



CITY OF SOUTH BEND

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION



MINUTES

HYBRID MEETING

June 20, 2023
6:00pm

Board of Public Works Meeting Room, 13th Floor
County-City Building, South Bend, IN

MEMBERS PRESENT:

Sarah Andrews - President
David Wyncott - Vice President
Joan Downs-Krostenko –
Arch. Historian and Secretary
Don Dietz
Michael Skaggs

MEMBERS ABSENT:

Andrew Jones - Treasurer
Elizabeth Hertel
Peter DeKever

ALSO PRESENT:

Adam Toering
Kate Bolze
Kathryn Hough

- I. CALL TO ORDER – 6:00 pm
- II. ROLL CALL
- III. AMEND AGENDA

- a. Resolution No. 03-2023

(Audio Position: 00:45)

Upon a motion by Michael Skaggs, seconded by David Wyncott, and UNANIMOUSLY carried by vote, the agenda is amended so that current agenda item number VII – NEW BUSINESS will precede item III – PUBLIC HEARING.

- IV. NEW BUSINESS

- a. Resolution No. 03-2023 “A RESOLUTION OF THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION OF SOUTH BEND AND ST. JOSEPH COUNTY, INDIANA RECOGNIZING FORMER COMMISSIONER MICHELE GELFMAN FOR YEARS OF SERVICE”

(Audio Position: 01:01)

Upon a motion by David Wyncott, seconded by Don Dietz, and UNANIMOUSLY carried by vote, Resolution No. 03-2023 is accepted.

- V. PUBLIC HEARING

- a. CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

- i. 2023-0516A 655 River Avenue Edgewater Place LHD, Ordinance #6846-80

(Audio Position: 06:29)

The staff report was presented by: Adam Toering

Staff Recommendation: The homeowners have engaged in a comprehensive restoration and rehabilitation of the existing structure. The proposed changes are in keeping with the Standards and Guidelines for Edgewater Place Local Historic District. Staff recommends approval.

The applicant was represented by: Caleb Stinston and Dori Walterhouse, 655 River Ave, South Bend, IN, served as the applicant.

SARAH ANDREWS
PRESIDENT

A CERTIFIED LOCAL GOVERNMENT
OF THE NATIONAL PARK SERVICE

ADAM TOERING
HISTORIC PRESERVATION ADMINISTRATOR

EXCELLENCE | ACCOUNTABILITY | INNOVATION | INCLUSION | EMPOWERMENT

1400S County-City Building 227 W. Jefferson Blvd. South Bend, Indiana 46601 p 574.235.9371 f 574.235.9201 southbendin.gov

The public was represented by: there was no one from the public to speak.

After due consideration the following action was taken:

Upon a motion by David Wyncott, seconded by Michael Skaggs, and UNANIMOUSLY carried by vote, the Historic Preservation Commission APPROVES Certificate of Appropriateness Application #2023-0516A.

Vote: 5-0. Five in favor, none opposed.

COA#2023-0516A is APPROVED.

- ii. 2023-0524 2300 Portage Avenue Local Landmark, Ordinance #9150-2000
(Audio Position: 12:43)

The staff report was presented by: Adam Toering

Staff Recommendation: The request to change the roofing material from the previous red slate tile to asphalt shingle constitutes an alteration to the exterior appearance, configuration, and material of the structure. The red slate roofing material was a character defining feature of the structure. Staff recommends denial.

The applicant was represented by:

Trevor Smith, representing Everstory Partners, formally Stonemor Partners, 3331 Street Rd, Suite 200, Bensalem, PA 19020

Adam Wheeler, TipTop Roofing & Construction, 5606 Skylark Dr, Greenwood, IN 46143

Kathleen Matuszak, General Manager, Riverview Cemetery, 2300 Portage Ave, South Bend, IN 46616

The public was represented by: Michele Gelfman, 619 Riverside Pl, South Bend, IN 46601 spoke in opposition of the application.

After due consideration the following action was taken:

Upon a motion by Michael Skaggs, seconded by Don Dietz, and carried by vote, the Historic Preservation Commission DENIES Certificate of Appropriateness Application #2023-0524.

Commissioners are required to state their reasons for denial. Roll was called.

Commissioner Skaggs (AYE): It is way beyond the standards and guidelines for this local landmark.

Commissioner Dietz (AYE): It is not in keeping with the standards and guidelines.

Commissioner Wyncott (NAY):

Commissioner Downs-Krostenko (AYE): Because of the outstanding and signature nature, the topographical importance, the community value and I believe that the corporation needs to do a way better job of policing itself and of caring for, being a caretaker for its properties. So, oversight is really, really important, or they're going to continue to see themselves making this kind of mistake.

Commissioner Andrews (AYE): Because it's outside the standards and guidelines. While I am happy to hear that there will be additional things focused on the property, first we need to move forward with the roof getting back into compliance.

Vote: 4-1. Four in favor, one opposed.

COA#2023-0524 is DENIED.

- iii. 2023-0601 715 Riverside Drive River Bend LHD, Ordinance #8308-92
(Audio Position: 41:21)

The staff report was presented by: Adam Toering

Staff Recommendation: Staff recommends dividing the project into multiple components:

COA 2023-0601 B-1 – Rear Addition. Staff recommends approval.

COA 2023-0601 B-2 – Front Façade alterations. Staff recommends approval.

COA 2023-0601 B-3 – Window Replacement (General). Staff makes no recommendation.

COA 2023-0601 B-4 – Exterior Cladding. Staff makes no recommendation.

The applicant was represented by: Timothy and Donna Barkley, 4640 S Saint Joseph St, South Bend, IN 46614 served as the applicant.

The public was represented by: Eric Boyd, 1207 W Thomas St, South Bend, IN 46601 spoke in favor of the application.

After due consideration the following actions were taken:

Upon a motion by David Wyncott, seconded by Don Dietz, and carried by vote, the Historic Preservation Commission APPROVES Certificate of Appropriateness Application #2023-0601 B-1.

Vote: 4-0-1. Four in favor, none opposed, one abstained.

COA#2023-0601 B-1 is APPROVED.

Upon a motion by David Wyncott, seconded by Don Dietz, and carried by vote, the Historic Preservation Commission APPROVES Certificate of Appropriateness Application #2023-0601 B-2 with the stipulation that the configuration of the windows and a clear description and approval of a porch railing are remanded to staff.

Vote: 4-0-1. Four in favor, none opposed, one abstained.

COA#2023-0601 B-2 is APPROVED.

A motion by Joan Downs Krostenko to DENY Certificate of Appropriateness Application #2023-0601 B-3 died due to the lack of a second.

Upon a motion by Don Dietz, seconded by Michael Skaggs, and UNANIMOUSLY carried by vote, the Historic Preservation Commission CONTINUES Certificate of Appropriateness Application #2023-0601 B-3 to the next meeting, July 17, 2023.

Vote: 5-0. Five in favor, none opposed.

COA#2023-0601 B-3 is CONTINUED.

Upon a motion by David Wyncott, seconded by Don Dietz, and carried by vote, the Historic Preservation Commission amends the Certificate of Appropriateness Application to include that the installation of new aluminum siding is solely over the new garage edition and APPROVES the amended Certificate of Appropriateness Application # COA 2023-0601 B-4.

Vote: 4-1. Four in favor, one opposed.

COA# COA 2023-0601 B-4 is APPROVED.

- iv. 2023-0602 407 Lamonte Terrace Chapin Park LHD, Ordinance #9575-05
(Audio Position: 1:28:53)

The staff report was presented by: Adam Toering

Staff Recommendation: The vinyl siding being proposed best resembles the siding on the house. Because the original siding was a larger reveal when the garage

was built as was the style of siding at that time, the staff have determined the change in reveal is appropriate. Staff recommends approval.

The applicant was represented by: Patrick Guibert, 407 LaMonte Ter, South Bend, IN 46616, served as the applicant.

The public was represented by: there was no one from the public to speak

After due consideration the following action was taken:

Upon a motion by David Wyncott, seconded by Michael Skaggs, and carried by vote, the Historic Preservation Commission APPROVES Certificate of Appropriateness Application #2023-0602.

Vote: 4-0-1. Four in favor, none opposed, one abstained.

COA#2023-0602 is APPROVED.

- v. 2023-0602B; 1240 West Thomas St; Local Landmark, Ordinance #9037-1999
(Audio Position: 1:38:51)

The staff report was presented by: Adam Toering

Staff Recommendation: Staff recommends dividing the project into two components:

COA 2023-0602B-1 – Replace overhead garage doors with metal pedestrian doors with side lights and transoms. Staff makes no recommendation.

COA 2023-0602B-2 – Replace overhead doors with wood bi-fold doors. Staff recommends approval.

The applicant was represented by: Eric Boyd, 1207 W Thomas St, South Bend, IN 46601, served as the applicant.

The public was represented by: there was no one from the public to speak.

After due consideration the following action was taken:

Upon a motion by Joan Downs Krostenko, seconded by David Wyncott, and UNANIMOUSLY carried by vote, the Historic Preservation Commission APPROVES Certificate of Appropriateness Application #2023-0602B

Vote: 5-0. Five in favor, none opposed.

COA#2023-0602B is APPROVED.

b. LOCAL LANDMARK NOMINATION

- i. 3016 Portage Avenue, “Portage Manor” *(Audio Position: 1:45:13)*
 - 1. “Interim Protection” Presentation

VI. PRIVILEGE OF THE FLOOR

VII. REGULAR BUSINESS

a. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

- i. May 1, 2023 – Special Meeting minutes *(Audio Position: 2:15:24)*

Will be voted on at the next meeting, July 17, 202003
- ii. May 15, 2023 minutes *(Audio Position: 21:16:05)*

Upon a motion by Joan Downs Krostenko, seconded by David Wyncott, and UNANIMOUSLY carried by vote, the minutes from the May 15, 2023 Historic Preservation Commission are approved.

CITY OF SOUTH BEND | HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

b. STAFF REPORTS

i. Administrative Approvals

After due consideration, no action was taken.

c. COMMITTEE REPORTS

i. No committees met since the previous meeting.

VIII. OLD BUSINESS

a. Standards and Guidelines

i. Adoption of draft “Standards and Guidelines for Local Historic Districts”

(Audio Position: 2:18:56)

Upon a motion by David Wyncott, seconded by Don Dietz, and UNANIMOUSLY carried by vote, the “Standards and Guidelines for Local Historic Districts” are adopted.

IX. NEW BUSINESS

a. Resolution N. 03-2023 “A RESOLUTION OF THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION OF SOUTH BEND AND ST. JOSEPH COUNTY, INDIANA RECOGNIZING FORMER COMMISSIONER MICHELE GELFMAN FOR YEARS OF SERVICE”

Moved to the beginning of the meeting

X. ANNOUNCEMENTS AND MISCELLANEOUS MATTERS

a. Updates from the Commission President, Sarah Andrews

b. South Bend Trades School for High School Students – June 12-16, 2023.

c. “South Bend Lost and Saved: Appreciating and Preserving Our Historic Architecture”, Wednesday June 21st – 1pm, SCJPL Community Learning Center, Leighton Auditorium.

XI. ADJOURNMENT

Upon a motion by Don Dietz, seconded by David Wyncott and UNANIMOUSLY carried by vote, the meeting was adjourned at 8:29 p.m.

Joan Downs-Krostenko 7/13/23

Joan Downs-Krostenko

Arch. Historian/ Secretary

Date