



CITY OF SOUTH BEND

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION



MINUTES

HYBRID MEETING

August 21, 2023
6:00pm

Council Chambers, 4th Floor
County-City Building, South Bend, IN

MEMBERS PRESENT:

Sarah Andrews - President
David Wyncott - Vice President
Andrew Jones - Treasurer
Joan Downs-Krostenko –
Arch. Historian and Secretary
Elizabeth Hertel
Don Dietz
Peter DeKever
Michael Skaggs

MEMBERS ABSENT:

ALSO PRESENT:

Adam Toering
Ross Van Overberghe
Kate Bolze
Kathryn Hough

I. CALL TO ORDER – 6:00 pm

II. ROLL CALL

III. PUBLIC HEARING

a. CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

i. 2023-0717 1321 E Wayne St S
East Wayne Street LHD, Ordinance #7796-87 (Audio Position: 00:20)

The staff report was presented by: Adam Toering

Staff Recommendation: The *Standards and Guidelines* generally discourage the installation of vinyl materials. The window to be replaced is on a later addition built in 1987 at the rear of the structure and is not visible from the street.

The *Standards and Guidelines* state that “materials used on an addition to an existing structure shall relate to the existing or original materials of that structure” and that “metal or vinyl siding may be used when it is the only feasible alternative. The siding should be a compatible with the original size and style and with the materials of other buildings in the district.” The proposed vinyl shake siding will replace the existing aluminum lap siding. The entirety of the 1987 addition will be clad in this vinyl shake siding. The front façade dormers will still be clad in lap siding.

The *Standards and Guidelines* allow for repair/replacement of soffits and fascias with like material.

Staff makes a favorable recommendation.

SARAH ANDREWS
PRESIDENT

A CERTIFIED LOCAL GOVERNMENT
OF THE NATIONAL PARK SERVICE

ADAM TOERING
HISTORIC PRESERVATION ADMINISTRATOR

EXCELLENCE | ACCOUNTABILITY | INNOVATION | INCLUSION | EMPOWERMENT

1400S County-City Building 227 W. Jefferson Blvd. South Bend, Indiana 46601 p 574.235.9371 f 574.235.9201 southbendin.gov

CITY OF SOUTH BEND | HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

The applicant was represented by: Thomas Keller, 1321 E Wayne St S, South Bend, IN served as the applicant followed by Jack Reed, Millwood Constructions, 1176 W 800 N, Milford, IN, who spoke on behalf of the applicant regarding specific details of the project.

The public was represented by: there was no one from the public to speak.

After due consideration the following action was taken:

Upon a motion by Michael Skaggs, seconded by David Wyncott, and UNANIMOUSLY carried by vote, the Historic Preservation Commission APPROVES Certificate of Appropriateness Application #2023-0717.

Vote: 7-0. Seven in favor, none opposed.

COA#2023-0717 is APPROVED.

- ii. 2023-0724A 715 Leland Avenue
Chapin Park LHD, Ordinance #9575-05 (Audio Position: 08:43)

The staff report was presented by: Adam Toering

*Joan Downs-Krostenko arrived late to the meeting.
She arrived at roughly audio position 08:52*

Staff Recommendation: Staff makes a favorable recommendation.

The applicant was represented by: Kathy Schuth, Executive Director at Near Northwest Neighborhood, 1007 Portage Ave, South Bend, IN, served as the applicant.

The public was represented by: there was no one from the public to speak.

After due consideration the following action was taken:

Upon a motion by Elizabeth Hertel, seconded by David Wyncott, and UNANIMOUSLY carried by vote, the Historic Preservation Commission APPROVES Certificate of Appropriateness Application #2023-0724A.

Vote: 8-0. Eight in favor, none opposed.

COA#2023-0724A is APPROVED.

- iii. 2023-0803 1205 E Wayne St N
East Wayne Street LHD, Ordinance #7796-87 (Audio Position: 14:40)

The staff report was presented by: Adam Toering

Staff Recommendation: Staff recommends dividing the project into multiple components:

COA 2023-0803-1 *Roof replacement & gutter installation* – Staff makes a favorable recommendation.

COA 2023-0803-2 *Chimney reconstruction* – Staff makes a favorable recommendation.

COA 2023-0803-3 *Window replacement* – Staff makes no recommendation.

COA 2023-0803-4 *Front entry reconfiguration* – Staff makes a favorable recommendation.

Upon a motion by Elizabeth Hertel, seconded by Andrew Jones, and UNANIMOUSLY carried by vote, the Historic Preservation Commission APPROVES splitting the Certificate of Appropriateness Application #2023-0803 into four parts, COA 2023-0803-1,2,3, and 4.

The applicant was represented by: Kelly Porter, 1205 E Wayne St N, South Bend, IN, served as the applicant followed by Greg Kil, Kil Architecture, 1126 Lincolnway E, South Bend, IN, who spoke on behalf of the applicant regarding specific details of the project.

The public was represented by: Laurie Martin, 1201 E Wayne St N, South Bend, IN spoke in favor of the application.

After due consideration the following actions were taken:

Upon a motion by Andrew Jones, seconded by David Wyncott, and UNANIMOUSLY carried by vote, the Historic Preservation Commission amends the Certificate of Appropriates Application #2023-0803-1 to in-kind gutter replacement/installation versus copper gutter installation and APPROVES Certificate of Appropriateness Application #2023-0803-1.

Vote: 8-0. Eight in favor, none opposed.

COA#2023-0803-1 is amended and APPROVED.

Upon a motion by David Wyncott, seconded by Elizabeth Hertel, and UNANIMOUSLY carried by vote, the Historic Preservation Commission APPROVES Certificate of Appropriateness Application #2023-0803-2.

Vote: 8-0. Eight in favor, none opposed.

COA#2023-0803-2 is APPROVED.

Upon a motion by David Wyncott, seconded by Don Dietz, and UNANIMOUSLY carried by vote, the Historic Preservation Commission APPROVES Certificate of Appropriateness Application #2023-0803-3.

Vote: 8-0. Eight in favor, none opposed.

COA#2023-0803-3 is APPROVED.

Upon a motion by David Wyncott, seconded by Andrew Jones, and UNANIMOUSLY carried by vote, the Historic Preservation Commission APPROVES Certificate of Appropriateness Application #2023-0803-4.

Vote: 8-0. Eight in favor, none opposed.

COA#2023-0803-4 is APPROVED.

Elizabeth Hertel stepped out at Audio Position 45:13

b. NATIONAL REGISTER OF HISTORIC PLACES NOMINATION

i. Edgewater Place Proposed National Register District *(Audio Position: 46:04)*

The staff report, which is publicly available on the City of South Bend's online document portal with supporting documentation, was presented and read into record by Historic Preservation Administrator Adam Toering.

Elizabeth Hertel returned at Audio Position 47:43

Staff Recommendation: It is recommended that the Historic Preservation Commission concur with staff that the property meets the criteria for inclusion in the National Register of Historic Places under Criteria A and C. Staff requests that the Commission direct staff to submit the appropriate report of the public hearing, including public comments, to Mayor James Mueller for his concurrence, in compliance with Indiana's Certified Local Government regulations.

The Certified Local Government Report on the Nomination of the Edgewater Place Historic District to the National Register of Historic

CITY OF SOUTH BEND | HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

Places will then be forwarded to the Indiana Division of Historic Preservation and Archaeology for further review, followed by consideration of the nomination by the Indiana Historic Preservation Review Board.

The following represented the applicant:

Kurt Garner, 12954 6th Rd, Plymouth, IN:

"I told Adam that I'd be here for questions. It was an exciting, both projects were very exciting to kind of bring to life, so I just appreciate the opportunity to work on, but yeah, there's questions, certainly."

Commissioner Andrews: Any questions? ... for the record
Kurt

Kurt: Sure, Kurt Garner, 19854 6th Rd, Plymouth, IN 46563

Commissioner Andrews: Thank you. Any questions for Kurt on Edgewater? Great. Do you want us to vote on this now or do you want to read them both and then we do both.

Commissioner Dietz: I have a question. How many structures approximately are in that district?

Kurt: I think that was about 120, does that sound right?

Adam Toering: Correct. Uh, so the map has the total numbers, and I'm zooming in on it as best I can.

Ross Van Overberghe: 110 buildings that are contributing and 18 noncontributing, 1 site, 15 objects that are contributing for a total of 126 contributing structures/objects/sites and 18 noncontributing.

Kurt: If I may, we weren't required to include garages up until about a year and a half ago, and so oftentimes now if the noncontributing versus contributing number looks further off that what you would have wanted to see, it's likely because the garages are more modern construction.

Adam Toering: From a staff perspective, this is a very defined and delineated boundary. It's roughly bounded by the River, Lincolnway, the cloverleaf and Monroe at the north, so.

Commissioner Wyncott: You'd like a separate...

Commissioner Andrews: You want us to...

Adam Toering: Yes, please

Commissioner Andrews: Right, move to public?

Adam Toering: I think the opportunity, I know that there's a couple people from the neighborhood that may want to speak.

The following from the public spoke in favor of the nomination:

Sam Lima, 528 River Ave, South Bend, IN:

"I'm just really excited about the potential benefits of being listed as a National Register district. I know sometimes the repairs, and meeting the guidelines for some of my neighbors can sometimes be a financial challenge, and so any help with that would be a massive benefit."

CITY OF SOUTH BEND | HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

The following from the public spoke in opposition of the nomination: There was no one from the public to speak in opposition of the nomination.

Commission Discussion:

Adam Toering: I will note, there is a letter from the Director of planning in support of this nomination. It is added to the file as of I believe earlier today, but it is also available if you want to see it or it could be read in the record, it's up to you.

Commissioner Andrews: Can it be ready into record?

Adam Toering: Sure.

Commissioner Andrews: Thank you

Adam Toering:

Dear Commissioners,

The Planning and Community Resources Team engages the public and convenes groups with diverse options to develop and implement strategies for neighborhoods, commercial areas, and underutilized land in the city. The team creates short- and long-term plans and policies that promote distinct character and a sense of place for the community. The team also conducts research and analysis of local, regional and national planning issues and advises other City departments and partner agencies on land use and zoning topics. Of these projects, the creation of neighborhood plans augments and focuses the City's Comprehensive Plan, which directly informs and directs growth and development.

Planning and Community Resource staff members received a formal request for a neighborhood plan for the Monroe Edgewater area on the City of South Bend's near southeast side. Stakeholder meetings with invited groups and specific concerned parties were held in September and October of 2022. Workshops for the general public were held in November of the same year. This engagement resulted in the creation of the Monroe Edgewater neighborhood plan, which will hopefully be adopted by the City of South Bend Common Council this fall.

Adam informs the board: It actually was reviewed by the area or the City of South Bend Plan Commission prior to this meeting earlier today and was sent forward with a favorable recommendation.

The Monroe Edgewater plan identified listing the Taylor's Field Historic District and Edgewater Place Historic District on the National Register of Historic Places as a priority for the neighborhood. The City of South Bend Planning and Community Resources Team holds historic preservation as critical to ensuring the continued vibrancy of our neighborhoods, and the success of this nomination will fulfill one of the long-term objectives of the Monroe Edgewater neighborhood plan. The successful listing of these neighborhoods on the National Register of Historic Places will unlock financial opportunities for property owners to preserve their historic homes.

Please accept this letter as evidence of the strong support for this nomination from the City of South Bend Planning and Community Resource Team.

Sincerely, Tim Corcoran

After due consideration the following action was taken:

Upon a motion by David Wyncott, seconded by Elizabeth Hertel, and UNANIMOUSLY carried by vote, the Historic Preservation Commission submits their approval for the nomination of Edgewater Place Historic District to the National Register of Historic Places under criterion A and C and that all of the appropriate paperwork be submitted to the Mayor for his concurrence, and that is then sent onto state's representatives.

Vote: 8-0. Eight in favor, none opposed.

Nomination of Edgewater Place Historic District for addition to the National Register of Historic Places is APPROVED.

ii. Taylor's Field Proposed National Register District *(Audio Position: 57:34)*

The staff report, which is publicly available on the City of South Bend's online document portal with supporting documentation, was presented and read into record by Historic Preservation Administrator Adam Toering.

Staff Recommendation: It is recommended that the Historic Preservation Commission concur with staff that the property meets the criteria for inclusion in the National Register of Historic Places under Criteria C. Staff requests that the Commission direct staff to submit the appropriate report of the public hearing, including public comments, to Mayor James Mueller for his concurrence, in compliance with Indiana's Certified Local Government regulations.

The Certified Local Government Report on the Nomination of the Taylor's Field Historic District to the National Register of Historic Places will then be forwarded to the Indiana Division of Historic Preservation and Archaeology for further review, followed by consideration of the nomination by the Indiana Historic Preservation Review Board.

The following represented the applicant:

Kurt Garner, 12954 6th Rd, Plymouth, IN:

"I might just say why it is not A and C on this one and in part of it is because of the immense amount of stretching that we had to do to justify it. So, the reason why A is a criteria or criterion A is on Edgewater Place is because it's a plat and it was identified as, like Adam said, a suburban kind of development. We didn't have that in Taylor's Field other than the original kind of Taylor's field plat versus you know three other pieces that we were actually trying to pull together into this district. So, I felt like it was actually safer to send it down just under C because it has phenomenal architecture. And I'd nerd out and explain all of that in greater detail, but I think that you get the point."

The following from the public spoke in favor of the nomination:

Eddie Forero, 517 Carroll St, South Bend, IN:

"I'm here in a capacity as a homeowner, but also representing our Neighborhood Association. This is an important tool in our toolbox for

our neighborhood revitalization project. I helped with adapting our neighborhood, we had a revitalizing plan in place that we helped adapt with Tim Corcoran's team for the approval for our neighborhood and separate from Edgewater.

So, we've been doing everything we can to combat some of the issues that combat our community, which is crime, drugs, prostitution. There was a shooting in front of my house 2 weeks ago while I was doing yoga with my daughter, so that's the kind of thing we want to avoid. We feel that the best way to do that besides working with law enforcement is to promote homeownership. We want people to care about the homes, we want them to buy it and so this would be transformative for those of us that are already in, like in a local historic home and we'd like to have National Register status to help with current home ownership, but also to attract future homeowners.

This neighborhood is a gem for downtown South Bend. We feel it's going to be transformed. Let's guess, I don't know, 10, 20 years from now, it's gonna be slow, but our Neighborhood Association plans to use this, if it goes through, as a tool for education. We plan on going block by block to provide free services like mulching, landscaping and one of the things we want to do is educate them on the national, on historic process, in general. We want to show them this is how you can fix your home. We're going to partner with trade works, Charity still lives in our neighborhood. We want to make sure that we can teach people how to fix their own homes after they have a pathway to buy them. So we can flip the 35-65% renter to owner to about something a little bit more equitable, a little bit more even.

That's basically all I wanted to say. It is just one of the many ways that we want to improve our neighborhood and you guys can help us with that."

The following from the public spoke in opposition of the nomination: There was no one from the public to speak in opposition of the nomination.

Commission Discussion: There was no Commission discussion before motions were made.

After due consideration the following action was taken:

Upon a motion by David Wyncott, seconded by Michael Skaggs, and UNANIMOUSLY carried by vote, the Historic Preservation Commission submits their approval for the nomination of Taylor's Field Historic District to the National Register of Historic Places under criterion C and that all of the appropriate paperwork be submitted to the Mayor for his concurrence, and that is then sent onto state's representatives.

Vote: 8-0. Eight in favor, none opposed.

Nomination of Taylor's Field Historic District for addition to the National Register of Historic Places is APPROVED.

c. LOCAL LANDMARK NOMINATION

- i. 3016 Portage Avenue, "Portage Manor"

(Audio Position: 1:04:50)

Adam Toering provided updates to the Commission.

No action was taken at this time.

CITY OF SOUTH BEND | HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

IV. PRIVILEGE OF THE FLOOR

a. *The History Museum*

(Audio Position: 1:07:11)

Brian Harding, Director of the History Museum, 808 W Washington, South Bend, IN and Christy Erickson, Deputy Director of the History Museum provided updates and future plans regarding the Navarre Cabin to the Commission

No action was taken at this time.

V. REGULAR BUSINESS

a. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

i. July 17, 2023 minutes

(Audio Position: 1:14:16)

Upon a motion by Andrew Jones, seconded by David Wyncott, and UNANIMOUSLY carried by vote, the minutes from the July 17, 2023 Historic Preservation Commission are approved.

b. STAFF REPORTS

i. Administrative Approvals

After due consideration, no action was taken.

c. COMMITTEE REPORTS

i. No committees met since the previous meeting.

VI. OLD BUSINESS

VII. NEW BUSINESS

a. *Adoption of Standards & Guidelines for Local Landmarks*

(Audio Position: 1:15:38)

Upon a motion by Elizabeth Hertel, seconded by David Wyncott, and UNANIMOUSLY carried by vote, the Standards & Guidelines for Local Landmarks are approved and adopted.

VIII. ANNOUNCEMENTS AND MISCELLANEOUS MATTERS

a. Southhold Preservation Awards

(Audio Position: 1:16:41)

Commissioner Andrews and Adam Toering provided updates to the Commission.

No action was taken at this time.

IX. ADJOURNMENT

Upon a motion by Don Dietz, seconded by Elizabeth Hertel and UNANIMOUSLY carried by vote, the meeting was adjourned at 7:24 p.m.

Joan Downs-Krostenko 9/14/2023

Joan Downs-Krostenko Date
Arch. Historian/ Secretary