropriate product the fee for that COA will be waived.

Commissioners are required to state their reasons for denial. Roll was called.

Commissioner Downs-Krostenko (AYE): (audio went out during this point of the meeting as there were connectivity issues for a brief moment in the chambers. Once discovered, the meeting was paused until the connection came back completely)

Commissioner Skaggs (AYE): (audio is hard to understand for Commissioner Skaggs as his microphone was periodically disconnecting) ...standards and guidelines...a decision about the stain...

Commissioner Dietz (AYE): it does not follow standards and guidelines for protecting the brick.

Commissioner Wyncott (AYE): Primarily because I don't know what product is going to be used.

Commissioner DeKeever (AYE): Stand and guideline concerns regarding the effect of the product on the brick.

Commissioner Jones (AYE): For the reasons stated by my fellow Commissioners. Not knowing the product that's going to be used would be difficult or impossible to determine whether

this application would comport with the standards and guidelines.

Commissioner Hertel (AYE): It goes against the standards and guidelines and the product that has been mentioned is not appropriate for brick.

Commissioner Andrews (AYE): For all the reasons that my fellow Commissioners already laid out.

Vote: 8-0. Eight in favor, none opposed.

COA#2023-1205A-2 is DENIED.

Upon a motion by David Wyncott, seconded by Elizabeth Hertel, and UNANIMOUSLY carried by vote, the Historic Preservation Commission votes to remand the approval of the Garage Door Replacement to Staff for Certificate of Appropriateness Application #2023-1205A-3.

Vote: 8-0. Eight in favor, none opposed.

COA#2023-1205A-3 is remanded to staff.

Upon a motion by Elizabeth Hertel, seconded by David Wyncott, and carried by vote, remand the approval of the Sliding Door Replacement with French Door to Staff for Certificate of Appropriateness Application #2023-1205A-4.

Vote: 7-1. Seven in favor, one opposed.

COA#2023-1205A-4 is remanded to staff.

- iii. 2023-1206 635 South Main Street
South Bend Local Landmark, Ordinance #8267-92 *(Audio Position: 23:44)*

The staff report was presented by: Ross Van Overberghe

Staff Recommendation:

Staff makes a favorable recommendation.

The applicant was represented by:

Greg Kil, Kil Architecture and Planning, 1126 Lincolnway E, South Bend, IN, appeared in person and served as the applicant.

The public was represented by:

Todd Zieger, Indiana Landmarks, 801 W Washington St, South Bend, IN appeared in person and spoke in favor of the application.

Caleb Bauer, Executive Director, Department of Community Investment, City of South Bend, 227 W Jefferson Blvd, Ste 1400S, South Bend, IN appeared in person and spoke in favor of the application.

Don Lindner, 131 Chapin St, South Bend, IN appeared in person and spoke in favor of the application.

After due consideration the following action was taken:

Upon a motion by David Wyncott, seconded by Joan Downs-Krostenko, and UNANIMOUSLY carried by vote, the Historic Preservation Commission APPROVES Certificate of Appropriateness Application #2023-1206.

Vote: 8-0. Eight in favor, none opposed.

COA#2023-1206 is APPROVED.

- i. 2023-1106A 907 Riverside Drive "Leeper Park" - "Navarre Cabin"
South Bend Local Landmark, Ordinance #8734-96 *(Audio Position: 35:17)*

The staff report was presented by: Ross Van Overberghe

Staff Recommendation:

The Historic Preservation Commission adopted revised *Standards and Guidelines* for the Local Historic Districts on June 20, 2023, and for Local Landmarks on August 21, 2023, after a multi-year review and engagement process. The revised *Standards and Guidelines* include allowances for “*Moving a Structure*” in the ‘Residential’ Standards, and “*Moving a Building*” in the ‘Commercial’ Standards. Both state that, “*On rare occasions when a building is not beyond repair and no alternative exists to incorporate it into a new development, then relocation should be considered.*” Both sections further state that, “*if no suitable locations exist within the district, then a site should be selected in another historic area that is of similar era and allows the positioning of the relocated building on the new site in a way that is similar to its original location.*”

Throughout the entirety of the *Standards and Guidelines*, maintenance of historic structures is encouraged as necessary for long-term preservation of designated properties. “Demolition by neglect” is discussed under the *Demolition and Deconstruction* sections of both the ‘Residential’ (page 38) and ‘Commercial’ (page 68) sections and is described as “*the absence of ordinary and routine maintenance jeopardizing the structural integrity of the building.*” The *General Information* (page 120) section of the *Standards and Guidelines* states that a “*Certificate of Appropriateness is required before moving any building or structure. The moving of a building within, out of or into the district is discouraged; however, moving is preferred to demolition.*”

No projects involving moving designated structures have been reviewed since the adoption of the revised *Standards and Guidelines*. The Commission has approved moving “threatened” designated structures when no alternative existed to preserve a structure in its current location under the previous eleven different *Standards and Guidelines*. The most recent example of this kind of project is the “May House” (formerly 130 Park Lane, moved to the corner of Riverside and Park Avenue), reviewed by the Commission in 2021, taking into consideration both the former “Group B” Standards for Local Landmarks and Riverside Drive Local Historic District Standards and Guidelines.

The Commission included *Addenda* related to the nine Local Historic Districts and Leeper Park at the end of the revised *Standards and Guidelines*. The Leeper Park *Addenda* is the *Standards and Criteria for Leeper Park*, the document used to review projects within Leeper Park since its adoption as a Local Landmark. When the Commission reviewed the previous request to move the Navarre Cabin in 2020, HPC Staff recommended the proposed project **unfavorably** based upon this document, specifically items 9.2.12 (“*Moving or demolishing historic structures that would alter spatial and visual relationships in the landscape shall not be allowed.*”) and 9.7.1.1 (“*All items listed herein shall be preserved: [...] The Log Cabin known as the Navarre*

House, and the footings of the cabin/house which was burned down.”).

When making a determination whether to approve or deny a Certificate of Appropriateness, *the Historic Preservation Commission shall consider the following:*

- i) Appropriateness of the proposed construction, reconstruction, alteration, demolition, or moving to the preservation of the historic landmark, specifically, and/or the Historic Preservation District, generally;*
- ii) The detriment to the public welfare if the proposed construction, reconstruction, alteration, demolition, or moving is permitted even though it is not deemed appropriate; and*
- iii) The potential hardship that the denial of a certificate of appropriateness would cause the applicant.*

City of South Bend Zoning Ordinance, Section 21-12.04(b)(6)(H)

*The History Museum’s application indicates (in Appendix A: The Navarre Cabin as a Local Landmark) that “the Museum commits to submission of an application for [Local Landmark] status within 30 days of COA approval.” This voluntary submission of interest in re-Landmarking the Cabin in the new location indicates *The History Museum’s* renewed interest in preserving this structure. Were the Commission to consider approving the move of the Navarre Cabin, Staff would further recommend the Commission ask *The History Museum* to amend this condition of the current application to read “within 30 days of the successful completion of the move of the Navarre Cabin to the described location.” An appropriate legal description for this ‘new’ proposed landmark would be needed at that time of that submission.*

The History Museum’s request is to move the Navarre Cabin to the West Washington museum campus in an interpretive site to increase use/activation and educational opportunities. The applicable Standards and Guidelines – both the revised Standards and Guidelines adopted in 2023, and the existing Standards and Criteria for Leeper Park – are in place to guide the Commission when reviewing projects to ensure continued preservation of designated structures.

Prior to this application *The History Museum* conducted multiple community engagement meetings to gauge public interest and support for their future vision for the Cabin. These meetings helped to ensure a broader public awareness of the move that would not have otherwise occurred in a typical application process.

This broader engagement helped to identify and formulate additional commitments that *The History Museum* has agreed to in writing to the Commissioners. These commitments include:

- Affixing a new temporary tarp to protect the cabin roof until proper repairs can be made after the move is complete. This work has been completed.
- Initiation of the local landmark process of the Cabin after completion of the move.

- Submitting an application for a COA to the HPC to repair the Cabin's roof.
- All necessary repairs to the Cabin's roof will be complete prior to January 1, 2025.

Based on the merits of the project and the additional written commitments, **staff makes a favorable recommendation.**

The applicant was represented by:

James Tuesley, Barnes & Thornburg, 201 S Main St, Ste 400, South Bend, IN appeared in person and served as the applicant.

Brian Harding, Executive Director, the History Museum, 808 W Washington St, South Bend, IN appeared in person and served as applicant.

Kristie Erickson, Deputy Executive Director, the History Museum, 808 W Washington St, South Bend, IN appeared in person and served as applicant.

The public was represented by:

Tim Corcoran, Director of Planning & Community Resources, Department of Community Investment, City of South Bend, 227 W Jefferson Blvd, Ste 1400S, South Bend, IN appeared in person and spoke in favor of the application.

Staff received two letters/emails in opposition of the application.

Staff received fourteen letters/emails in favor of the application including letters/emails from:

- South Bend Common Council President Sharon McBride
- South Bend Common Council Member Karen White
- South Bend Common Council Member Rachel Tomas Morgan
- City of South Bend Mayor James Mueller
- Studebaker National Museum
- Superintendent Dr. Jerry Thacker of Penn Harris Madison School Corporation
- Superintendent Todd Cummings of South Bend Community School Corporation
- Residents of the West Washington and Chapin Park Neighborhoods
- Lehman & Lehman, landscape architects involved in the project.

The St. Joseph County Commissioners passed Resolution R-26-C-2023 in support of moving the Navarre Cabin from Leeper Park to the History Museum campus with a vote of 3-0 on December 12, 2023.

The St. Joseph County Council passed a Resolution 161-23 in support of moving the Navarre Cabin from Leeper Park to the History Museum campus with a vote of 9-0 on December 12, 2023.

A petition in support of the application, that was at the Community Forums, received fifty-nine signatures.

The Park Board of Commissioners for Venue Parks and Arts signed a copy of the COA application to show their support of the application.

Michael Schmidt, Assistant City Attorney, City of South Bend, 227 W Jefferson Blvd, Ste 1200S, South Bend, IN as Lead Council for Venue Parks and Arts Board and on behalf of Jordan Gathers, Interim

Director of Venues, Parks, and Arts appeared in person and read a letter into record from Jordan Gathers in favor of the application.

John Abernathy, 17301 Middlefield Ct, Granger, IN appeared in person and spoke in favor of the application.

Bruce Cates, 251 N Gladstone Ave, South Bend, IN appeared in person and spoke in favor of the application.

Tim Lykowski, Lykowski Construction, 23158 W Ireland Rd, South Bend, IN (company contacted to move the cabin) appeared in person and spoke in favor of the application.

Don Lindner, individual who collected the 59 signatures for the petition in support, 131 Chapin St, South Bend, IN appeared in person and spoke in favor of the application.

Anne Mannix, President of the Near West Side Neighborhood Association, 724 W Washington St, South Bend, IN appeared in person and spoke in favor of the application.

Alyssa Gavin, 4th grade teacher with South Bend Community School Corporation, 251 S Dr Martin Luther King Jr Blvd, South Bend, IN appeared in person and spoke in favor of the application.

Jim Bognar, 807 W Washington St, South Bend, IN appeared in person and spoke regarding the application, but neither in favor or opposition, but in thanks and support of the Historic Preservation Commission.

Jonathan Cook, 63460 Orange Rd, South Bend, IN appeared in person and spoke in favor of the application.

Randy Fig, member of the St. Joseph County Council, representing District F, 227 W Jefferson Blvd, Fourth Floor, South Bend, IN appeared in person and spoke in favor of the application.

An informal poll of the audience was taken at the suggestion of Joan Downs-Krostenko. The audience was asked to show their support or opposition for the application by a show of hands. All members of the audience raised their hands in favor of the application. None raised their hands in opposition.

After due consideration the following action was taken:

Upon a motion by David Wyncott, seconded by Andrew Jones, and carried by vote, the Historic Preservation Commission APPROVES Certificate of Appropriateness Application #2023-1106A.

Vote: 6-2. Six in favor, two opposed.

COA#2023-1106A is APPROVED.

- c. RECESS – a short meeting recess occurred from 8:00pm to 8:06pm. *(Audio Position: 2:01:04)*
- d. LOCAL LANDMARK NOMINATION
 - i. 3016 Portage Avenue, “Portage Manor” *(Audio Position: 2:07:01)*

A member of the public, Jim Bognar, 807 W Washington St, South Bend, IN appeared in person to speak and ask questions of the Commission regarding the process of temporary protection or landmarking Portage Manor.

IV. PRIVILEGE OF THE FLOOR

V. REGULAR BUSINESS

a. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

- i. November 9, 2023 – SPECIAL MEETING minutes (Audio Position: 2:09:49)

Upon a motion by Andrew Jones, seconded by Elizabeth Hertel, and UNANIMOUSLY carried by vote, the minutes from the November 9, 2023 – Historic Preservation Commission SPECIAL MEETING are approved.

- ii. November 20, 2023 minutes (Audio Position: 2:10:04)

Upon a motion by Andrew Jones, seconded by Elizabeth Hertel, and UNANIMOUSLY carried by vote, the minutes from the November 20, 2023 Historic Preservation Commission are approved.

b. STAFF REPORTS

- i. Administrative Approvals

After due consideration, no action was taken.

c. COMMITTEE REPORTS

- i. No committees have met since the previous meeting.

VI. OLD BUSINESS

VII. NEW BUSINESS

a. 2024 SLATE OF OFFICERS

(Audio Position: 2:12:51)

- i. Elizabeth Hertel nominated Sarah Andrews to continue serving as President. Don Dietz seconded. Sarah Andrews accepted the nomination.
- ii. David Wyncott states that he would continue serving as Vice President. The nomination was seconded by several members of the board at once.
- iii. Andrew Jones states that he would continue serving as Treasurer. Sarah Andrews seconds the nomination.
- iv. Joan Downs-Krostenko states that she would continue serving as Secretary. David Wyncott seconds the nomination.

VIII. ANNOUNCEMENTS AND MISCELLANEOUS MATTERS

a. 2024 MEETING DATES

IX. ADJOURNMENT

Upon a motion by Don Dietz, seconded by Elizabeth Hertel and UNANIMOUSLY carried, the meeting was adjourned at 8:18 p.m.


Joan Downs-Krostenko
Arch. Historian/ Secretary

2/16/24
Date