



# CITY OF SOUTH BEND

## HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION



### MINUTES

March 20, 2023  
6:00pm

HYBRID MEETING

Council Chambers, 4<sup>th</sup> Floor  
County-City Building, South Bend, IN

**MEMBERS PRESENT:**

Sarah Andrews - President  
David Wyncott - Vice President  
Andrew Jones - Treasurer  
Elizabeth Hertel  
Don Dietz  
Peter DeKeever  
Michael Skaggs

**MEMBERS ABSENT:**

Joan Downs Krostenko -  
Arch. Historian/Secretary

**ALSO PRESENT:**

Adam Toering  
Ross Van Overberghe  
Kate Bolze  
Kathryn Hough

- I. CALL TO ORDER – 6:00 pm
- II. ROLL CALL
- III. PUBLIC HEARING
  - a. CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

- i. 2023-0302 815 Forest Avenue Chapin Park LHD, Ordinance #9574-05  
(Audio Position: 00:55)

The staff report was presented by: Adam Toering

Staff Recommendation: The Standards and Guidelines **require** that “original windows and doors shall be retained including sashes, lintels, sills,” [etc.]. The wood rot and existing failure could be repaired with a wood epoxy or the replacement of specific window components (the stile and rail on the sash, the sill, subsill, stool and jamb of the jamb itself). The Standards and Guidelines **require** that “**when deteriorated beyond repair**, they shall be replaced with units and trim resembling the original” (emphasis added). Staff recommends denial.

The applicant was represented by: Courtney Love, 815 Forest Ave, South Bend, IN 46616, served as the applicant.

The public was represented by: Tim Scott, 711 Forest Ave, South Bend, IN 46616 spoke in favor of the application.

After due consideration the following action was taken:

A motion by David Wyncott, seconded by Andrew Jones, to approve Certificate of Appropriateness Application #2023-0302 failed to carry due to a lack of majority vote.

Upon a motion by Elizabeth Hertel, seconded by Peter DeKeever, and carried by vote, the Historic Preservation Commission DENIES Certificate of Appropriateness Application #2023-0302.

SARAH ANDREWS  
PRESIDENT

A CERTIFIED LOCAL GOVERNMENT  
OF THE NATIONAL PARK SERVICE

ADAM TOERING  
HISTORIC PRESERVATION ADMINISTRATOR

EXCELLENCE | ACCOUNTABILITY | INNOVATION | INCLUSION | EMPOWERMENT

1400S County-City Building 227 W. Jefferson Blvd. South Bend, Indiana 46601 p 574.235.9371 f 574.235.9201 southbend.in.gov

Commissioners are required to state their reasons for denial. Roll was called.

**Commissioner Dietz (AYE):** Standard and guidelines. It does not meet those for the window's type style and construction.

**Commissioner Skaggs (AYE):** standards and guidelines. I'm convinced that they are not deteriorated beyond repair.

**Commissioner Wyncott (NAY)**

**Commissioner DeKever (AYE):** my reason is the standards and guidelines require that windows, umm, be retained unless they've deteriorated beyond repair and these are repairable.

**Commissioner Jones (NAY)**

**Commissioner Hertel (AYE):** Because the standards and guidelines require that the original windows and doors shall be retained and repaired as long as they have not been deteriorated beyond repair.

**Commissioner Andrews (NAY)**

Vote: 4-3. Four in favor, three opposed, none abstained.

COA#2023-0302 is DENIED.

Upon a motion by Elizabeth Hertel, seconded by Andrew Jones, and unanimously carried by vote, the Historic Preservation Commission waives future Certificate of Appropriateness Application fees for this project.

- ii. 2023-0309 66251 Cedar Road St. Joseph County Local Landmark, #01-80)  
(Audio Position: 26:40)

The staff report was presented by: Adam Toering

Staff Recommendation: The proposed changes constitute a comprehensive alteration to the exterior appearance, massing, configuration, and material of the structure. Original character defining features – specifically the window configuration and proportions, as well as the under-eave decorative spindle work – are proposed for removal or will be severely altered. The Standards and Guidelines state that “Structures already sided with incompatible materials should be returned to a siding similar to the original when renovation is considered.” Staff recommends denial.

The applicant was represented by: Adam Stump, 66251 Cedar Rd, Wakarusa, IN served as the applicant.

The public was represented by: Terry Stump, 211 S Washington St, Wakarusa, IN spoke in favor of the application.

After due consideration the following action was taken:

Upon a motion by Andrew Jones, seconded by Elizabeth Hertel, and UNANIMOUSLY carried by vote, the Historic Preservation Commission DENIES Certificate of Appropriateness Application #2023-0309

Commissioners are required to state their reasons for denial. Roll was called.

**Commissioner DeKever (AYE):** because it would involve significant alterations to the historical character and the structure of the building

as well as the loss of the spindle work. that would be a significant change as well.

**Commissioner Dietz (AYE):** based on the new, the images do not represent the existing structure.

**Commissioner Skaggs (AYE):** under group C I think it will disrupt the visible unity of the site, the proportions, the materials and the ratios of the proposed project are, are out of character with the structure as it is.

**Commissioner Wyncott (AYE):** I'm not necessarily willing to entertain this under the current guidelines, but I would be interested if it were, you know, I think it's, I I guess I would entertain it if it were being delisted concurrently.

**Commissioner Hertel (AYE):** as the proposed changes constitute a comprehensive alteration to the exterior appearance and configuration which go against the standards and guidelines.

**Commissioner Jones (AYE):** the plan or the certificate as proposed would deviate significantly from the standards and guidelines in a way that is materially unjustified.

**Commissioner Andrews (AYE):** because it goes against the standards and guidelines and takes away the character defining features and the proper materials for this home.

Vote: 7-0. Seven in favor, none opposed.

COA#2023-0309 is DENIED.

b. NATIONAL REGISTER OF HISTORIC PLACES NOMINATION

- i. St. Adalbert Church – TO BE HEARD at the April 17, 2023 HPC meeting

c. LOCAL LANDMARK NOMINATION

- i. 3016 Portage Avenue, "Portage Manor"

IV. PRIVILEGE OF THE FLOOR

- a. Dr Deb Fleming, County Commissioner, gave comments and opinions about Portage Manor
- b. Todd Zieger with Indiana Landmarks gave comments and opinions about Portage Manor  
*Elizabeth Hertel left the meeting from Audio Position 1:24:00 to 1:27:30*
- c. Christine Galvez, who did not provide her address, gave comments and opinions about Portage Manor.

V. REGULAR BUSINESS

a. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

- i. February 20, 2023 minutes – postponed to the April meeting as the Commission Secretary, Joan Downs Krostenko, was absent for today's meeting.

b. STAFF REPORTS

CITY OF SOUTH BEND | HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

i. Administrative Approvals

After due consideration, no action was taken.

c. COMMITTEE REPORTS

i. No committees met since the previous meeting.

VI. OLD BUSINESS

VII. NEW BUSINESS

a. Standards & Guidelines

VIII. ANNOUNCEMENTS AND MISCELLANEOUS MATTERS

a. "10 Most Endangered"

IX. ADJOURNMENT

Upon a motion by David Wyncott, seconded by Elizabeth Hertel and UNANIMOUSLY carried by vote, the meeting was adjourned at 7:36 p.m.

Joan Downs-Krostenko 4/17/2023  
Joan Downs-Krostenko Date  
Arch. Historian/ Secretary